This page is intentionally left blank
Hayward BART Transit-Oriented Development Proposal

June 2012

Prepared by
Katie Evans
Jennifer Smitheram
City and Regional Planning Department
College of Architecture and Environmental Design
California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA
Preface

This senior project will finalize a proposal for the Hayward BART Transit-Oriented Development (TOD), which was conceptually proposed in the 410/411 Community Planning Lab by students in the City and Regional Planning Department at Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo. An extensive literature review has addressed concerns of how successful TODs are and the benefits they provide economically, environmentally, and socially. Continued research has addressed concerns of City Staff and residents regarding appropriate and attractive uses for the development. Several case studies about TODs in the Bay Area will be analyzed for evidence that TODs are effective. Based on this information, a refined TOD will be proposed for the Hayward BART Opportunity Area.
# Hayward BART Transit-Oriented Development, An Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Defining the Project Area</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing Characteristics</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Developments and Future Plans</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Transit-Oriented Development Planning Principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is a Transit-Oriented Development?</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of a Transit-Oriented Development</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Design Success</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Contemporary Transit-Oriented Developments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contra Costa Centre Case Study</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downtown Berkeley BART Case Study</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fruitvale Transit Village Case Study</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zoning</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demographics</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Project Area: Potentials and Constraints</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Urban Design Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Characteristics</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit-Oriented Development</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lighting and Pedestrian Safety</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connections</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streetscape</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed-Use</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Height</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot Coverage</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Design of Transit-Oriented Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proposal and Recommendations</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Bibliography
Project Overview

1.1 Defining the Project Area

The City of Hayward has identified the Hayward BART area as an opportunity site for future development and economic growth. A proposed transit-oriented development (TOD), which incorporates the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) and feeds to the Downtown core, is crucial for Hayward's intended goal: to attract visitors and boost its economic vitality.

1.2 Existing Characteristics

Downtown Hayward is nearly built out, with only three percent of land vacant. The City of Hayward has identified three Opportunity Areas with strong development potential within the Downtown. Of those three, the BART Opportunity Area is ideal for a TOD due to its proximity to Downtown Hayward, CSU East Bay, as well as its central location in the Bay Area.

The City has already begun to implement smart growth strategies through multiple redevelopment projects completed and proposed over the past fifteen years to help revitalize the downtown area. One way the City is doing so is to support higher density TODs within close proximity to public transportation. The Hayward BART Station has been identified as an important connection point and opportunity for the community for a TOD and should be utilized to connect visitors and residents with the Downtown. Another way that the City of Hayward is moving towards more sustainable planning and building decisions is by providing environmental impact transparency on the City website including: informational links about incentive programs, City ordinances, City “Green” Initiatives, Green Services,
Transit-Oriented Development, and more. The Hayward BART Opportunity Area covers approximately 10 acres and is located at the southwest entrance to Downtown Hayward. Grand Street, Montgomery Street, and B Street border the BART Opportunity Area. This Hayward BART Opportunity Area offers great potential for economic boost through infill development because of inefficient land use, vacant parcels, and moderately and poorly maintained features.

The Hayward BART station is one of two BART stations in Hayward, which provide an affordable public transportation option for access to and from Downtown Hayward and the surrounding San Francisco Bay Area. The Hayward BART Station has not been updated since it was first built in 1972 and functional and aesthetic modernization is needed.

Based on the City of Hayward’s Land Use and Zoning maps, the allowed use on the parcels within the BART opportunity area is Central City Commercial (CC-C). The purpose of CC-C is to establish a mix of uses and activities which will enhance the economic vitality of the Downtown. Section 10-1.1520 of the Zoning Ordinance states that the permitted activities include, but are not limited to, retail, office, service, lodging, entertainment, education, and multi-family residential uses.

1.3 Methodology

Phase 1 – Existing Conditions
The first phase of the planning process involved gathering both primary and secondary data to learn about the existing realities in the designated BART Opportunity Area as well as the opinions, values, and visions of the community. Our team organized and analyzed data based on previous research compiled in 410/411 Community Planning Lab by students in the City and Regional Planning Department at Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo, in regards to the city’s existing conditions through documents such as the General Plan, zoning regulations, specific plans and redevelopment activity as well previously conducted first-hand assessment of the Downtown’s land uses, historic resources, circulation,
environmental conditions, noise levels, community services, population, and housing information. Extensive public outreach efforts were the foundation to develop our proposal. With the help of the City, such efforts included a public workshop as well as stakeholder interviews, community opinion surveys, and a focus group meeting. These interactions were vital in order to gain insight of the community’s perceptions of the BART Opportunity Area.

Phase 2- TOD Case Study’s and Research
Contemporary transit-oriented development case studies and TOD literature was reviewed to study what might be an appropriate action to design a real life TOD. The criteria for analyzing these case studies include: key lessons to be learned and what may be applicable to the project area. Through this phase we addressed the Hayward community’s concerns that were voiced during public outreach efforts.

Phase 3 – Proposed Hayward BART TOD Design
Taking into account the information gathered from both the public and the existing conditions reports, our team drafted one overall concept plan and 3D model for the BART Opportunity Area. The proposal was consciously designed reflecting the feedback provided in the second public workshop.

1.4 Current Developments and Future Plans for the Project Area
The City of Hayward hired Professor Zeljka Howard’s 410/411 Community Planning Lab to engage the community in developing a shared vision about future development in Downtown Hayward and provide recommendations based on that vision. In reference to our proposed project site, the City of Hayward plans on using ideas from the project in to the future to revitalize the BART station and surrounding area to be an activity hub through a mix of uses that attract residents.
and visitors to utilize BART and Downtown Hayward. Increase accessibility to and from Downtown by highlighting public transportation and providing safe pedestrian and bicycle services. Implement smart growth strategies including low impact development and landscaping. Our proposed project meets the intentions of the City of Hayward’s future goals.
Planning Principles
Transit-Oriented Development Planning Principles

2.1 What Is A Transit Oriented Development?

In the late 1990s’ Peter Calthorpe an American architect and urban planner introduced the concept for the transit-oriented development (TOD). He defined the TOD in his transit-oriented development design guidelines for the City of San Diego as “A transit-oriented development (TOD) is a mixed-use community within a typical 2000 feet walking distance of transit stop and core commercial area. The design, configuration, and mix of uses emphasize a pedestrian-oriented environment and reinforce the use of public transportation, without ignoring the role of automobile. TODs mix residential, retail, office, open space, and public uses within comfortable walking distance, making it convenient for residents and employees to travel by transit, bicycle or foot, as well as by car.” (San Diego Design Guidelines, 1992)

According to Cal Trans a transit-oriented development is defined as “A mixed-use community within an average one-fourth-mile walking distance of a transit stops and core commercial area. The design, configuration, and mix of uses emphasize a pedestrian-oriented environment and reinforce the use of public transportation. TODs mix residential, retail, office, open space, and public uses within comfortable walking distance, making it convenient for residents and employees to travel by transit, bicycle or foot, as well as by car.” (Cal Trans, 2002)

The Metropolitan Transportation Commission has further defined transit-oriented development as “places with a mix of homes, jobs, shops and services in close proximity to frequent, high-quality transit services. Such development is often compact in form, rather than sprawling, and provides a range of public amenities that creates an enjoyable and attractive environment for daily life. With the right mix of housing, jobs, shopping, recreation and services, and access to abundant transit options, TOD can create an environment where transit and walking can satisfy almost all transportation needs. The use of, or the ownership of an automobile, can be an option rather than a necessity. Cars are not prohibited from TOD; they simply are needed less often.” (City of San Leandro, 2007)

Though, Calthorpe introduced transit-oriented developments many agencies and local governments have defined TODs in a number of different ways. There is no evidence leading to one specific definition, however, the type of development and purpose of TODs are similar in the effort to create attractive, walkable, sustainable communities that allow residents to have housing and transportation choices and to live convenient, affordable, pleasant lives with places for our kids to play and for our parents to grow old comfortably.

2.2 Benefits of Transit-Oriented Development

Implementation of a transit-oriented development can be beneficial because of social, economic and environmental benefits. Not only do TODs make
communities more livable but they provide an alternative to low density, automobile dependent communities.

Cal Trans has defined the following as potential general benefits of TODs (Cal Trans, 2002):

- Enhance quality of life for community residents
- Increased options for mobility, especially in congested urban and suburban areas
- Reduced rates of vehicle trip making and fewer vehicle miles households travel by automobile
- Improved air quality and reduced energy consumption
- Preservation of prime farmland and other resource lands
- Reduced infrastructure costs for government, developers and property owners
- Increased safety for pedestrian and bicyclists, and helping to reduce aggressive driving injuries and deaths.

2.2.1 Social Benefits
Transit-oriented developments provide a range of social benefits for residents. Residents living in TOD are exposed to a diverse community of social backgrounds. For instance, employees fill public spaces during lunch hour, residents throughout the day, and families on the weekend. The diverse array of housing options, commercial, office and retail amenities attract a diverse type of foot traffic in the development.

2.2.2 Economic Development
Transit-oriented developments provide several economic benefits to all stakeholders involved. First, TOD can offer a reliable transportation alternative for residents and employees. The low cost of public transit provides significant savings. The time spent in commute traffic is reduced by half. TODs also benefits landowners and developers as land values and rent increases. According to a study done it is “reported that the average price of a house within a kilometer of a transit station was 21% higher than the average price of similar housing sold in nearby non-TODs. Residential units in the TOD surrounding Orenco station in Portland were priced between $180,000 and $440,000, representing a 30% premium over the area’s average housing price” (Cal Trans, 2002)

2.2.3 Environmental Benefits
Reducing energy consumption, greenhouse gas emissions and improving air quality are major benefits of transit-oriented developments. According to the Department of Transportation the number of on-road vehicles is projected to reach almost 35 million, up from about 23 million in 2000. (Department of Transportation, 2001). Currently, this increase in vehicle trips has led to increased pollution from greenhouse gases. By shifting away from vehicle use, to more sustainable communities like TODs we can reduce our negative impact on the environment by promoting traveling by public transit, foot or bicycle. With the access to high-quality transit and residents of TODs are more likely to take transit
than those living without the same access. The convenience of the near by transit system appeals to many residents and employees.

2.3 Physical Design Success

Social, environmental and economic development has been identified as major benefit of TODs. However, with these benefits one of the biggest concerns City staff had regarding a TOD proposal was the success rate of the development. Researching best practices for mixed use, density, pedestrian use and housing types will give the team a better understanding for the future development of the BART Opportunity Area. The following concepts were identified by the Capitol Region Council of Governments as best practices for TODs:

2.3.1 Mixed Use

One of the key principles of TOD is to have a mix of uses around the transit station. Mixed-use development combined with higher densities is favorable to walking and is therefore compatible with transit service, which also serves pedestrians. The primary uses in a station area would typically be residential or office, with supporting uses such as retail, restaurants, entertainment, parks, and cultural, governmental, social, and educational institutions. A great deal of attention should be given to these supporting uses because they shape the character and quality of life of a neighborhood, even though they are not necessarily the most common uses.

2.3.2 Higher Density

Generally, the greater the intensity of residential and office development, the greater the levels of transit ridership. The absolute minimum residential density required to support any form of regular, on-street bus service is about 6 to 8 units per acre, on average, for a transit corridor. For express bus service with exclusively pedestrian access (i.e., no park and- ride facilities) minimum average densities for the corridor should be about 15 units per acre. However, ridership levels at such minimum densities tend to be relatively low and heavily concentrated during commute hours. As densities are increased, ridership increases. Particularly, researchers have found that there are sharp increases in ridership as average residential densities approach 30 units per acre. In the downtown area, a minimum density of about 50 employees per acre is necessary to support regular transit service, and people do not switch from driving to transit until employment densities reach about 50 to 75 employees per acre. (Cal Trans, 2002)

2.3.3 Pedestrian-Friendly Design

Sidewalk-oriented buildings, strong pedestrian linkages, and attractive streetscapes can enhance the area around transit stations and help link the transit station to the neighborhood. Pedestrian-oriented signage, landscaping, benches, and lighting can create a comfortable and safe environment for walking. Keeping auto-oriented uses (like drive-through uses, gas stations, and auto repair shops) out of transit-intensive areas can also help preserve the transit friendly environment and
discourage car use near the transit station.

2.3.4 Mixture of Housing Types
Through higher-density development, TOD provides the opportunity for a wider range of housing types. Residents have a choice from small-lot single-family and two-family homes, to townhouses, to low-rise and high-rise apartments that appeal to a larger range of demographic groups.
Contemporary
Transit-Oriented Developments
Contemporary Transit-Oriented Developments

3.1 Case Study Introduction

Three existing transit-oriented developments were selected to study what might be appropriate action for designing a real life TOD. The Contra Costa Centre Transit Village’s study documents its success as a TOD through its existing characteristics, complimentary uses, and pedestrian conscious design. Downtown Berkeley BART Station’s study highlights the benefits of rider friendly programs allowing UC Berkeley students and non-student commuter’s alternative transportation modes from the station. Lastly, the study on Fruitvale Village as a successful TOD closely analyzes the importance of conscious design for an area’s demographics.
3.2 Contra Costa Centre Case Study

Description
The Contra Costa Centre Transit Village is a major transit-oriented, multi-use community at the heart of Contra Costa County sitting on 125 acres in unincorporated Walnut Creek. It is one of only 100 transit villages throughout the entire United States, and serves as a nationwide model for smart planning. The Centre has provided economic growth, affordable housing and a 30% decrease in traffic congestion to the area. The Centre is easily accessible to all employees, residents, and visitors as it encompasses the Pleasant Hill/Contra Costa Centre BART station and is convenient to Interstate 680 and the county’s main bus routes.

BART, a 104-mile commuter rail system, has 44 stations that serve five counties with an annual ridership rate that is just under 350,000 people. The San Francisco Bay Area has a population of nearly 8,000,000 people of which about 11 percent reside within walking distance of a BART station.

Before the TOD, the Pleasant Hill BART station area was characterized as semi-rural with low-density single-family residential and widely dispersed neighborhood serving commercial. The area around the station was dominated by vehicular traffic. Treat Boulevard, the station's primary access, is a major six-lane arterial that connects the station area to I-680. There were few pedestrian amenities and no bicycling facilities until the Iron Horse Trail was constructed within an abandoned railroad corridor 200 feet from the station in the 1980s. Initially, however, there was no connection between the trail and the station. Although the growing number of residential developments surrounding the station provided sidewalks for pedestrian access to BART, the pedestrian and bicycle environment was uninviting as a result of the station being dominated by a surface parking lot.
Key Features
- 522 residential units;
- 35,590 square feet of local serving retail (including restaurants, business services, and convenience retail);
- 10 live-work units;
- 290,000 square feet of office;
- 20,000 square feet of business conference center.

The streets for the site are walkable by design. Vehicles are discouraged from speeding by short blocks, closely spaced controlled intersections, and landscaping features. Placemaking features, such as pedestrian-scaled lighting, attractive sidewalks wide enough for outdoor dining, visually interesting building facades, public open space with seating and water features, and street frontages that include several smaller-scale retail and live/work spaces create an inviting promenade for pedestrians and cyclists.
The interior streets are marked differently from the urban arterials that surround the site; Treat Boulevard, Jones Road and Oak Road. Pedestrian crossings are given greater prominence through highly visible street markings or colored/textured concrete; which conveys the priority of pedestrians. The streets provide on street parking that is also highly visible through pavement markings and curb extensions at pedestrian crossings. The incorporation of barrier-free design, with pedestrian space level to travel lane space introduces some ambiguity to the prioritized user of the space that, in turn, encourages drivers to slow down. Wayfinding and placemaking features, such as community chessboards and a plaza with a water mister, signal that the space has been designed with the pedestrian in mind. The town square will also include a public art feature and discovered art in the near future.

Supporting and enhancing the transportation connections to the station is a key element of the vision for the BART property. The vision supports all modes—local transit, pedestrian, cycling, and motor vehicle—but specifically discourages any through traffic in the station area. The plan sees the use of parking primarily by commuters accessing the BART station and indicates a need for replacing all BART patron parking displaced by development on the BART property. Pedestrian connections throughout the BART property are prioritized, with direct connections to the BART station from each block in the village. Pedestrian paths directly link to surrounding neighborhoods through highly visible pedestrian crossings at intersections.

Lessons Learned
Similar to Contra Costa Centre Transit Village’s pre-development state, the area around the Hayward BART station is dominated by vehicular traffic. Mission Blvd and Foothill Blvd are major arterials that connect the station area to I-880, causing few pedestrian amenities and safety lacking bicycling facilities. With the passed Loop Project, vehicular traffic will only make the BART area’s pedestrian atmosphere worse. Proposed walkable by design streets around the Hayward BART area would discourage vehicles from speeding through the area. Mimicking Contra Costa Centre Transit Village, closely spaced controlled intersections, landscaping and placemaking features, should aide in creating an inviting transit-oriented development for pedestrians and cyclists.
3.3 Downtown Berkeley BART Case Study

Description
Downtown Berkeley is a Bay Area Rapid Transit station located on Shattuck Avenue, between Allston Way and Addison Street in Downtown Berkeley, California. Service at this station began on January 29, 1973. The station consists of a mezzanine level and an underground island platform beneath it. A rotunda that covers passengers entering and leaving the station from inclement weather tops the escalators leading to the entrance at Shattuck Avenue and Center Street.

Downtown Berkeley is the second-busiest BART station outside of San Francisco, with 11,317 weekday average exits in Fiscal Year 2010. The station is popular both with students of UC Berkeley who use it to commute to the university and with non-student residents of Berkeley, many of whom commute to job centers in San Francisco and other Bay Area cities. Additionally, it is used by patrons of events taking place at the University, such as concerts or lectures, and especially football games and other athletic events, including those sponsored by the MyBART service. MyBART started in 1999 to promote riding BART to events that are close to BART stations, and as a rewards program for riders. MyBART has given away tens of thousands of tickets to events around the Bay Area, offered discounts to sporting events, museums, theaters, concerts and other events, and has provided a way for BART to support the venues, independent theaters and community groups surrounding BART stations.

Key Features
- Richmond-Fremont Line
- Richmond-Millbrae Line
- 2 tracks
- AC Transit: 1, 1R, 7, 12, 18, 25, 49, 51B, 52, 65, 67, 88, 800, 851, and F.

Figure 3-5: Downtown Berkeley BART’s Relationship to UC Berkeley Campus
There is a valet bike parking facility located outside the station at street level and is operated by Alameda Bicycle. It used to be placed at the top of an unused stairway from the mezzanine level to the platform below. The stairs were built so that an additional entrance could be opened if needed in the future, and had never been used by passengers.

The bike “cage” on the concourse level of the Downtown Berkeley BART Station is a free bike storage area that was started in 1999 and has become more and more popular over time – outgrowing its original space needs and, at times, becoming cramped and overcrowded. The new bike station will be located above ground at 2208 Shattuck Ave., a few seconds away from the BART entrance at Allston Way and Shattuck Avenue. The new 4,000-square-foot facility is the result of a partnership between BART, the City of Berkeley and the bicycle community. The construction was largely funded through a Safe Routes to Transit Regional Measure 2 grant. The station is well equipped with many perks: It's more spacious, can accommodate more bikes and will offer full-service bike repairs. The Berkeley Bike Station, operated by BART’s contractor, Alameda Bicycles, will offer other amenities such as a rent-to-own program, free safety-check inspections and retail items for sale.
Alameda Bicycle, under contract for BART, also operates valet-staffed bike stations at the Fruitvale and Downtown Berkeley BART Stations. Daily parking is free during regular hours.

How the valet bike stations work:
1) Bring your bike to the Berkeley or Fruitvale BART bike station.
2) Fill out a log with your name, the type of bike you have, and phone number.
3) Get a valet ticket and a small tag goes with you. Please note: Bikes left after the second night will be charged $5 per day. Bikes that are left more than one week may be donated or given to the police.

Alameda Bicycle also operates a self-service model bike station with an electronic smart-card BikeLink card access at both the new Berkeley Bike Station and at the BART Embarcadero Bike Station. BART offers electronic smart-card access lockers at many other stations as well. Bike storage options are just one of the ways BART works to accommodate riders who want to use a combination of bikes and BART in their travels. Providing bike stations, as well as electronic lockers, helps bikers abide by the bike “blackout periods” BART has in place to prevent overcrowding on trains during peak commute hours.

In the event that an individual does not have a bike, Downtown Berkeley and Fruitvale offer Bike rentals. All of the bikes are pre-equipped with gear to use right away. Each model is customized, but most come with: lights, locks, flat-resistant elements, emergency gear, and racks. Cost: $20 up to 3 hours, $35 per day, $95 per week, $200 per month. If the individual’s bike, or the rented bike is in need of repair, Downtown Berkeley and Fruitvale stations offer repair services. Simply tell the staff the problem and they’ll either perform an inspection on the spot or call with an estimate. They guarantee to fix the bike that day while the owner is at work or during a scheduled appointment with more complicated cases.

As another alternative transportation option for UC Berkeley students and non-student commuter’s, Downtown Berkeley BART station has partnered with UC
Berkeley’s Bear Transit. Bear Transit is a bus service operated by the Department of Parking and Transportation of the University of California, Berkeley. Bear Transit connects various areas of the university, including student housing, the main campus, the Hill area, Downtown Berkeley and distant locations such as Lawrence Hall of Science in the East Bay Hills and the Clark Kerr Campus south of the main campus. It also provides shuttle service to the Richmond Field Station (RFS), a research facility also owned by the University, located in Richmond. Bear Transit operates five daytime and five nighttime routes that operate mostly around the UC Berkeley Campus. All daytime routes operate weekdays only. Five routes operate in the nighttime, and they are operated as either safety shuttles, to your door shuttles, or owl service around the UC Berkeley campus. The Owl Service operates from 2:00am to 6:00am daily by phone request. Students with their student I.D.’s ride Bear Transit for free and all other riders are charged $1.00. This offers the Berkeley community an affordable and easily accessible mode of transportation to and from the UC campus.

Lessons Learned
The majority of CSU East Bay students currently commute to campus with their personal vehicles because there aren’t other practical or easily accessible options to get them to campus. The Hayward BART station is 1.8 miles away from the CSU campus with a 0.6 mile steep hill separating the two. Though the Downtown Berkeley BART station is only 1 mile away from the UC Berkeley campus and does not have similar topographical challenges, their bike and shuttle programs would offer CSU East Bay students and non-students affordable and accessible transportation options.
3.4 Fruitvale Village Case Study

**Description**

A local community development corporation, the Unity Council proposed to develop the Fruitvale BART Transit Village to provide jobs, affordable housing and accessible health and human services around the BART transit station.

This mixed-use development is comprised of 15 - 24 acres of four-story mixed-use buildings, an open air plaza, retail, office, residential and various community uses. The project is expected to reduce traffic and pollution in and around Fruitvale because community residents now have access to a range of goods and services within easy walking distance of the transit station.

![Figure 3-10: Fruitvale Village Aerial](image)

The Fruitvale Transit Village project is the result of a broad-based partnership among public, private, and nonprofit organizations working together to revitalize a community using transit-oriented development. In September 1999, groundbreaking took place on a $100 million mixed-use development adjacent to the Fruitvale Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) station in Oakland, California. Fruitvale, one of Oakland’s seven community districts, is a low-income, predominantly minority community experiencing economic stress.

Fruitvale’s troubles began during the 1950s, when the construction of new freeways created opportunities for manufacturers to take advantage of cheap land and labor in suburban areas. Canneries and factories located in Fruitvale began leaving the area, accompanied by many of the community’s white, middle-class residents. With the erosion of its customer base, the Fruitvale business district went into decline. By the 1960s, Fruitvale had become a distressed neighborhood, plagued by joblessness, inadequate housing, and other problems characteristic of low-income, inner-city communities.

The Unity Council and its partners tapped diverse sources of public and private funds. For example, a housing complex for seniors is being funded through a combination of grants, loans, and land and equity capital from seven different entities,
including private banks, the City of Oakland, a federal housing program, and the Unity Council. Project partners worked effectively to overcome constraints on the use of certain funds. For instance, since the Unity Council was not an eligible recipient of FTA grant funds for construction of the project’s child care center, BART agreed to accept the funds and allocate them to the Unity Council.

For the Unity Council, the project has been a success in terms of revitalizing the Fruitvale district. The council believes Fruitvale Village has succeeded in connecting BART commuters to International Boulevard, and the village has become an integral part of the overall area by providing commuters with a sense of place and arrival into the larger Fruitvale neighborhood. The Fruitvale area now has the second-highest sales tax revenue in Oakland and vacancy rates on International Boulevard are near 1 percent, down from a high of 40 percent when the project was first conceived. Moreover, centralizing the social services has made transportation easier for clients and has allowed for efficient delivery of services. Prior to the development, the Head Start services were scattered throughout the neighborhood and the Fruitvale Senior Center worked out of a space that was much smaller.

The Unity Council and the FDC gauge their success with Fruitvale Village not only in terms of the economic revenue they have generated for the neighborhood, but also by the level of acceptance in the community. They believe the lack of graffiti and vandalism in the village is a sign of the community’s pride in and sense of ownership of the project.

Overall, the development team sees the creation of a viable and successful market where there previously was none as one of its biggest accomplishments. When the FDC was in the early stages of planning the development, a market study on the area revealed that there was no market for retail or office space in Fruitvale. Martinez points out that if there had been a viable market opportunity there, developers would have already pursued it. For the FDC and the Unity Council, the project was about need rather than demand—residents in Fruitvale needed convenient access to services and the businesses along International Boulevard.
needed a pedestrian link to the BART station. According to Martinez, the project created the demand by fostering a sense of place.

**Key Features**
- 45,000 square feet of Retail/Restaurant Use
- 54,000 square feet of Nonprofit Health-Care Clinic
- 55,000 square feet of Child Care Facility
- 15,000 square feet of Library
- 45,000 square feet of Executive Offices
- 68 Units of HUD Housing
- 220 Units of Mixed-Income Housing
- 2 Parking Garages for 1,500 Cars

Fruitvale Village consists of two mixed-use buildings with a pedestrian plaza between them. The interiors of both structures provide at-grade covered parking for a total of 150 cars. Above these garages, on the second floors of each building, are outdoor patio spaces. The southern building’s patio includes a play area for children in the Head Start program and a courtyard for the use of the Unity Council, while the northern building’s patio offers outdoor space for the seniors’ center, the library, and the residential tenants.

To create an appealing environment for BART commuters, the majority of the project’s retail shops face the plaza or East 12th Street. Most of the office space is located on the second floors and all of the market-rate housing is on the top two floors; six of the affordable units are located on the second floor. The northern building houses the city of Oakland’s César Chávez Library, the Fruitvale Senior Center, 22 market-rate apartments, two affordable apartments, and an additional 20,200 square feet (1,876.6 square meters) of office space. Also located in the northern building is the Fruitvale Bike Station, a free 200-space bicycle garage. Although it takes up only a small portion of the building, the bike garage is...
currently one of the largest of its kind in America. The operation of the garage is cosponsored by the Unity Council, BART, the city of Oakland, and Alameda Bicycle (a local bicycle shop). The southern building is the location of the Unity Council headquarters, the Head Start center, a community health clinic called La Clínica de La Raza, 15 market-rate apartments, and the aforementioned eight affordable units.

Placement of elevators and stairwells throughout the village helps to keep the project’s uses separated. In the southern building, La Clinica de La Raza and the Head Start center each have private entrances as well as their own elevators and stairwells. The Unity Council and the residential units share both an elevator and a staircase. In the northern building, an elevator and a staircase are shared by the office space and seniors’ center and the apartments above them. Due to its second-floor location, visitors to the César Chávez Library enter through a small foyer on the ground floor at the northeastern corner of the building. Inside the foyer are an elevator and a stairwell shared by the apartment residents and by the library on the second floor.

The 37 market-rate apartments and four of the affordable units are arranged in one- and two-bedroom loft-style layouts, while six of the affordable units are set up as one- and two-bedroom flats designed to be fully accessible for people who use wheelchairs. Every residential unit comes with a washer and dryer, energy-efficient electrical appliances, granite countertops, and a balcony or patio.

**Lessons Learned**

Public transit facilities are valuable assets for certain low-income, minority communities in urban locations. Such facilities already play an important role in providing inner-city residents with access to jobs, shopping, and other key destinations. To the extent that projects like the Fruitvale Transit Village prove successful, transit facilities may also be used increasingly as anchors for neighborhood revitalization.
Analysis
Analysis

4.1 Zoning

The City of Hayward designates six main land use types and four of them exist within the downtown: Residential, Commercial, Open Space, and Public and Quasi-Public. Based on the City of Hayward’s Land Use and Zoning maps, the allowed use on the parcels within the BART Opportunity Area is Central City Commercial (CC-C). The purpose of CC-C is to establish a mix of uses and activities which will enhance the economic vitality of the Downtown. Section 10-1.1520 of the Zoning Ordinance states that the permitted activities include, but are not limited to, retail, office, service, lodging, entertainment, education, and multi-family residential uses.

4.2 Demographics

The City of Hayward is located in a vital location that allows for a thriving city. It is located in Alameda County within the San Francisco East Bay Area. The city's population, housing, and economics play an important role in the development and establishment of the city. In addition, Hayward is an ethnically diverse city because of its location. It is predominantly White but in recent years, a steady increase in the Asian, Hispanic, and African American population (US Census, 2010). Currently, Hayward's population as a whole is approximately 144,000. The Downtown area population consists of approximately 4,289 residents. According to the U.S. Census Bureau, Hayward's population is projected to increase to at least 176,000 in the next 20 years.

Hayward's location in the San Francisco Bay Area is ideal in terms of accessibility which allows for easy accessibility for commuters and visitors from around the Bay Area. It is also ideal for many types of economic sectors such as industrial or retail. The Downtown area has the potential to create more businesses and jobs because of ease of accessibility.

The City of Hayward has a culturally diverse population which has an opportunity to create unique stores and buildings specific to various ethnicities and cultures. The City also can capitalize on cultural events to bring people in to Hayward, specifically the Downtown.

4.3 The Project Area: Potentials and Constraints

The Hayward BART Opportunity Area covers approximately 10 acres and is located at the southwest entrance to Downtown Hayward. Grand Street, Montgomery Street, and B Street border the BART Opportunity Area. This Hayward BART opportunity area offers great potential for economic boost through infill development because of inefficient land use, vacant parcels, and moderately and poorly maintained features.
The Hayward BART station is one of two BART stations in Hayward, which provide an affordable public transportation option for access to and from Downtown Hayward and the surrounding San Francisco Bay Area. The Hayward BART station has not been updated since it was first built in 1972 and functional and aesthetic modernization is needed.

The north portion of the Opportunity Area includes vacant parcels with great potential to improve the image of Hayward BART and bring more people into the Downtown Area. BART currently offers 1,473 parking spaces between a parking structure and surface parking lot to the west side of the platform.

The BART Opportunity Area lies directly adjacent to the recently renovated Hayward City Hall with a moderately maintained open space, which serves as a buffer between the two. Public response also expressed concern for safety due to poor lighting, location of taxis, and lack of pedestrian amenities around BART and the railroad tracks, as they exist.

Many opportunities can be transformed from the constraints that have been found through data and field research. The current lack of signage to and within Downtown Hayward make it difficult to specify it as a unique location. Between the lack of signage and land use and circulation patterns, Downtown feels segmented from much of the rest of Hayward with little connection to surrounding areas. Additionally the narrow sidewalks, busy traffic, vacant buildings, and lack of lighting all contribute to a feeling of low security and personal safety which can deter potential visitors from going Downtown. Many business and building owners are reluctant to invest in upgrades to slow economic growth in the area. There are also multiple environmental constraints including the proximity to the Hayward Fault Line.
Urban Design Strategies

5.1 Proposed Characteristics

The Hayward City Council and Planning Commission had several comments and concerns regarding the proposal made by the 410/411 Community Planning Lab for the BART Opportunity Area. To address the comments and concerns the team has prepared a proposed development to reflect these changes and meet the goals of the City of Hayward. Proposed development of the Hayward BART Opportunity Area will take into account compatible land uses that are consistent with comments received from the community, field survey, and objectives developed for the area. Additionally, an extensive literature review and case study analysis was done to further develop a successful transit-oriented development for the Hayward BART Opportunity Area.

5.2 Transited-Oriented Development

Majority of the development will encompass four to five story mixed use structures including residential uses with commercial/retail on the ground floor west of the BART station to bring a 24-hour presence to Downtown. The allowed density for the CC-C ranges from 30 to 65 residential units per acre and has a small portion that only allows a maximum of 17 units per acre near the historic Victorian homes on B Street. Based on the existing allowed densities, the proposed transit-oriented development could include between 108 and 212 multifamily housing units. The buildings will be architecturally consistent with Downtown building style. The transit-oriented development will reduce vehicular trips and increase the pedestrian mobility in the Downtown.

5.3 Lighting and Pedestrian Safety

Due to public concern regarding pedestrian safety around BART, especially at the neighboring railroad tracks, pedestrian crosswalks are proposed to be located across the train tracks as well as a fenced off, well lit pedestrian boulevard parallel to the railroad tracks is proposed to provide a safer connection to A Street from BART. Increasing lighting throughout the site for all times of the day and night is proposed to improve the perception of safety and respond to public concern. These lights shall implement modern, energy efficient, LED lighting options.

5.4 Connections

Due to concerns of City staff regarding connections the proposed TOD shall provide connections to the proposed land uses with the transit system and parking structure, plazas, and open space. To address the concern of the connection to and from the BART platform area and the parking structure, a pedestrian bridge is proposed to give pedestrians, riders and cyclist a clear and easily accessible passage way to the parking structure.
5.5 Streetscape

The streetscaping will include wide sidewalks for pedestrians, low impact and drought tolerant vegetation/trees, seating, and historic style lights that are consistent with the popular designs seen on B Street.

5.6 Mixed-Use

Mixed-use development is proposed to be located on the western side of the BART tracks on the existing partially vacant parcel in the northwest corner and the existing surface parking lot that serves BART. The mixed-use will include commercial/retail or office on the ground floor and multifamily residential units other floors.

5.7 Height

The proposed height for the mixed-use structures is between four and five stories.

5.8 Lot Coverage

The allowed density for the CC-C ranges from 30 to 65 residential units per acre and has a small portion that only allows a maximum of 17 units per acre near the historic Victorian homes on B Street. Based on the existing allowed densities, the proposed Transit Oriented Development shall include between 108 and 212 multifamily housing units.

5.9 Access

Access to the first floor commercial/retail or office shall be along the street frontages. Residential access shall have locked entrances on both the street front and interior of the buildings that will have stair and elevator access to the housing units above. All access points for residences shall be placed no more than 50 feet apart pursuant to international fire code. Parking should be behind the building facade.
Proposed Design
6.1 Proposal and Recommendations

The following site plan is the proposed design for the transit-oriented development for the Hayward BART Opportunity Area. The design and features reflect concerns of City Staff and residents regarding appropriate uses as well as best practices the team has learned through case studies and literature review of transit-oriented developments. The site plan is a more extensive version of what was proposed by students in the 410/411 Community Planning Lab.
Key Features

*Hayward BART Transit-Oriented Development Proposed Land Use Distribution*

Table 7-1: Land Use Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Projected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Acerage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Use</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Space</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transportation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mixed-Use Residential/Commercial*

The north wester portion of the project area is designated for mixed-use residential and commercial. The proposed uses will be appropriate for Hayward's demographics and offer the community commercial services that are currently lacking. The mixed-use development will encompass approximately 300,000 square feet of residential space. There are 105 two-bedroom, 146 one-bedroom, and 81 studio proposed units for residents to enjoy. This mix of housing types will cater to families, the working class, and students.

Figure 7-2: Mixed-Use Residential/Commercial
Performing Arts Center
The northern portion of the project area will be designated for a performing arts center and will capture BART riders to utilize the amenities and feed people into the Downtown. The performing arts center will help meet the City’s goal of celebrating Hayward’s rich history.

Figure 7-3: Performing Arts Center

Public Plaza/ Open Space
The designated public plaza and open space areas will be designed to offer the public a place to leisurely recreate and will welcome BART riders and community members into the Hayward BART Transit-Oriented Development.

Figure 7-4: Public Plaza/Open Space
**Pedestrian Bridge**
To address City Staff and residents concerns about accessibility and safety when connecting to the BART platform, a pedestrian bridge is proposed in the design to act as a clear and safe passageway for commuters. The pedestrian bridge will eliminate the existing underground passage that is the cause of many residents discomfort when connecting to BART.

![Figure 7-5: Pedestrian Bridge](image)

**Taxi Drop Off**
To address residents concerns about the current lack of safety near the existing taxi drop off area, the south east portion of the project area has been designated as the new taxi drop off area. This will keep commuters off of the train tracks, and allows them to easily reach the taxis when coming out of Hayward BART Station.

![Figure 7-6: Taxi Drop Off](image)


Image Sources


