

# THE FORUM

---

## *Journal of History*

Volume 8 | Spring 2016

Phi Alpha Theta, Alpha Nu Gamma Chapter  
California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo

CALIFORNIA POLYTECHNIC STATE UNIVERSITY SAN LUIS OBISPO

Published in the United States of America  
by the Cal Poly History Department  
1 Grand Avenue, Building 47, Office 27c  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93407

Copyright © 2016 California Polytechnic State University San Luis Obispo

Cover art copyright © 2016 Melissa Fazio

Neither the editors nor Cal Poly assume responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by the contributors.

All Rights Reserved. Except in those cases which comply with the fair use guidelines of U.S. copyright law (U.S.C Title 17), no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the prior permission from the publisher.

All articles appearing in this journal are simultaneously published electronically via the DigitalCommons@CalPoly and are therefore subject to the terms specified in the Non-Exclusive License Agreement for Use of Materials in the DigitalCommons@CalPoly.  
<http://digitalcommons.calpoly.edu/forum/>

ISSN 2153-7178

ISSN 2153-7119

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

### FRONT MATTER

- v Journal Staff
- vii Editor's Note

### ARTICLES

- 3 People of the Sun: The EZLN in an Age of Mass Media | *Blake Burgess*
- 19 Origin Myth in Austronesian Language Speaking Tribes of Southeast Asia | *Cooper Peltz*
- 37 A Complicated Legacy: The Battle of Bataan in U.S. Cold War Propaganda | *Solange Kiehlbauch*
- 47 The Historiography of Queen Victoria: On the Threshold of Private Psychoanalysis and Public Feminism | *Rebecca Willis*
- 63 The Rise and Reign of the Loser: Emotionological Culture of the 1980s Red Sox | *Allison Wilkinson*
- 79 Cal Poly's Response to the AIDS Crisis of the 1980s | *Tessa St. Clair*
- 95 Disparity or Equality: How Were Female Students Treated from 1917-1920 | *Charlie Williams*
- 103 Paving Paradise: The Royal Hawaiian and the Rise of Waikiki Tourism, 1901-1929 | *Alika Bourgette*

### BACK MATTER

- 122 Executive Editor & Author Biographies



**EXECUTIVE EDITORS**

Jennifer Freilach

Madeleine Aitchison

**ASSISTANT EDITORS**

Danielle Falconer

Danielle Skipper

Kali Leonard

Ryan Ridley

Sarah Gray

**GRAPHIC DESIGNER**

Melissa Fazio

**FACULTY ADVISOR**

Dr. Lewis Call



## LETTER FROM THE EDITORS

---

Welcome to the 8th volume of The Forum!

We are pleased to present this issue and hope that you enjoy reading the final product. This year, we felt it would be best to stress diversity: both in subject matter and class level. At Cal Poly, we are lucky enough to have faculty with a wide variety of specialties. We wanted to make sure that this volume reflected the spectrum of classes that the history department has to offer. We also wanted to showcase both the talented undergraduate and graduate class of future historians. This volume contains papers written by freshmen alongside upperclassmen and graduate students. We believe that it is important to give everyone a chance to “learn by doing” and have their work published.

We are extremely proud to announce that we experienced a record number of submissions and found it difficult to narrow down our choices this year. To elaborate on the review process, each paper was evaluated by a panel of editors using a double-blind review system. We gave authors feedback and the option to revise and resubmit their paper if it received a high enough score on our rubric system. All second draft submissions went through a similar process until we settled on our finalists. We contacted finalists for approval on a round of copy edits that reflected house style.

This volume would not be possible without a number of people. First, we would like to thank the faculty in the history department for providing students the skills to write such amazing papers and for giving us the resources and confidence to run such an amazing, unique journal. Second, we would like to thank our small staff of editors for taking time out of their busy work and school schedules to make this journal possible. Without such a diligent, hard-working staff, it would have been impossible to get papers back in a timely manner. Third, we would like to thank all authors who submitted their papers for publication. We learned so much from you and this volume would not exist without your research. We encourage everyone to submit their original work for all future volumes.

Jennifer Freilach  
Madeleine Aitchison





## *Articles*

---



# *People of the Sun: The EZLN in an Age of Mass Media*

By Blake Burgess

*It is important for me, as a popular artist, to make clear to the governments of the United States and Mexico that despite the strategy of fear and intimidation to foreigners, despite their weapons, despite their immigration laws and military reserves, they will never be able to isolate the Zapatista communities from the people in the United States.<sup>1</sup>*

*-Zack de la Rocha, vocalist of the American rap metal band Rage Against the Machine*

In an age where the transmission of ideas is instantaneous and widespread, political and ideological movements can gain momentum rapidly and receive support from a global community. The Ejército Zapatista de Liberación Nacional (EZLN) have utilized the internet and media as a tool to build support for their movement. With a somewhat mythical spokesperson, Subcomandante Marcos—who has used other noms de guerre—the EZLN have retained control over Chiapas, Mexico with little bloodshed or violence. In this paper I will provide an overview of the EZLN and its goals from its rise in 1994 to the present, examine the enigmatic Subcomandante Marcos and his role in the movement, the group's use of the internet and media as a political tool, and some perceptions on the EZLN's successes and shortcomings. The EZLN's use of the Internet and popular media, the role of Subcomandante Marcos, and establishment of autonomous communities were key to their subversion of the Mexican government and their ability to maintain a presence. While the EZLN may have not succeeded in their lofty goals of spreading their brand of autonomy and resistance to the rest of Mexico, they succeeded in their goals of local autonomy.

---

1 "Interview with Zach, from Chiapas, Mexico," Music Fan Clubs, July 7, 1998, accessed April 18, 2015, <http://www.musicfanclubs.org/rage/articles/chiapas.htm>

## Origins and Evolution

On New Year's Eve, 1993 EZLN troops made their way to San Cristobal de las Casas and Ocosingo, thus starting what Ana Carrigan calls the "first post-modern revolution;"<sup>2</sup> on January 1, 1994, the EZLN engaged the Mexican government in the Chiapas region.<sup>3</sup> These rebels were primarily indigenous Maya people and the uprising coincided with the adoption of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA).<sup>4</sup> NAFTA removed trade barriers between Canada, the US, and Mexico. This led to impoverished rural farmers in Mexico facing competition from US farmers, which were able to more efficiently raise crops such as corn.<sup>5</sup> The initial fighting between the EZLN and Mexican National Army only lasted twelve days and the spokesman for the EZLN, Subcomandante Marcos, used the national press to create a "dialogue with the Mexican people."<sup>6</sup>

In an interview, Marcos explained in the mid-1980s a small group went to the jungles of Chiapas with ideological roots in political-military guerrilla organizations that were present in 1960s and 1970s Latin America. The group struggled to adapt to the guerrilla lifestyle, but held out with the hopes of eventually having some sort of result. He explained that the group not only taught the indigenous people the basics found in mestizo culture (Mexican history, reading, writing, mathematics, biology, etc.), but that the group also learned from the indigenous. The EZLN began to understand the indigenous worldview and learned to survive as the indigenous had. He noted many struggles—those of peasants, workers, and students—all inevitably clash with power, be it the State or a dominant class. And to bring about change, armed struggle seemed to be the necessary route. Marcos mentioned the EZLN broke with the Left by proposing armed revolution at the time, but it was

---

2 Ana Carrigan, "Chiapas: The First Post-Modern Revolution," *The Fletcher Forum* 19, no. 1 (1995): 71.

3 Michael Radu, "Mexico: Slouching Toward Normality," *The Washington Quarterly* 23, no. 3 (Summer 2000): 47.

4 Oliver Froehling, "The Cyberspace 'War of Ink and Internet' in Chiapas, Mexico," *Geographical Review* 87, no. 2 (April 1997): 291.

5 Courtney Jung, "The Politics of Indigenous Identity: Neoliberalism, Cultural Rights, and the Mexican Zapatistas," *Social Research* 70, no. 2 (2003): 439-40.

6 Ana Carrigan, "Chiapas," 71.

necessary for the indigenous peoples as a defense against the ranchers who were encroaching on the indigenous communities. The dense jungle allowed for the EZLN to grow and to develop a relationship with the local people. Ultimately, Marcos explained, the line between “combatant force and civilian force” disappeared and whole communities were under the Zapatista banner.<sup>7</sup>

Over the years, the EZLN have released numerous communiqués, with the “First Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle” released simultaneously with their January 1 assault. In this the EZLN addressed the people—and the government—of Mexico, citing 500 years of struggle against foreign powers and domestic dictators (such as Porfirio Diaz) neglecting to take care of the people. According to the EZLN, it was time to modify the government, per Article 39 of Mexico’s Constitution which states that national sovereignty resides in the people and that the people “have the inalienable right to alter or modify their form of government.”<sup>8</sup> The EZLN declared war against Carlos Salinas de Gortari’s regime, which maintained a political monopoly in Mexico due to the one-party system in place. The Zapatistas also set standards for themselves and requested the Red Cross to “watch over and regulate...battles” in order to legitimize their cause.<sup>9</sup> Furthermore, the EZLN also declared that they would follow the Geneva Accords.<sup>10</sup> By proclaiming constitutional legitimacy and claiming to have the Mexican people on their side, and abiding by international standards and calling for international oversight, the EZLN was setting itself up as a force to be reckoned with.

The EZLN called for better “work, land, housing, education,..., democracy, justice, and peace.”<sup>11</sup> Chiapas stands in stark contrast with much of Mexico as a whole. Sixty percent of the population in Chiapas lives in rural areas; in

---

7 “Early and Extensive Interview with Subcomandante Marcos,” Schools for Chiapas, May 1994, accessed May 17, 2015,

<http://schoolsforchiapas.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Interview-with-Subcomandante-Marcos.pdf>.

8 General Command of the EZLN, “First Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle: EZLN’s Declaration of War,” The Struggle Site, June 1993, accessed April 20, 2015, <http://struggle.ws/mexico/ezln/ezlnwa.html>.

9 Ibid.

10 Ibid.

11 General Command

comparison, only about half of that number inhabits rural areas in Mexico. Nearly thirty-one percent of Chiapas was illiterate, whereas only thirteen percent of Mexico as a whole was illiterate. Access to water, electricity, and other valuable resources was more limited in Chiapas (especially in some specific cities that the EZLN had taken control of) than in the rest of Mexico; however, Chiapas was a relatively resource-rich area with fertile land and petroleum, producing a large amount of Mexico's coffee and electricity. The wealth generated in Chiapas did not reach the indigenous people there.<sup>12</sup>

Over the eleven years following the first declaration, five more declarations were issued. The Second Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle, released just a few months after the first, reestablished the reasons for the group's purpose and to assert its success in maintaining "international conventions of war." Calling for government changes and for the people of Mexico to stand with the EZLN against the "bad government" and for democracy, the EZLN continued to show its determination in the face of strong military and political opposition.<sup>13</sup> Subsequent declarations continued to call for, and expand upon, the demands set forth prior while decrying the Mexican government's failure to follow through with its promises.

In February, 1996 the EZLN and the Mexican government gathered, with indigenous peoples, in order to reach an understanding. The San Andrés Accords were meant to form a "new relationship between indigenous peoples and the State." The Accords called for new policies to allow for greater indigenous participation in decision-making and the raising of standards of living for the indigenous peoples of Mexico.<sup>14</sup> Unfortunately, however, the process of getting the Accords put into effect legally was slow and fraught with problems. For example, President Ernesto Zedillo refused to accept the proposal as it

---

12 Edward J. Williams and Donald E. Schulz, eds., *Mexico Faces the 21st Century* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1995), 166.

13 CCRI-CG, "Second Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle," Wikisource, June 1994, accessed May 13, 2015, [http://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Second\\_Declaration\\_of\\_the\\_Lacandon\\_Jungle](http://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Second_Declaration_of_the_Lacandon_Jungle).

14 "Joint Declaration that the Federal Government and the EZLN shall submit to National Debating and Decision-Making Bodies," 16 February 1996, accessed May 16, 2015, United Nations, [http://peacemaker.un.org/document-search?field\\_pacountry\\_tid=mexico](http://peacemaker.un.org/document-search?field_pacountry_tid=mexico)

was; he wanted to make “minor” adjustments prior to approval. Any adjustments, however, would void the meaning of the proposal in the eyes of the EZLN and they withdrew from further talks in January of 1997.<sup>15</sup>

### “The War of Ink and Internet:” Subversion Through the Media

The emergence of the Internet in the early 1990s coincided perfectly with the rise of the EZLN. The Zapatistas utilized the fledgling technology to take their local news to the international stage and their survival was more than likely tied to this ability to communicate with a global audience.<sup>16</sup> When combined with the “heavy-handed response” of the Mexican government, the EZLN’s successful use of the media and Internet allowed for various groups from around the world to rally around the movement.<sup>17</sup> Beyond using the net and media attention to subvert the government, the EZLN has been influential in subverting the means of traditional guerrilla warfare. As Graham Fuller and his coauthors explain, the Zapatistas have demonstrated that the “old models of struggle,” of violently upending governments, is not necessarily the best way to create change in the “information age.”<sup>18</sup>

The EZLN’s use of the Internet and other media outlets has earned the conflict the title of “la guerra de tinta e Internet [the war of ink and internet],” as José Ángel Gurría described it in 1995.<sup>19</sup> The Mexican government had tried to isolate the EZLN and limit their coverage, but through the Internet and independent journalists the group has been successful in maintaining their “political connections” abroad.<sup>20</sup> Their “war of words, images, imagination and

---

15 Gemma van der Haar, “The Zapatista Uprising and the Struggle for Indigenous Autonomy,” *European Review of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*, no. 76 (April 2004): 101.

16 Jose Rabasa, *Without History: Subaltern Studies, the Zapatista Insurgency, and the Specter of History* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburg Press, 2010), 39.

17 Graham Fuller, David Ronfeldt, and John Arquilla, *The Zapatista Social Netwar in Mexico* (Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 1999), 3.

18 Graham Fuller, David Ronfeldt, and John Arquilla, *The Zapatista Social Netwar in Mexico* (Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 1999), 5.

19 Luis Hernández Navarro, “Chiapas: La Otra Guerra de Tinta e Internet,” *La Jornada*, December 1, 2009, accessed June 1, 2015 <http://www.jornada.unam.mx/2009/12/01/opinion/017a2pol>.

20 Harry Cleaver, “The Zapatistas and the Electronic Fabric of Struggle,” University of Texas at Austin, <http://la.utexas.edu/users/hcleaver/zaps.html> (accessed May 31, 2015)

organization” was integral to that success.<sup>21</sup> Outsiders posting and reposting every bit of available information have been helpful too. Everything from EZLN communiqués to official government reports to mainstream news articles are disseminated across the net, thus subverting official channels and biases. The use of the Internet has allowed for a more informed and capable audience in assessing the situation in Chiapas.<sup>22</sup> The EZLN’s use of eloquent rhetoric and the Web provides a useful tool for other revolutionary groups. As Kathleen Bruhn asserts, other organizations better versed in “military maneuvers than in writing may feel compelled to imitate the communications strategy of the EZLN.”<sup>23</sup>

While the Internet has been key for the EZLN, it should be noted that Chiapas is an impoverished region with virtually no internet access. The communiqués were generally written by hand and then passed on to someone with access to the Internet.<sup>24</sup> However, this does not diminish the impact that the Internet has had on the movement in regards to spreading the word and providing outside support, which were vital to the movement’s survival. Tim Golden, writer for the New York Times, asserts that “were it not for the Zapatistas' vocal partisans in the developed world that Mexico's leaders are so determined to join, the authorities might have crushed them long ago.”<sup>25</sup> Due to the EZLN’s ability to gain some popular support, particularly from abroad, the Mexican government would have faced a public relations nightmare had they crushed the group.

As previously mentioned, outside support has been crucial to the movement as well. Innumerable scholars, journalists, and even celebrities have been fascinated (and even endorsed) the EZLN, especially in the early years. For exam-

---

21 Ibid.

22 Ibid.

23 Kathleen Bruhn, “Antonio Gramsci and the Palabra Verdadera: The Political Discourse of Mexico’s Guerrilla Forces,” *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs* 41, no. 2 (Summer 1999): 51.

24 Juana Ponce de León, “Editor’s Note: Traveling Back for Tomorrow,” in *Our Word is Our Weapon: Selected Writings*, ed. Juana Ponce de León (New York: Seven Stories Press, 2002), xxiii.

25 Tim Golden, “Revolution Rocks: Thoughts of Mexico’s First Postmodern Guerilla Commander,” *New York Times*, April 8, 2001, (accessed May 16, 2015),

<https://www.nytimes.com/books/01/04/08/reviews/010408.08goldent.html>.



ple, Zack de la Rocha, vocalist of the popular American rap-metal band Rage Against the Machine, was an avid supporter of the Zapatistas, journeying to Chiapas in demonstrations of solidarity. He explained that in his numerous trips to the region, he has witnessed the isolation forced upon Chiapas as well as the government's failure to act accordingly, opting instead to send in troops. The musician recalled that when he organized a group of students, artists, and activists to go to Chiapas prior to the San Andrés Accords and there they saw the military buildup and intimidation of community members by government forces. Many of the band's songs reflect the Zapatista struggle and de la Rocha's experiences with the group.<sup>26</sup> Essential to the group's online presence and Internet appeal was Subcomandante Marcos.

### **A Face for the Faceless: Subversion and the Subcomandante**

Subcomandante Marcos was a key figure in some of the relative success the EZLN had in gathering support against the government. Edward Williams and Donald Schulz explain that the "charismatic ski-masked commando" became the EZLN's spokesman, and a folk hero.<sup>27</sup> Marcos' "skillfully deployed combination of self-effacing subordination to the community he serves and individual charisma" was the source of intrigue and admiration that surrounds him.<sup>28</sup> Marcos was a major component of the EZLN's propaganda machine and was responsible for many of the group's communiqués.<sup>29</sup>

On February 9, 1995, the Mexican government revealed "Marcos'" identity. In order to discredit the rebel's "mythic hero" status and subvert the EZLN's efforts, the government identified him as Rafael Sebastián Guillén Vicente, a former middle-class university professor from Mexico City—this was rather unsuccessful, however. Marcos was able to win back sympathy by "portraying himself as a victim" of the oppressive governmental forces.<sup>30</sup> In her examina-

---

26 "Interview with Zach, from Chiapas, Mexico."

27 Williams and Schulz, *Mexico Faces the 21st Century*, 12-3.

28 Beth Ellen Jorgensen, "Making History: Subcomandante Marcos in the Mexican Chronicle," *South Central Review* 21, no. 3 (Fall 2004): 85.

29 Golden, "Revolution Rocks."

30 Jorgensen, "Making History," 98-9.

tion of Juan Villoro's work, Beth Jorgensen noted that masks and legends are a crucial part of Mexican history, and often endure longer than the "realities that inspired them."<sup>31</sup> The man had been overshadowed by his mask.

"Marcos," however, was not the only *nom de guerre* utilized by the charismatic commando. With the launching of the Other Campaign in 2006, Marcos took on the role of Delegate Zero and toured Mexico.<sup>32</sup> John Ross described the campaign as an "anti-electoral crusade designed to weld the underclass struggle groups into a new left alliance," with Zero propelling himself into the spotlight once again during the electoral process; however, Ross argued that, due to the attention Zero had garnered, he was propelled into "the very class that the Other Campaign detests."<sup>33</sup>

Another *nom de guerre* was the result of a paramilitary assault on the autonomous community La Realidad on May 2, 2014—where a school and clinic were attacked—that left fifteen Zapatistas injured and one killed. The one killed was Jose Luis Solis Lopez, whose pseudonym was *Galeano*.<sup>34</sup> Subcomandante Marcos, and the EZLN leadership, concluded that the attack was premeditated and "cultivated from above," implicating the National Action Party (PAN), the Revolutionary Institutional Party (PRI), the Green Ecological Party (PRI branch that operated in Chiapas), and the paramilitary group CIOAC-Historica.<sup>35</sup> The paramilitary group ambushed the victims and brutally murdered Lopez.<sup>36</sup> On May 25, 2014 at approximately 2:00 am, Subcomandante Marcos "ceased to exist" so that Galeano may live on.<sup>37</sup> Marcos wrote, "to satisfy the impertinence that is death, in place of Galeano we

31 Ibid.

32 Ramor Ryan, "Zapatistas Launch 'Other' Campaign," *The Independent*, January 12, 2006, accessed May 20, 2015, <https://independent.org/2006/01/12/zapatistas-launch-other-campaign>.

33 John Ross, "The Delegate Zero Factor," *The San Francisco Bay Guardian*, May 17, 2006, accessed May 20, 2015, <http://www.sfbg.com/2006/05/17/delegate-zero-factor>.

34 Leonidas Oikonomakis, "Farewell Marcos, Long Live Subcomandante Galeano," *Roarmag*, May 26, 2014, accessed May 20, 2015, <http://roarmag.org/2014/05/subcomandante-marcos-steps-down-galeano/>.

35 Subcomandante Insurgente Marcos, "Pain and Rage," *Enlace Zapatista*, May 8, 2014, accessed May 20, 2015, <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2014/05/10/pain-and-rage/>.

36 Ibid.

37 Subcomandante Insurgente Marcos, "Between Light and Shadow," *Enlace Zapatista*, May 24, 2014, accessed May 20, 2015, <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2014/05/27/between-light-and-shadow/>.

put another name, so that Galeano lives and death takes not a life but just a name—a few letters empty of any meaning, without their own history or life.”<sup>38</sup>

Marcos and the EZLN command asserted the expendability of the persona of Marcos. By this point in time, another subcomandante had filled Marcos’ role as spokesman for the group. Subcomandante Insurgente Moisés, like Marcos, joined the EZLN in the mid-1980s and had a prominent role. Unlike Marcos, however, Moisés was an indigenous Tzeltal; Marcos was a mestizo.<sup>39</sup> Initially, Marcos was never meant to be a spokesperson; the EZLN did not intend to have a mestizo as their “face,” instead they had slated an indigenous Zapatista for the role, but he was killed. . Marcos then stepped up and took advantage of his “allure” to catapult the group into the spotlight, which did have its benefits; however, this also had the negative impact of intertwining Marcos and the movement to the point of them being inseparable.<sup>40</sup>

Marcos had served his purpose of drawing attention to the plight of the indigenous by being a faceless entity in which anyone could project themselves in order to sympathize with the movement. “One day Marcos’ eyes were blue, . . . green, . . . or black—all depending on who did the interview. . .”<sup>41</sup> Marcos could represent everybody and nobody at once, and that was his power; however, Marcos, as he explained, became a distraction, and that was one reason why that persona was eliminated and that of Galeano was taken in its place. While Marcos was a key in the EZLN’s subversion of the Mexican government, his prominent role and inadvertent fame partially subverted the group’s goals.

## Twenty Years On: Success or Failure?

The Zapatistas have made little progress outside of Chiapas in the last twenty-one years and various scholars and media outlets have pointed out the

---

38 Ibid.

39 Gloria Muñoz Ramirez, “EZLN Introduces New Subcomandante,” *Upside Down World*, February 16, 2013, accessed May 20, 2015, <http://upside-downworld.org/main/mexico-archives-79/4132-ezln-introduces-new-subcomandante->.

40 Oikonomakis, “Farewell Marcos, Long Live Subcomandante Galeano.”

41 Marcos, “Between Light and Shadow.”

increasing irreverence of Marcos and the EZLN; however, does that mean that the group has failed in its lofty goals? Bethaney Turner argued that the international support generated through the Internet does not guarantee significant changes in society, and the first decade of the EZLN's efforts had not "precipitated the radical reconstruction of the Mexican political system that they had hoped for."<sup>42</sup> Turner perceived the movement as having deflated over time, and was not alone in that assessment. Turner perceived the movement as having deflated over time, and was not alone in that assessment. Mihalis Mentinis argued that even though the EZLN have attracted a large amount of attention, there was little consensus on their efficacy.

Furthermore, according to Mentinis, the Zapatistas "have failed to bring about radical change, and have made little progress on their broader political agenda." Even in the first few years of the Zapatista movement, some have argued that the EZLN's "capacity for insurgency" and its "social network" were "past its peak."<sup>44</sup> Not everybody was content with this analysis. As Immanuel Wallerstein explained, it was much like the answer that Zhou Enlai was rumored to have provided as a response to the French Revolution: "It is too early to tell."<sup>45</sup>

Whether or not greater successes throughout Mexico will arise as a direct result of the Zapatistas is unknown, but the movement has been successful on a local level. As Marcos explained, "[t]he mere indisputable fact that the EZLN had not only not been weakened, much less disappeared, but rather had grown quantitatively and qualitatively would have been enough for any moderately intelligent mind to understand that, in these 20 years, something had changed within the EZLN and the communities."<sup>46</sup> The EZLN is still

42 Bethaney Turner, "Information-Age Guerrillas: The Communication Strategies of the Zapatistas," *M/C Journal* 8, no. 2 (June 2005), accessed June 7, 2015, <http://journal.media-culture.org.au/0506/01-turner.php>.

43 Mihalis Mentinis, *Zapatistas: The Chiapas Revolt and What It Means for Radical Politics* (London: Pluto Press, 2006), xii.

44 Fuller, Ronfeldt, and Arquilla, *The Zapatista Social Network in Mexico*, 4.

45 Immanuel Wallerstein, "What Have the Zapatistas Accomplished?" Immanuel Wallerstein, January 1, 2008, accessed June 7, 2015, <http://iwallerstein.com/what-have-the-zapatistas-accomplished/>.

46 Marcos, "Between Light and Shadow."

going twenty years later, which demonstrates some level of success. One of the greatest successes of the Zapatistas has come in the form of local, self-governing communities in Chiapas.

## **Bypassing the Government: Autonomous Communities**

After withdrawing from negotiations with the government in 2007 and with legal avenues effectively at an impasse, the EZLN moved forward with the creation of a system of self-governance, forming autonomous municipalities, regardless of Federal approval, thus subverting governmental dominion over the region. Gemma van der Haar explained that these autonomous municipalities serve not only as a form of more legitimized resistance, but as governmental structures to provide a system of justice, education, health care, economic development, and more in a flexible manner based on local conditions. These autonomous communities are made up of locally elected councils and each of the systems (e.g. education, healthcare) are managed by commissions made up of local peoples.<sup>47</sup> The EZLN helped establish autonomous indigenous communities when the government failed to follow through with promises it made.

These autonomous communities were able to form with some outside help. In a brief history of these autonomous zones, Subcomandante Marcos noted repeatedly that it was with the support of national and international civil societies that these communities could form. Marcos also explained, however, that the arrangement was not perfect and has its ups and downs; its own contradictions. Despite the problems, the autonomous communities—and the support of civil societies—helped improve the conditions, even if only a little, of normally excluded peoples (e.g. the indigenous, young persons, women, and a whole host of “others”).<sup>48</sup> Where the government failed in creating a better situation for the indigenous people, the EZLN helped form auton-

---

<sup>47</sup> van der Haar, 102-3.

<sup>48</sup> Subcomandante Insurgente Marcos, “Chiapas: La Treceava Estela, Quinta Parte: Una Historia,” *Enlace Zapatista*, July 2003, accessed May 16, 2015, <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2003/07/21/chiapas-la-treceava-estela-quinta-parte-una-historia/>.

mous communities. This not only garnered some support of the local peoples in Chiapas, but also more support nationally and internationally.

## **Conclusion**

The Zapatista Army of National Liberation's prolific use of the Internet and media as well as the allure of the enigmatic Subcomandante Marcos were key to their longevity and subversion. The establishment of autonomous communities were also immensely important and were arguably their greatest achievement. Internet usage and appeal had earned the early rebellion the title "The War of Ink and Internet," while many have claimed Marcos and the EZLN to represent the first "post-modern revolution." Despite not having accomplished a nation-wide revolution in Mexico, the Zapatistas have had some success at the local level for the indigenous people in Chiapas, which was a key motivation for the movement.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Bruhn, Kathleen. "Antonio Gramsci and the Palabra Verdadera: The Political Discourse of Mexico's Guerilla Forces." *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs* 41, no. 2 (Summer 1999): 29-55.
- Carrigan, Ana. "Chiapas: The First Post-Modern Revolution." *The Fletcher Forum* 19, no. 1 (1995): 72-98.
- CCRI-CG. "Second Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle." Wikisource. June 1994. Accessed May 13, 2015. [http://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Second\\_Declaration\\_of\\_the\\_Lacandon\\_Jungle](http://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Second_Declaration_of_the_Lacandon_Jungle).
- Cleaver, Harry. "The Zapatistas and the Electronic Fabric of Struggle." University of Texas at Austin. Accessed May 31, 2015. <http://la.utexas.edu/users/hcleaver/zaps.html>.
- Froehling, Oliver. "The Cyberspace 'War of Ink and Internet' in Chiapas, Mexico." *Geographical Review* 87, no. 2 (April 1997): 291-307.
- Fuller, Graham, David Ronfeldt, and John Arquilla. *The Zapatista Social Netwar in Mexico*. Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 1999.
- General Command of the EZLN. "First Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle: EZLN's Declaration of War." The Struggle Site. June 1993. Accessed April 20, 2015. <http://struggle.ws/mexico/ezln/ezlnwa.html>.
- Golden, Tim. "Revolution Rocks: Thoughts of Mexico's First Postmodern Guerilla Commander." *New York Times*. April 8, 2001. Accessed May 16, 2015. <https://www.nytimes.com/books/01/04/08/reviews/010408.08goldent.html>.
- Jorgensen, Beth Ellen. "Making History: Subcomandante Marcos in the Mexican Chronicle." *South Central Review* 21, no. 3 (Fall 2004): 85-106.
- Jung, Courtney. "The Politics of Indigenous Identity: Neoliberalism, Cultural Rights, and the Mexican Zapatistas." *Social Research* 70, no. 2 (Summer 2003): 439-40.
- Marcos. "Between Light and Shadow." *Enlace Zapatista*. May 24, 2014. Accessed May 20, 2015. <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2014/05/27/between-light-and-shadow/>.

- \_\_\_\_\_. “Chiapas: La Treceava Estela, Quinta Parte: Una Historia.” Enlace Zapatista. July 2003. Accessed May 16, 2015. <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2003/07/21/chiapas-la-treceava-estela-quinta-parte-una-historia/>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Pain and Rage.” Enlace Zapatista. May 8, 2014. Accessed May 20, 2015. <http://enlacezapatista.ezln.org.mx/2014/05/10/pain-and-rage/>.
- Mentinis, Mihalis. *Zapatistas: The Chiapas Revolt and What It Means for Radical Politics*. London: Pluto Press, 2006.
- Music Fan Clubs. “Interview with Zach, from Chiapas, Mexico.” Music Fan Clubs. July 7, 1998. Accessed April 18, 2015. <http://www.musicfanclubs.org/rage/articles/chiapas.html>.
- Navarro, Luis Hernández. “Chiapas: La Otra Guerra de Tinta e Internet.” La Jornada. December 1, 2009. Accessed June 1, 2015. <http://www.jornada.unam.mx/2009/12/01/opinion/017a2pol>.
- Oikonomakis, Leonidas. “Farewell Marcos, Long Live Subcomandante Galeano.” Roarmag. May 26, 2014. Accessed May 20, 2015. <http://roarmag.org/2014/05/subcomandante-marcos-steps-down-galeano/>.
- Ponce de León, Juana. “Editor’s Note: Traveling Back for Tomorrow,” in *Our Word is Our Weapon: Selected Writings*. Edited by Juana Ponce de León. New York: Seven Stories Press, 2002.
- Rabasa, Jose. *Without History: Subaltern Studies, the Zapatista Insurgency, and the Specter of History*. Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 2010.
- Radu, Michael. “Mexico: Slouching Toward Normality.” *The Washington Quarterly* 23, no. 3 (Summer 2000): 41-56.
- Ramirez, Gloria Muñoz. “EZLN Introduces New Subcomandante.” Upside Down World. February 16, 2013. Accessed May 20, 2015. <http://upside-downworld.org/main/mexico-archives-79/4132-ezln-introduces-new-subcomandante>.
- Ross, John. “The Delegate Zero Factor.” The San Francisco Bay Guardian. May 17, 2006. Accessed May 20, 2015. <http://www.sfbg.com/2006/05/17/delegate-zero-factor>.



- Ryan, Ramor. "Zapatistas Launch 'Other' Campaign." *The Independent*. January 12, 2006. Accessed May 20, 2015. <https://independent.org/2006/01/12/zapatistas-launch-other-campaign>.
- Schools for Chiapas. "Early and Extensive Interview with Subcomandante Marcos." *Schools for Chiapas*. May 1994. Accessed April 20, 2015. <http://schoolsforchiapas.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Interview-with-Subcomandante-Marcos.pdf>.
- Turner, Bethaney. "Information-Age Guerrillas: The Communication Strategies of the Zapatistas." *M/C Journal* 8, no. 2 (June 2005). Accessed June 7, 2015. <http://journal.media-culture.org.au/0506/01-turner.php>.
- United Nations. "Joint Declaration that the Federal Government and the EZLN shall submit to National Debating and Decision-Making Bodies." United Nations. February 16, 1996. Accessed May 16, 2015. [http://peacemaker.un.org/document-search?field\\_pacountry\\_tid=mexico](http://peacemaker.un.org/document-search?field_pacountry_tid=mexico).
- van der Haar, Gemma. "The Zapatista Uprising and the Struggle for Indigenous Autonomy." *European Review of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*, no. 76 (April 2004): 99-108.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. "What Have the Zapatistas Accomplished?" Immanuel Wallerstein. January 1, 2008. Accessed June 7, 2015. <http://iwallerstein.com/what-have-the-zapatistas-accomplished/>.
- Williams, Edward J., and Donald E. Schulz, eds. *Mexico Faces the 21st Century*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1995.



## *Origin Myth in Austronesian Language Speaking Tribes of Southeast Asia*

*By Cooper Peltz*

Spanning from the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century to the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, travelogue writers spun tales of Malayan and Dutch East Indian tribal savagery. These patrons of colonialism perceived the tribes' traditional stories as grotesque and uncivilized mythologies. One such myth was the story of the creation of man. The travelogue writers recounted story after story told by each tribe of how man came to be on the planet. One can see thematic similarities between the different tribal accounts of creation; however, many of the travelogue writers failed to recognize the similarities of the accounts. What stories did the Austronesian language speaking tribes of colonial British Malaya, the Dutch East Indies and the Spanish Philippines tell regarding the origin of man, and what did the travelogue writers think of these stories? I argue that the common themes between Malay language Southeast Asian creation myths of man-from-earth and man-from-tree developed from the 6,000-year evolution of the language. The travelogue writers were puzzled by where the myths had originated and deemed the myths abnormal.

The travelogues give the reader a rich cultural history of Southeast Asia not found in other texts; however, the information in the travelogues is limited by the writers' cultural bias. The bias is due to an incomplete understanding of Southeast Asian culture and language. The designation "Austronesian Language" is an umbrella term. Though this term seems simple, it actually includes the languages of tribes located eleven thousand miles apart. With the complexities of all of these languages, one would have a difficult time relaying an unbiased account of the Austronesian language speaking tribes' mythologies. As a researcher, one can transcend the inherently biased accounts of events written in the travelogues by acknowledging that the reports are biased. Additionally, one can study the bias in the documents to learn about the author

and his or her culture.

Though this paper is a study based on colonial travelogues from the 18<sup>th</sup> century, European nations began to colonize the rest of the world by the end of the 15<sup>th</sup> century. The Portuguese, Spanish, French, English, and Dutch were the major colonial powers. The Americas, Africa, and Asia all felt the European presence by the mid-16<sup>th</sup> century. The quick spread of colonialism was due in part to the stagnant European economy and intense political competition during the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> century. European imperialism was founded on the credence that non-European races were inferior to Europeans. Therefore, exploitation of other continents' people and resources was deemed acceptable. This theory of hegemony compelled the European nations to impose colonialism on Asian nations. A way for Europeans to reconcile their relationship with the East is now called "Orientalism." Orientalism is the basic belief that there is a clear difference between the Western world and the Eastern world.<sup>1</sup> To take ownership of their colonies, colonial powers renamed places in the colonies. The new names were meant to forcibly assimilate the new colony into the European empire.<sup>2</sup>

European colonialism was not the first time Southeast Asia underwent colonization.<sup>3</sup> However, European colonization may have been more coercive than earlier attempts at colonization. The type of coercion European colonizers used is called, "Anti-Conquest."<sup>4</sup> Anti-conquest is achieved by maintaining the façade of magnanimity while seizing control of another country. For European colonization of Southeast Asia, the anti-conquest was under the guise of civilizing barbarous Southeast Asia. For compensation, imperialists exploited Southeast Asian natural resources and laborers. Another justification for the subjugation of Southeast Asia was to spread Christianity to the region.<sup>5</sup> Starting around 1850, European powers applied more political authority on the Southeast Asian colonies. This development in relations shaped regional

---

1 Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1978), 2.

2 HAN Mui Ling, "From Travelogues to Guidebooks: Imagining Colonial Singapore, 1819-1940," *Sojourn* 18, no. 2 (2003): 267.

3 Nicholas Tarling, *A Concise History of Southeast Asia* (New York: Frederick A. Praeger, Publishers, 1966), 26.

4 Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992), 9.

5 Taufik Abdullah, "Asia and European Colonialism," *Asia Europe Journalism* 1, no.1 (2003): 68.

events for over a century.<sup>6</sup> Outright colonialism ended after World War II, though colonial effects can still be seen today.

## Origin of Man

Colonists recorded the origin myths of tribes in the Malay Peninsula and the Philippines. The tribal myths colonists wrote about contained similar motifs among each other. The first common theme in Austronesian language speaking tribal mythology is that man was created out of the Earth. The Mantras of the Malay Peninsula believed that the first magician and his brother were made out of “Handful of Earth” and “Drop of Water,” mother and father, respectively. The first magician learned how to propagate man on the Earth from the Lord of the Underworld.<sup>7</sup> To the predominantly Christian colonists the mention of the “Lord of the Underworld” brings forth visions of a red man with a pitchfork. But to this Malayan tribe, the Lord of the Underworld simply ruled over the land where their ancestors resided. Furthermore, this story did not have the religious connotations the Europeans put onto it. The underworld to the colonists represented something entirely different from the underworld of this story.

The Dyaks of British Sakarran had a similar man-from-earth myth. Dyak is the generic name for all tribes living in Borneo.<sup>8</sup> The Sakarran were made out to be villainous pirates and headhunters until the White Rajah, Sir James Brooke, took control of the tribe’s land. The Dyaks were prosperous under Brooke’s government. As a result of the widespread prosperity, tribal chiefs supported Brooke’s regime.<sup>9</sup> The Dyaks explained man’s origin in this way: the Supreme Being created two birds. The birds created man out of earth after trees and rocks were decided to be poor creative material. In the Dyaks’ story, man was not created by God, but by birds God had created. To the colonists

---

6 John Bastin and Harry J. Benda, *A History of Modern Southeast Asia: Colonialism, Nationalism, and Decolonization* (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1968), 34.

7 Walter William Skeat, *Pagan Races of the Malay Peninsula*, 2 (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1906), 336.

8 Mrs. McDougall, *Letters from Sarawak; Addressed to a Child: Embracing an Account of the Manners, Customs, and Religion of the Inhabitants of Borneo; The Progress of the Church Mission, and Incidents of Missionary Life Among the Natives* (London: Grant and Griffith, 1854), 68.

9 Frederick Boyle, *Adventures among the Dyaks of Borneo* (London: Hurst and Blackett, Publishers, 1865), 171.

this notion of indirect creation flies in the face of Christianity, where man was directly created by God and is God's chosen caretaker of the Earth; however, in the view of this tribe from Borneo, man is simply part of nature and not its overlord.

The third example of a man-from-earth myth came from a tribe on the Lundu River in Southwest Sarawak. The river Lundu is home to many Sea Dyaks, Chinese immigrants and Malays. The tribes of the area were welcoming of all ethnicities except the Sibuyas.<sup>10</sup> The tribe's creation story was thus: God, Batarata, created man. With dirt in his left hand he made woman and with the dirt in his right hand came man. The story was probably taken from the Malays, and it was the common story told by the neighboring tribes.<sup>11</sup>

The second motif of Austronesian language speaking tribal creation myths is that man was created from trees. The Kayan people of central Sarawak sang their creation story in a rhymed blank verse. The first two humans were born from the union of a large tree on the Earth and a creeper from the moon. These two humans, a male and female respectively, were incomplete. They did not have their lower half, so their entrails hung out the bottom. These two incomplete beings produce the first complete beings.<sup>12</sup> This creation myth also has a similarity with the creation myth of the Dyaks of Sakarran. In both stories, a process of events resulted in the creation of man. The process was a trial and error process in the Sakarran myth, and the process was one of incompleteness to completion in the Kayan myth.

A second man-from-tree myth was collected from the Visayan tribe of the Philippines. In this story, a vulture hovered over the Earth. He dove down to Earth and split a bamboo shoot. Out of this bamboo shoot came a man and

---

10 Spenser St. John, *Life in the Forests of the Far East; or Travels in Northern Borneo* (London: Smith, Elder and Co., 1863), 27.

11 Rodney Mundy, *Narrative of Events in Borneo and Celebes, Down to The Occupation of Labuan: From the Journals of James Brooke, Esq., Rajah of Sarawak, and Governor of Labuan, 1* (London: John Murray, 1848), 295.

12 Charles Hose and William McDougal, *The Pagan Tribes of Borneo: A Description of their Physical Moral and Intellectual Condition with some Discussion of their Ethnic Relations, 2* (New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912), 138.

a woman.<sup>13</sup> The Visayan myth has an aspect in common with the Sakarran myth as well. Both myths use birds as the active agent in the creation of man.

## Origin of Myth

Travelogue writers attempted to deduce the origin of the tribal myths they recounted. The colonists' theories were widely based on conjecture. Colonists believed that Austronesian language tribal myths were influenced by an unknown, outside source. Myths of the Malay Peninsula were categorized into two sections. The stories were either from a foreign source or from Indonesia itself.<sup>14</sup> Anthropologically speaking, the outside source described by the travelogue writers is 6,000 years of cultural development within Austronesian language speaking Southeast Asian communities. Pre-colonialism, the Malay Peninsula was ruled by multiple sultanates. The sultanates formed three distinct principalities after Britain began applying more control over the area in the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>15</sup> These sultanates most likely had contact with the tribes of the backwaters of the peninsula. Sultanate contact could have been the outside source that led to cultural exchange including an exchange of myths.

The common Austronesian linguistic ancestry provides a clue as to where the myths originated. The Austronesian language spread over Southeast Asia around 6,000 years ago. The spread of the language was due to a large-scale emigration from China. The Austronesian-speaking people spread from southern China to Taiwan and diffused throughout the Southeast Asian islands thereafter.<sup>16</sup> Therefore, myths of the Austronesian language speaking tribes of Southeast Asia could have their origin in China.

Common linguistic ancestry created a way for different myths to coalesce. The subgroup of Austronesian language spoken in Borneo, the Malay Peninsula

---

13 Fedor Jagor, "Jagor's Travels in the Philippines," in *The Former Philippines Thru Foreign Eyes*, edited by Austin Craig (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1917), 285.

14 R.J. Wilkinson, "Malay Literature," in *Twentieth Century Impressions of British Malaya: Its History, People, Commerce, Industries, and Resources*, edited by Arnold Wright (London: Lloyd's Greater Britain Publishing Company, LTD., 1908), 230.

15 Abdul Razak Baginda, "Remembering and Forgetting: Directions for Malaysia's Future," in *Memory and History in East and Southeast Asia*, edited by Gerrit W. Gong (Washington, D.C.: The CSIS Press, 2001), 136.

16 John Edward Terrell, "Introduction: 'Austronesian' and the Great Austronesian Migration," *World Archeology* 36, no. 4 (2004): 587.

and the Philippines is Western Malayo-Polynesian.<sup>17</sup> Western Malayo-Polynesian language speaking tribes settled in Borneo, specifically, thousands of years ago. More settlers arrived in Borneo sometime after the initial settling. These new groups contributed to the original settlers both culturally and linguistically. These two distinct waves of settlers had assimilated into one by the time of European colonialism.<sup>18</sup> Because of the common linguistic ancestry the multiple waves could successfully combine into one general culture. The general culture, however, had many subsets in the form of each specific tribe.

A parallel example of linguistic ancestry is seen in the evolution of Austroasiatic languages. On a slightly different branch of the linguistic family tree, Austroasiatic languages of Southeast Asia have been similarly studied. The Austroasiatic language is also spoken in the South Asian subcontinent.<sup>19</sup> The Austroasiatic myths vary per tribe. The myth variation is attributed to influences from neighboring civilizations. Other variations are attributed to environmental, social, and economic development of each group. Some myths explain why some tribes live in the mountains and others live near the ocean. When the myth is carried from one geographical location to another, it changes over time to suit the environment.<sup>20</sup> The theory of changing stories to suit environment can be applied to Austronesian language as well.

Though current anthropologists can trace the progression of myth through language throughout Southeast Asia, travelogue writers of the colonial period could only provide conjecture as to the origin of the tribal myths. One author purported that all Orientals are superstitious, but the “savage” tribes of Borneo have especially fanciful myths.<sup>21</sup> The travelogue writer did not see the traceable lines from one tribe’s myths to another tribe’s myths. The author’s inability to see the lines of descent could be aided by a racist view of “Orientals.”

17 Ross Clark, “Austronesian Languages,” in *The World’s Major Languages*, edited by Bernard Comrie (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 904.

18 Bernard Sellato and Peter Sercombe, “Borneo, Hunter-Gatherers, and Change,” in *Beyond the Green Myth: Borneo’s Hunter-Gatherers in the Twenty-First Century*, edited by Peter Sercombe and Bernard Sellato (Denmark: NIAS Press, 2007), 6.

19 Sanford B. Steever, “Tamil and the Dravidian Languages,” in *The World’s Major Language*, edited by Bernard Comrie (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 725.

20 Dang Nghiem Van, “The Flood Myth and the Origin of Ethnic Groups in Southeast Asia,” *The Journal of American Folklore* 106, no. 421 (1993): 304.

21 Philip C. Coote, *The Malay States* (London: A. & C. Black, LTD., 1923), 32.



Other writers perceived the commonalities between Southeast Asian myths. The people of Malay would take an idea from a European legend and work their own story to communicate the same idea. Thus, the Malay people created a new story with the same moral. Malay myth had influences from Arabian and Persian legends, Indian epics, and Javanese stories.<sup>22</sup> The similarities between outside cultures' myths and Malay myths led the travelogue writers to believe the Malay's stole indiscriminately from all cultures. Though the Malays did not steal from all cultures, they may have been in the practice of the reinterpretation and re-imagination of old Austronesian stories to make them new. The author saw that the tribal myths have influences, but he did not locate the correct birthplace of the myths.

An alternate argument for why similar motifs pop up in Austronesian tribal creation myths can be explained through mythology theory. Myth, itself, is supposed to be read synchronously. That is, multiple myths about the same subject are supposed to be read together. Though the stories are repetitive, they are not identical. Each story is meant to show another instance of overcoming a problem in a slightly different way. Because the premise is the same but the stories can change, there can be an infinite number of stories that attack the same premise. The justification for the repetitive nature of myth explains why there are so many myths that have to do with the creation of man in Southeast Asia. The tribes were simply attacking the question of how man came to be. The answer to this question came in the form of many slightly different myths. The synchronal theory is an alternative model to colonial missionary, Dr. Mason's Universal Revelation theory.<sup>23</sup> In similar form, the Israelites who wrote the book of Genesis came to the same questions the tribes of Southeast Asia did. Both peoples asked, "How did we get here?" The different tribes wrote different stories trying to answer the same premise.<sup>24</sup>

Myth theorist, Joseph Campbell, has written a plethora of books on my-

---

22 R.J. Wilkinson, "Malay Literature," in *Twentieth Century Impressions of British Malaya: Its History, People, Commerce, Industries, and Resources*, edited by Arnold Wright (London: Lloyd's Greater Britain Publishing Company, LTD., 1908), 229.

23 Albert Fytche, *Burma Past and Present with Personal Reminiscences of the Country*, 1 (London: C. Kegan Paul & Co., 1878), 166.

24 Claude Levi-Strauss, "The Structural Study of Myth," in *Myth: A Symposium*, edited by Thomas A. Sebeok (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1958), 105.

thology; however, his books show his research through the lens of a western worldview. He identifies the Jungian collective unconscious, and not ancestral linguistics, as the cause of the similar motifs in mythology. Furthermore, Campbell argues that myth is defined as religious in nature, having to do with cosmological and ontological insights. He relegates stories dealing with immediate history to the category of legends.<sup>25</sup> However, Campbell's definitions have an overt European cultural bias. In Austronesian language speaking tribes of Southeast Asia, stories of the origin of man are devoid of religiosity, but they still deal with cosmological and ontological quandaries.<sup>26</sup> Campbell's claims of universal Jungian myth structure are shown to be untrue when tested against the differing uses of myth in different world cultures.<sup>27</sup> Though the arguments set forth by Campbell are convincing, he argues from a Western standpoint. To be taken seriously, the theorist must argue from the specific Southeast Asian point of view.

## Connotations of Myth

Travelogue writers' views of the tribal myths were skewed by their western bias. Thus, the authors could not understand the function of tribal myth. Many Austronesian language tribal creation stories can be compared to the Biblical account of the creation of man, but they are not meant for the same effect. Most European Colonizers saw the tribal myths as barbaric and irreligious, however some of the myths did have the Biblical creation story's structure. The travelogue writers looked upon the myths that were close to Biblical text unfavorably, without realizing the similarities.

Borneo had many myths that deal with the origin of man, but they were not associated with religious teachings as in European thought. The stories did not provoke the listener to be changed after hearing the story, like the stories of the Bible. The stories were purely for literary effect and not for religious or

---

25 Joseph Campbell, *The Flight of the Wild Gander: Explorations in the Mythological Dimension* (New York: The Viking Press, 1969), 16.

26 Charles Hose and William McDougal, *The Pagan Tribes of Borneo: A Description of their Physical Moral and Intellectual Condition with some Discussion of their Ethnic Relations, 2* (New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912), 138.

27 Robert A. Segal, "Joseph Campbell's Theory of Myth," in *Sacred Narrative: Reading in the Theory of Myth*, edited by Alan Dundes (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984), 256.

scientific effect.<sup>28</sup> The colonizers could not comprehend this divorce of origin story and religion. What Europeans held as sacred was not the same as what the tribes from Borneo held sacred.

A parallel study of irreligious myth is found in northern Philippines. The Ifugao tribe of northern Philippines performs the Alim. The Alim is a ritualistic chant. The subject matter of the Alim can range from folk songs to mythology. The chant is only known to a few tribe members and is never performed for fun. Though the ritualism suggests that the Alim is part of a religion, it is not.<sup>29</sup> This ritual is an example of the divorce of ritualistic storytelling and religion.

Another parallel study of irreligious myth is of the Huaulu tribe. The Huaulu tribe of Seram has an exclusive recitation called the aitetukiniem. These narrative stories are sacred, but they are not religious. If the raconteur fumbles the story, it may cost him his life. The storytellers are the old men of the village. Old age is believed to put one in closer contact with the ancestors, and thus more in touch with the myth.<sup>30</sup> The aitetukiniem has a spiritual aspect, but it is not tied to religion. To an average colonial European, spirituality and religion were one in the same. Confronted with an alternative structure of spirituality, the colonists labeled the tribes as savages.

Myth is meant to put one's body and mind in sync. Myth keeps the mind in line with the body and the body in line with nature.<sup>31</sup> One can see the alignment of mind, body and nature in how the Austronesian language speaking tribes of Southeast Asia coexisted with nature. Since man was created from nature, man should respect nature as they do their mother. The tribes' coexistence with nature can be contrasted with what transpired in Europe during the same time period: the Industrial Revolution. Europeans were plundering the Earth of its resources. The Europeans subjugated the Earth where the tribes coexisted with the Earth. Europeans and Southeast Asian tribes per-

---

28 Charles Hose and William McDougal, *The Pagan Tribes of Borneo: A Description of their Physical Moral and Intellectual Condition with some Discussion of their Ethnic Relations*, 2 (New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912), 138.

29 Rosario Bona de Santos, "The Ifugao Alim: Chanted Narrated Dramatic Discourse in Ritual," *Humanities Diliman* 10, no. 1 (2013): 2.

30 Valerio Valeri, *The Forest of Taboos: Morality, Hunting, and Identity Among the Huaulu of the Moluccas* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2000), 192.

31 Joseph Campbell, *The Power of Myth* (New York: Doubleday, 1988), 70.

formed diametrically opposite actions. The opposing actions can be traced to the two cultures' mythology. In European mythology, man was the overlord of the Earth. In tribal mythology, man was the child of the Earth.

Missionaries attempted to inject religion into the myths of the Southeast Asian tribes. In Burma, missionaries Dr. and Mrs. Mason "worked hard to civilize" the Karens. The Karens were an ethnic group dispersed throughout Burma. Dr. Mason translated the Karen origin stories from, "Rude verses." The origin of man myths and traditions can be found in many ancient nations. Dr. Mason says that the source of these legends had to have come from a written source, and the only source could be the Old Testament. He deduces that they must have gotten these stories from Chinese Jews who had access to the Pentateuch, before the Karens emigrated from China. The author does not judge the stories of the Karens as quickly as Dr. Mason and allows for another explanation: A "Universal Revelation," which was given before the Jews' "Special Revelation," may have started the stories before the writing of the Old Testament.<sup>32</sup>

## European Travelogue Writers' Reaction

Along with recounting the tribal myths of Southeast Asia, the writers added their own analysis of the myths. The travelogue writers harbored contesting opinions about tribal creation myths. The tribal myths were widely regarded as uncultured; however, some writers argued the tribal myths had validity. The An Amok tribe was estimated to be the, "Lowest savages in the scale." This assessment was given after listening to their mythology.<sup>33</sup> Another author supplies his own mythology of the origin of man in Java. His myth masquerades as a scientific line of reasoning. He postulates that the aborigines did not have the brain function to develop the arts of divination and astrology until after contact with outside cultures. Before the clash of cultures their minds were primitive and, "Not much superior," to animals with no culture.<sup>34</sup> However,

---

32 Albert Fytche, *Burma Past and Present with Personal Reminiscences of the Country*, 1 (London: C. Kegan Paul & Co., 1878), 166.

33 J.F. McNair, *Perak and the Malays* (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press, 1972), 219.

34 Donald MacLaine Campbell, *Java: Past & Present: A Description of the Most Beautiful Country in the World, Its Ancient History, People, Antiquities, and Products*, 1 (London: William Heinemann, 1915), 12.

since the publication of the racist travelogue, anthropologists have discovered that Java had complex social structure, multiple variants of language, and hierarchical religious systems hundreds of years before coming into contact with other peoples.<sup>35</sup>

Conversely, some travelogue writers showed some understanding with a patronizing magnanimity. One author called the Malaccan tribe Sun-gie-ujong a rude nation; however, the author also said that their myths told “more or less” of what he called truth. He asserted that the stories should not be devalued because there was no historical evidence to refute what the tribesmen said.<sup>36</sup>

Furthermore, another writer criticizes humanity’s inability to explain something novel without comparing it to something the reader was familiar with. In travel writing an author said the sea was as blue as the Mediterranean and the reader had a frame of reference for the place the author was describing. Describing something relatively necessarily establishes the object the speaker was describing as unusual, rather than the normality the listener had experienced. This unusualness was many times deemed as strange, threatening, or uncivilized. Though the tribal expression of an idea was different, the idea itself was the same. The theory that one idea can have multiple expressions can be applied to the creation-of-man myth. While Europeans had a canonized story of how man was created that was different from the tribes of Southeast Asia, it did not mean that the Europeans and tribesmen were not aspiring to answer the same question. The man that created the myth saw the proliferation of his species and decided to find a way to explain how they came to exist.<sup>37</sup>

Austronesian language speaking tribes in Southeast Asia had many myths discussing the origin of man. Two clear motifs can be seen in the origin myths. The first motif is man-from-earth, and the second motif is man-from-tree. The similarities in motifs can be explained through the evolution of the Austronesian language.

---

35 M.C. Ricklefs, *War, Culture and Economy in Java: 1677-1726* (Sydney: Allen & Unwin, 1993), 4.

36 T.J. Newbold, *Political and Statistical Account of the British Settlements in the Straits of Malacca*, 2 (London: John Murray, 1839), 106.

37 Frank Athelstane Swettenham, ed., *Unaddressed Letters* (London: The Bodley Head, 1898), 259.

Travelogue writers of the colonial period wrote down the origin myths, including their own biases. Some travelogue writers saw these myths as savage, while other writers did not judge the stories so harshly.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Abdullah, Taufik. "Asia and European Colonialism." *Asia Europe Journalism* 1, no.1 (2003): 61-74.
- Baeten, Elizabeth M. *The Magic Mirror: Myth's Abiding Power*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996.
- Baginda, Abdul Razak. "Remembering and Forgetting: Directions for Malaysia's Future." In *Memory and History in East and Southeast Asia*, edited by Gerrit W. Gong, 134-146. Washington, D.C.: The CSIS Press, 2001.
- Bastin, John and Harry J. Benda. *A History of Modern Southeast Asia: Colonialism, Nationalism, and Decolonization*. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1968.
- Boyle, Frederick. *Adventures among the Dyaks of Borneo*. London: Hurst and Blackett, Publishers, 1865.
- Brocheux, Pierre and Daniel Hemery. *Indochina: An Ambiguous Colonization: 1858-1954*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009.
- Campbell, Donald MacLaine. *Java: Past & Present: A Description of the Most Beautiful Country in the World, Its Ancient History, People, Antiquities, and Products*, 1. London: William Heinemann, 1915.
- Campbell, Joseph. *The Flight of the Wild Gander: Explorations in the Mythological Dimension*. New York: The Viking Press, 1969.
- Campbell, Joseph. *The Power of Myth*. New York: Doubleday, 1988.
- Clark, Ross. "Austronesian Languages." In *The World's Major Languages*, edited by Bernard Comrie, 901-911. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Coote, Philip C. *The Malay States*. London: A. & C. Black LTD., 1923.
- De Santos, Rosario Bona. "The Ifugao *Alim*: Chanted Narrated Dramatic Discourse in Ritual." *Humanities Diliman* 10, no. 1 (2013): 1-43.
- Endicott, Karen L. and Kirk M. Endicott. *The Headman was a Woman: The Gender Egalitarian Batek of Malaysia*. Long Grove: Waveland Press, Inc., 2008.

- Flytche, Albert. *Burma Past and Present with Personal Reminiscences of the Country*, 1. London: C. Kegan Paul & Co., 1878.
- Hose, Charles and William McDougal. *The Pagan Tribes of Borneo: A Description of their Physical, Moral and Intellectual Condition with some Discussion of their Ethnic Relations*, 2. New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912.
- Jagor, Fedor. "Jagor's Travels in the Philippines." In *The Former Philippines Thru Foreign Eyes*, edited by Austin Craig, 285. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1917.
- Levi-Strauss, Claude. "The Structural Study of Myth." In *Myth: A Symposium*, edited by Thomas A. Sebeok, 81-106. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1958.
- Ling, HAN Mui. "From Travelogues to Guidebooks: Imagining Colonial Singapore, 1819-1940." *Sojourn* 18, no. 2 (2003): 257-278.
- McDougall, Mrs. *Letters from Sarawak; Addressed to a Child: Embracing an Account of the Manners, Customs, and Religion of the Inhabitants of Borneo; The Progress of the Church Mission, and Incidents of Missionary Life Among the Natives*. London: Grant and Griffith, 1854.
- McNair, J.F. *Perak and the Malays*. Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press, 1972.
- Mundy, Rodney. *Narrative of Events in Borneo and Celebes, Down to The Occupation of Labuan: From the Journals of James Brooke, ESQ., Rajah of Sarawak, and Governor of Lebaun*, 1. London: John Murray, 1848.
- Newbold, T.J. *Political and Statistical Account of the British Settlements in the Straits of Malacca, vol. II*. London: John Murray, 1839.
- Osborne, Milton. *Southeast Asia: An Introductory History*. South Leonards: Allen & Unwin, 1997.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. London: Routledge, 1992.



- Ricklefs, M.C. *War, Culture and Economy in Java: 1677-1726*. Sydney: Allen & Unwin, 1993.
- Roth, Henry Ling. *The Natives of Sarawak and British North Borneo: Based Chiefly on the MSS. Of the Late Hugh Brook Low Sarawak Government Service*, 1. London: Trustlove & Hanson, 1896.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books, 1978.
- Segal, Robert A. "Joseph Campbell's Theory of Myth." In *Sacred Narrative: Reading in the Theory of Myth*, edited by Alan Dundes, 256-269. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984.
- Sellato, B. and P.G. Sercombe. "Borneo, Hunter-Gatherers, and Change." In *Beyond the Green Myth: Borneo's Hunter-Gatherers in the Twenty-First Century*, edited by Peter Sercombe and Bernard Sellato, Denmark: NIAS Press, 2007.
- Skeat, Walter William. *Pagan Races of the Malay Peninsula*, 1. New York: The Mac Millan Company, 1906.
- Skeat, Walter William. *Pagan Races of the Malay Peninsula*, 2. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1906.
- St. John, Spenser. *Life in the Forests of the Far East; or Travels in Northern Borneo*. London: Smith, Elder and Co., 1863.
- Swettenham, Frank Athelstane, ed. *Unaddressed Letters*. London: The Bodley Head, 1898.
- Tarling, Nicholas. *A Concise History of Southeast Asia*. New York: Frederick A. Praeger, Publishers, 1966.
- Terrell, John Edward. "Introduction: 'Austronesian' and the Great Austronesian Migration." *World Archeology* 36, no. 4 (2004): 586-590.
- Valeri, Valerio. *The Forest of Taboos: Morality, Hunting, and Identity Among the Huaulu of the Moluccas*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2000.

Van, Dang Nghiem. "The Flood Myth and the Origin of Ethnic Groups in Southeast Asia." *The Journal of American Folklore* 106, no. 421 (1993): 304-337.

Wilkinson, R.J. "Malay Literature." In *Twentieth Century Impressions of British Malaya: Its History, People, Commerce, Industries, and Resources*, edited by Arnold Wright, 230. London: Lloyd's Greater Britain Publishing Company LTD., 1908.





## *A Complicated Legacy: The Battle Of Bataan In U.S. Cold War Propaganda*

*By Solange Kiehlbauch*

On April 14, 1959, the United States Information Agency issued a patriotic poster in the Philippines commemorating the anniversary of the Battle of Bataan. “Seventeen years ago today,” it read, “Filipino and American soldiers... heroically fought side by side to preserve the common ideals of freedom and democracy.”<sup>1</sup> This message was surrounded by imagery invoking a sense of brotherhood between the two nations – American and Filipino flags waving proudly side-by-side, photographs of marching troops clad in full regalia, and the decorated caskets of soldiers from both sides.<sup>2</sup> With these mixed images of glory, loss, and camaraderie, the United States sought to remind Filipino citizens of the Battle of Bataan in order to “rekindle in our hearts the significance of life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness.”<sup>3</sup> In examining the historical context of this poster, its underlying message becomes clear: by commemorating a battle that, although technically a major loss, inspired collaboration with the U.S. and the defense of American values such as democracy and freedom, the United States hoped to preserve its increasingly strained relationship with the Philippines in the wake of communist threats, nationalist fervor, and social unrest that emerged in the late 1950s.

The Battle of Bataan was fought between allied Filipino and American forces against the Japanese during the beginning phases of World War II in the Pacific. On December 24, 1941, U.S. General Douglas MacArthur declared the Philippine capital, Manila, a demilitarized open city and began to withdraw his troops to the narrow peninsula of Bataan as a defensive strategy.

---

1 “Bataan Day Poster – 1959,” April 14, 1959, The National Archives Catalog, [https://catalog.archives.gov/id/6948935?q=:\\*Bataan#.Vmfna8Da8.link](https://catalog.archives.gov/id/6948935?q=:*Bataan#.Vmfna8Da8.link).

2 Ibid.

3 Ibid.

Despite the region's geographic disadvantages (it was essentially a cul-de-sac that trapped MacArthur's forces), Bataan possessed a rugged countryside ideal for defense, in addition to stockpiled ammunition, medical supplies, and provisions that MacArthur had gathered in preparation for a siege.<sup>4</sup> These provisions proved to be inadequate; however, and soldiers were forced to live on half-rations that barely kept them from starvation. On January 9, 1942, Japanese forces under General Homma Masaharu attacked Bataan in what they assumed would prove an easy victory, but MacArthur's troops managed to neutralize this first attack after a month of fighting. On March 11, President Franklin D. Roosevelt ordered MacArthur to evacuate the Philippines, leaving command of his troops to Maj. General Jonathan Wainwright. Wainwright realized the situation was hopeless, as his troops were near starvation and the promised aid had not arrived. When the Japanese re-launched their attack on April 3<sup>rd</sup>, Wainwright commanded a predictably futile counteroffensive before his front-line commander, Maj. Gen. Edward King, surrendered on April 9<sup>th</sup> rather than witness the senseless slaughter of his men.<sup>5</sup>

The tragedy of Bataan was far from over. After King's surrender, 78,000 Filipino and American soldiers became prisoners of the Japanese, who forced them to march approximately sixty miles to a captured American prison camp in what became known as the Bataan Death March.<sup>6</sup> The Death March was the result of four major conditions: the weak physical state of American and Filipino troops, the unpreparedness of the Japanese to receive them, the "contempt" in which Japan's military held its prisoners, and the "cruelty and callousness" of the average Japanese soldier.<sup>7</sup> Soldiers were forced to march continuously through hot and hostile jungle terrain, denied food and water, routinely beaten, and executed for collapsing or falling behind, among other forms of horrific abuse. Because the ancient Japanese warrior code, known

---

4 Alan Axelrod and Jack A. Kingston, *Encyclopedia of World War II* (New York: Facts on File, 2007), sv. "Bataan, Fall of," 152.

5 Ibid.

6 Axelrod and Kingston, 150.

7 Stanley L. Falk, introduction to *Bataan Death March: A Survivor's Account*, by William E. Dyess (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002), ix.

as Bushido, regarded surrender as dishonorable, such mistreatment was condoned and even encouraged against prisoners. General Homma was later tried for war crimes after his surrender to the U.S. in 1945, but not without ruthlessly claiming the lives of between 7,000 and 10,000 Filipino and American soldiers lost in battle.<sup>8</sup> The Battle of Bataan, therefore, resulted not only in defeat, but also in a sizeable and tragic loss of life.

The Battle of Bataan was a military defeat of spectacular proportions – an unnecessary tragedy born from overconfidence and carelessness.<sup>9</sup> Why then, would the U.S. seek to rekindle this memory in the Philippines? Despite the fact that Bataan was technically a failure, it served a far more complex symbolic value within the historical memory of both Filipinos and Americans. The soldiers at Bataan, although technically part of the U.S. Army, were in reality over eighty-five percent Filipino. Despite the disadvantages of youth, poor training, and inadequate supplies, these men willingly went to war against the Japanese alongside the U.S. to protect their shared values of liberty and happiness.<sup>10</sup> For Filipinos, the Battle of Bataan was not only a physical struggle; it also represented an ideological battle against Japanese Occupation and its resulting hardship and oppression. According to Antonio Nieva, a Filipino Bataan veteran and survivor of the Death March, in the years of WWII the Battle of Bataan represented an “unofficial yet very real national shrine in the hearts of the Filipinos,” and even in defeat, its soldiers were regarded as a “personification of valor.”<sup>11</sup> Thus, the Battle of Bataan entered the canon of historical memory as a testament of bravery, freedom, and democracy. In his article on the Philippine experience of WWII, Ricardo José discusses the nuances of historical memory and how past events such as Bataan are remembered within the shifting narratives of past and present. According to José, war memories are determined more by one’s present-day perceptions rather

---

8 Axelrod and Kingston, 151.

9 Donald J. Young, *The Battle of Bataan: A Complete History* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 2009), 5-6.

10 Young, 6, 9.

11 Antonio A. Nieva, *The Fight for Freedom: Remembering Bataan and Corregidor* (Quezon City, Philippines: New Day, 1997), ix.

than shadows of the past.<sup>12</sup> In 1959, therefore, when the United States issued a commemorative poster marking the anniversary of the Battle of Bataan, they chose to remember the battle not as a defeat, but as a poignant symbol of brotherhood between the Philippines and America, when these two nations came together to defend their common values of freedom and democracy.<sup>13</sup> In 1959, preserving and promoting such an image became critical in the wake of social unrest and anti-U.S. sentiments that emerged in the Philippines.

The first major period of turmoil prior to 1959 was the Huk Rebellion – two separate peasant-based struggles against foreign involvement in the Philippines.<sup>14</sup> The first phase of this movement began in 1942, when officers of the Communist Party of the Philippines (PKP) and peasant guerillas from Central Luzon established the People’s Anti-Japanese Liberation Army, or Huk-balahap, to organize resistance against Japanese Occupation.<sup>15</sup> By the middle of 1942, 625,800 Japanese soldiers were stationed in the Philippines, where they controlled the population through propaganda, forced labor, starvation, torture, and other violations of basic human rights.<sup>16</sup> The Filipino Huk campaign, combined with U.S. military aid, proved successful in overthrowing their oppressors, and Japan surrendered to the Allies on September 2, 1945.<sup>17</sup> The second phase of the Huk Rebellion took a more sinister turn towards the United States. On January 4, 1946, the U.S. established the Philippine Republic, which reinforced its colonial relationship with the Philippines under the guise of granting independence. Reluctant to abandon its interests in the Pacific, the U.S. persuaded Philippine leaders to accept postwar aid in return for permitting the establishment of military bases and parity rights for Amer-

---

12 Ricardo T. José, “War and Violence, History and Memory: The Philippine Experience of the Second World War,” in *Contestations of Memory in Southeast Asia*, ed. Roxana Waterson and Kwok Kian-Woon (Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 2012), 186.

13 “Bataan Day Poster.”

14 Vina A. Lanzona, *Amazons of the Huk Rebellion: Gender, Sex, and Revolution in the Philippines* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2009), 6.

15 *Ibid.*, 37.

16 *Ibid.*, 32.

17 *Ibid.*, 37.



ican companies operating freely in the country.<sup>18</sup> In order to create a sense of normalcy, therefore, the new state “restored prewar political and economic institutions that reinforced Philippine dependence on the US in economic, political, and military terms.”<sup>19</sup> The Huks responded to these oppressive attempts to restore pre-war land arrangements by reorganizing under a new name – the People’s Liberation Army, or HMB – and mobilizing the peasantry to fight against imperial influence once more.<sup>20</sup> The HMB was formed, according to the party, “by the people because of the people,” with the aim of resisting the American imperialists and the feudal policies that had led to the suffering of millions of farmers.<sup>21</sup> They rapidly gained support from 1946-1950, eventually increasing their number to twenty thousand armed soldiers.<sup>22</sup>

Besides posing a direct threat to their presence, the Huk rebellion was particularly unsettling to the U.S. because the movement’s history was heavily influenced by Communism – a highly concerning detail given existing Cold War anxieties.<sup>23</sup> Most of the Huk leaders were also high-ranking PKP leaders, communist ideology was circulated among its followers, and their practical goals, such as extension of land ownership and a larger share of the crop among peasants, were exemplary of such an ideology.<sup>24</sup> To Americans and the closely entwined Philippine government, this promise of a communist society not only explained the success of the movement – it represented a significant threat to the political order.<sup>25</sup> With the rise of communism in China and Vietnam, the U.S. became determined to staunch its spread to the Philippines, which, because of the rapidly growing strength of the HMB, was seen as “the weakest link in their Asian offshore island of defense.”<sup>26</sup> Consistent with Cold

---

18 Lanzona., 79.

19 Ibid.

20 Ibid., 77.

21 Ibid., 82.

22 Ibid., 7.

23 Ibid., 80.

24 Ibid., 80, 82.

25 Lanzona, 82.

26 Renato Constantino and Letizia R. Constantino, *The Philippines: The Continuing Past* (Quezon City, Philippines: The Foundation for Nationalist Studies, 1978), 223.

War policy, therefore, the Philippine and U.S. governments demonized the Communist Party and began instating a military program to defeat the rebels.<sup>27</sup>

As part of their plan to reinstate power over the Philippines, the U.S. helped install Ramon Magsaysay to the presidency on December 30, 1953. In return for this aid, Magsaysay served as a political puppet for the U.S., vowing to protect American investment interests in the Philippines and smother the rising tide of nationalism.<sup>28</sup> By the late 1950s, he had fulfilled their joint goal of suppressing the Huks through land reform programs and military repression.<sup>29</sup> He also approved efforts to protect American economic interests in the Philippines, such as safeguarding trade and investment privileges.<sup>30</sup> All seemed to be going relatively well for the U.S., until March 17, 1957, when Magsaysay died in an accidental plane crash, and the conservative Nacionalista candidate Carlos P. Garcia won the subsequent election.<sup>31</sup> Unlike other Philippine presidents, Garcia owed nothing to the U.S. for his election, and was thus independent-minded rather than loyal to the Americans.<sup>32</sup> Furthermore, he was sympathetic to the Filipino nationalist movement. Within a few months of his installment, Garcia had instituted a number of policies that deeply troubled American authorities, the most important of which was an economic resolution known as the Filipino First policy. On August 21, 1958, the Philippine National Economic Council adopted a resolution which “[encouraged] Filipinos to engage in enterprises and industries vital to the economic growth, stability, and security of the country,” with the eventual goal of attaining a “substantial share of the commerce and industry of the country.”<sup>33</sup> The American media responded to this threat by issuing a propa-

---

27 Lanzona, 7.

28 William J. Pomeroy, *The Philippines: Colonialism, Collaboration, and Resistance!* (New York: International, 1992), 210.

29 Lanzona, 7.

30 Pomeroy, 209.

31 *Ibid.*, 215, 217.

32 *Ibid.*, 217.

33 Pomeroy, 217-218.

ganda campaign against Garcia. *Time* and *Life* magazines, for example, both of which were widely circulated in the Philippines, depicted the president as a “nonentity who had stepped into the man-sized shoes of the Philippine National Hero Ramon Magsaysay.”<sup>34</sup> In addition, a U.S. News and World Report published in February 27, 1959 attacked the Filipino First policy as “extreme nationalism” and indistinguishable from communist propaganda.<sup>35</sup> Ironically, therefore, the U.S. fear of Filipino nationalism that emerged during the Cold War had strengthened the very force that it sought to suppress.

In examining the historical context of early 1959, it becomes clear what message the U.S. hoped to achieve by commemorating the seventeenth anniversary of the Battle of Bataan. In the time this poster was produced, the Philippines was in a state of political and social upheaval. The nationalist policies of President Carlos Garcia and the communist uprising of the HMB posed a severe threat to U.S. interests in the Philippines, especially when combined with Cold War anxieties. By the time the Cold War deepened, Filipinos had grown increasingly disillusioned with the United States. Instead of viewing the U.S. as allies who had fought beside them to overthrow Japanese oppression, Americans were increasingly depicted as “selfish imperialists” who had plunged the Philippines into war to serve their own interests and promote their own ideals of freedom and democracy.<sup>36</sup> The commemoration of the Battle of Bataan during this troubled time is an example of the purposeful manipulation of historical memory – the remembrance of one story rather than another.<sup>37</sup> By promoting Bataan as a symbol of Filipino–American unity and sacrifice, such propaganda downplayed the empty promises of aid and selfish errors of MacArthur that resulted in defeat; instead, it served to strengthen Filipino faith in the United States.<sup>38</sup> In the wake of growing communist and nationalist insurgence, bolstering such faith was imperative to maintaining ties between the U.S. and the Philippines.

---

34 Ibid., 219.

35 Ibid.

36 José, 187.

37 Roxana Waterson and Kwok Kian-Woon, *Contestations of Memory in Southeast Asia* (Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 2012), 2.

38 Constantino, 50–51.

In reality, however, this goal was far more nuanced, for the Bataan-Corregidor defense created a legend not of American-Filipino unity but of Filipino loyalty to the U.S.<sup>39</sup> Despite its noble front, American involvement in the Philippines was based not on protecting the interests of the Filipino people, but on “preserving U.S. interests that Filipinos were expected to defend.”<sup>40</sup> The 1959 poster commemorating the seventeenth Battle of Bataan is a prime example of this pseudo-brotherhood. By promoting the united defense of freedom and democracy, this poster sought to bolster Filipino support of the U.S. in order to preserve their own interests during in the upsurge of nationalist fervor that threatened to loosen their control.

The Battle of Bataan holds a complicated legacy within the shifting canon of historical memory. Although Bataan was technically a defeat with sizeable and tragic losses, it emerged as a symbol of brotherhood between the U.S. and the Philippines as they united in defense of freedom and democracy. The 1959 poster commemorating the seventeenth anniversary of Bataan capitalizes on this legacy, highlighting the courage, unity, and common values of soldiers from both nations. Promoting this idealized image of U.S.-Filipino relations became necessary during the Cold War, when the foreign threat of communism spread to the Philippines during the Huk Rebellion. When Huk insurgents turned against the increasingly imperialistic United States during the second phase of the rebellion, Americans became especially alarmed. The rise of nationalist sentiment and anti-U.S. policies during the Garcia administration only furthered this anxiety. As part of their attempt to bolster their relations and preserve their interests in the Philippines, the U.S. issued propaganda such as this poster to remind Filipinos of their former unity and common sacrifice. By memorializing the Battle of Bataan as a noble campaign where Filipino and American soldiers marched together in defense of freedom, the United States hoped to utilize historical memory as a tool to preserve their continued presence in the Philippines.

---

39 Pomeroy, 107.

40 Ibid.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Axelrod, Alan and Jack A. Kingston. *Encyclopedia of World War II*. New York: Facts on File, 2007.
- Constantino, Renato and Letizia R. Constantino. *The Philippines: The Continuing Past*. Quezon City, Philippines: The Foundation for Nationalist Studies, 1978.
- Falk, Stanley L. Introduction to *Bataan Death March: A Survivor's Account*, by William E. Dyess, xi-xxx. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002.
- José, Ricardo T. "War and Violence, History and Memory: The Philippine Experience of the Second World War." In *Contestations of Memory in Southeast Asia*, edited by Roxana Waterson and Kwok Kian-Woon, 185-200. Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 2012.
- Lanzona, Vina A. *Amazons of the Huk Rebellion: Gender, Sex, and Revolution in the Philippines*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2009.
- Nieva, Antonio A. *The Fight for Freedom: Remembering Bataan and Corregidor*. Quezon City, Philippines: New Day, 1997.
- Pomeroy, William J. *The Philippines: Colonialism, Collaboration, and Resistance!*. New York: International, 1992.
- Waterson, Roxana and Kwok Kian-Woon, eds. *Contestations of Memory in Southeast Asia*. Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 2012.
- Young, Donald J. *The Battle of Bataan: A Complete History*. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 2009.



# *The Historiography of Queen Victoria: On the Threshold of Private Psychoanalysis and Public Feminism*

By *Rebecca Willis*

Queen Victoria was one of the longest rulers in history, and one of the few British women to carry a nation from near revolution to empire in the course of her lifetime. With such an impressive longevity, the Queen saw many events pass by, and experienced many important landmarks in her own life as well. Living through so much rich history, she was one of the most documented monarchs. In this paper, I will critique the historiography of Queen Victoria's life. Too many historians use the psychohistorical method to describe her life; a feminist method is necessary for a new and more accurate historiography.

Commentary, however biased or politicized, was essential to the historicizing of Queen Victoria's life. Most biographers from the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries tend to cover her life from a psychoanalytic approach.<sup>1</sup> Her childhood, marriage, children, and relationship to men are all key factors of her life. Published newspaper articles, political cartoons, portraits, and children's books during her reign in the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century depict her as a political puppet, as a stubborn, crotchety old woman, as a naive ingénue, as an attractive bride,

---

1 Lytton Strachey, *An Eminent Illustrated Biography: Queen Victoria* (London: Harcourt Brace, 1921); John Raymond, ed. *Queen Victoria's Early Letters* (New York, Macmillan, 1963); Philip Guedalla, *The Queen and Mr. Gladstone* (New York: Doubleday, 1969); Cecil Woodham-Smith, *Queen Victoria: From her Birth to the Death of the Prince Consort* (New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 1972); Alison Plowden, *The Young Victoria*, (New York: Stein and Day, 1983); Kate Williams, *Becoming Queen Victoria* (New York: Ballantine Books, 2008); Andrew Marr, *The Making of Modern Britain: from Queen Victoria to VE Day* (London: Pan Books, 2010); Matthew Dennison, *Queen Victoria: A Life of Contradictions* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2013); A.N. Wilson, *Victoria: A Life*, (New York: Penguin Press, 2014).

and as a worthy symbol of Britain.<sup>2</sup> Historians such as Dennison, Kinzler, Plowden, Ward, Williams, Wilson, and even screenwriter Fellowes, argued that Victoria was a vivacious spirit who loved her husband, but kept the upper hand over his influence, and mourned his death with in full sanity.<sup>3</sup> These psychohistorians blamed her character flaws on her structured and sheltered childhood, and on the moral views of Victorian England in terms of marriage and death, to which she entertained for the sake of the people she represented.<sup>4</sup> Other historians, mainly men from the 20<sup>th</sup> century such as Bolitho, Guedalla, Raymond, Strachey, Woodham-Smith, and those who edited her published letters and journals posthumously, viewed Victoria as a weak, confused, stubborn, and sometimes mad woman who had to be led her entire life by men who helped her make decisions.<sup>5</sup> Her paramount role as a wife and mother was lost too soon in the untimely death of her husband, after which she was constantly in a state of depression, being an increasingly ineffective monarch until her death.<sup>6</sup>

Queen Victoria's biographies are told with a psychohistory historiographical view in mind, yet they all seem to differ in various ways. There are certain events throughout her reign that have different causes and effects, depending on the historian's view and how they choose to portray Victoria: her childhood, ascension to the throne, marriage, motherhood, and death of her hus-

2 Samuel G. Goodrich, *Peter Parley's Visit to London during the Coronation of Queen Victoria* (London: Charles Tilt, 1839); James Bromley, *Queen Victoria* (London: National Public Gallery, 1834); Margaret Homans and Adrienne Munich, ed., *Remaking Queen Victoria* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997); Henry Tanworth, *Queen Victoria Receiving News of Her Accession to the Throne*. (National Public Gallery, 1880); Yvonne M. Ward, *Censoring Queen Victoria: How Two Gentlemen Edited a Queen and Created an Icon* (London: Oneworld, 2014).

3 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208; Julia Kinzler, "Visualising Victoria: Gender, Genre and History in The Young Victoria (2009)" (*Neo-Victorian Studies*, 2011), Accessed October 20, 2015, [http://www.neovictorianstudies.com/past\\_issues/4-2%202011/NVS%204-2-3%20J-Kinzler.pdf](http://www.neovictorianstudies.com/past_issues/4-2%202011/NVS%204-2-3%20J-Kinzler.pdf); Plowden, *Young Victoria* 1-288; Ward, *Censoring*, 1-224; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; *The Young Victoria*, Directed by Jean-Marc Vallee, Written by Julian Fellowes (London: GK, 2009).

4 *Ibid*, et al.

5 Hector Bolitho, *Albert, Prince Consort* (New York, Bobbs-Merrill, 1964); Guedalla, *Mr. Gladstone*, 1-192; John Raymond, ed. *Queen Victoria's Early Letters* (New York, Macmillan, 1963); Strachey, *Illustrated Biography* 1-232; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 1-495.

6 *Ibid*, et al.



band each touch on childhood, sexual adolescence and maturity. Most, however, do not object to the fact that Victoria did live up to the standard of model Victorian womanhood.<sup>7</sup> Most authors, however deeply they attempt to plunge into her psyche, confirmed she was exactly as the media tends to portray her: a simpering flirt turned regal mother, then batty widow.<sup>8</sup> Psychohistory may bring new light to historical details, but overall they have not succeeded in cracking the porcelain image of the regal Queen Victoria.

Psychohistory is a method of historiography that is based in psychoanalysis<sup>9</sup> Freud, as originator/creator/etc. of psychoanalysis, argued that a person's Id, or natural instincts, was under a state of repression from the Superego; civilization's conception of morality and ethics imposed by a child's parents, internalized as they mature, and that a resolution of these desires was needed through sex, repression, or creativity.<sup>10</sup> The main tenets of Freud's psychoanalysis relied on four characteristics: Childhood influences adult behavior, stages of development, that adult behavior was guided by the unconscious, and that adult behavior could be narrowed down to psychological conflict.<sup>11</sup> Therefore, facts about the person's childhood and development into adulthood were essential to write their psychobiography or conduct proper psychoanalysis. Further psychologists would take his work into modern fields of social science, including history.

Freud's work paved the way for modern psychology, but Erik Erikson applied Freudian psychology to history as well.<sup>12</sup> Erikson's work was particularly pivotal in the world of historiography for creating and molding the field of psychobiography by applying psychoanalysis to particular lives in history, adding later psychoanalytical methods like object-relations theory and child

---

7 Marr, *Modern Britain* 1-10, Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 1-288; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656.

8 Ibid, et al.

9 Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and Its Discontents* (New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 2010), 1-192.

10 Freud, *Civilization*, 1-192, and Anna Green and Kathleen Troup, *The Houses of History* (New York: New York University Press, 1999): 59-87.

11 Green and Troup, *Houses*, 60.

12 Ibid, 61.

development.<sup>13</sup> Psychohistory was controversial because it was largely speculative. Psychoanalysis relied heavily on evidence of one's childhood, and not every historical figure has such evidence readily accessible or available. Thus, the main critique of psychohistory was that it became too subjective, rather than objective, because the author had to write in their own interpretations as fact.<sup>14</sup> This was dangerous territory for a historian wishing to be as accurate as possible, especially for such a large historical figure.

Queen Victoria was a fascinating character who has a plethora of evidence about her childhood, being closely guarded as William IV's only heir to the throne.<sup>15</sup> Her unusually long reign during a time of high advancement of Western civilization made her an intriguing and provoking object of study.<sup>16</sup> Her nine children and rather exaggerated mourning of her husband Albert implied mental issues that can be interpreted using psychoanalysis.<sup>17</sup>

Victoria's role as a woman in power during an era of strict sexual repression was curious from a Freudian perspective. He held the argument that women were only good for providing a sexual outlet for men and that women held power over men only because they lust for aggression and dominance, sexually.<sup>18</sup> This theory was widely dismissed as misogynistic by gender theorists and feminists, but it nonetheless persisted in the field of psychohistory, however convoluted and unconscious it may be.

Psychoanalysis was the only field that can truly delve into the underlying issues behind Queen Victoria's psychological behavior, yet there were other options in which historians could interpret her life and impact in a larger historical context.<sup>19</sup> There was an outpouring of biographies and studies on her life in the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century as psychoanalysis became more accepted in the academic

---

13 Ibid, 61.

14 Ibid.

15 Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465.

16 Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656.

17 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208.

18 Freud, *Civilization*, 27.

19 Green and Troup, *Houses*, 59-87.

world and her letters and diaries became fully accessible to scholars.<sup>20</sup> Psychobiography provided the bulk of academic works written about her. A variety of historiography on such a great woman is needed: the mainstream empiricism blended in with an overwhelming amount of psychoanalysis to justify her actions is not enough for a complete perspective on Queen Victoria.

A feminist method of history should be more readily applied to the study of Queen Victoria. Too often has Queen Victoria's story been told in the world of men's politics as displayed in the empirical method, and sexual experiments as displayed in the psychohistorical method. As the female role model of an age named after herself, she should enter the female sphere of history as one who made her own mark on history.

Feminist theory was a fairly new historiography, developed during the Second Wave Feminist movement. Joan Scott, a prolific historian during this cultural movement, argued in her work, "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis," that the word usage of "gender" instead of "sex" left detrimental implications for women in history.<sup>21</sup> In general, she wanted more feminist, pro-women writers of history to accurately display women's roles throughout the centuries.<sup>22</sup> She found that women's history has become marginalized into a subcategory of historical writing, like race or hobbies.<sup>23</sup>

Women from the Second Wave Feminist movement concluded that they needed to start writing their own history, to make their own voice known in the academic world as well.<sup>24</sup> Despite this, most of Queen Victoria's biographers, even those published after this movement, were often men focusing on her sexuality in a psychoanalytical fashion, rather than let a woman try to understand the Victoria's female mind.<sup>25</sup>

---

20 Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656.

21 Joan W. Scott, "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis." (American Historical Review. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), 1059. [http://cola.calpoly.edu/~lcall/304/scott\\_gender\\_useful\\_category.pdf](http://cola.calpoly.edu/~lcall/304/scott_gender_useful_category.pdf).

22 Scott, *Gender*, 1059.

23 Ibid.

24 Green and Troup, *Houses*, 258.

25 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

One example of how a feminist historian would be able to better understand Victoria is through Victoria's roles in the private versus public sphere. Traditional gender roles in royal marriages consisted of the man being in charge of state affairs, while the woman managed the household.<sup>26</sup> These roles were completely reversed in the case of Victoria and Albert; Albert managed the household and family affairs, while Victoria worked in the public sphere as queen.<sup>27</sup>

Most of Queen Victoria's biographies portray her as a very complicated and contradictory queen; in fact, the title of one of her most recent biographies is *Queen Victoria: A Life of Contradictions*, by Matthew Dennison.<sup>28</sup> Most of her biographies portray her as the role model for a Victorian woman, yet she seemed to be constantly taken advantage of by other men in power. A psychoanalytical perspective on her life stresses the role of men in her life, and a close retelling of her history and sexual life.

Queen Victoria was historically portrayed as docile and "good" during her younger reign (1837-1861), full of life and vivaciousness.<sup>29</sup> However, her later reign from 1861-1901, showed her to be both a mourning widow and austere Empress.<sup>30</sup> The latter portrayal of Victoria was most prevalent in popular culture today, as demonstrated on currency and in political cartoons.

During her reign, England transformed into Great Britain and the United Kingdom, the largest European empire.<sup>31</sup> Imperialism and colonialism were politically at play – and at the helm, symbolizing the way, was Queen Victoria herself, Empress of India.<sup>32</sup> The psychohistorical portrayal of Queen Victoria's psychological imbalances regarding her childhood, marriage, and widowhood

---

26 Green and Troup, *Houses*, 255.

27 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 93-179; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 97; Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 129-212; Wilson, *A Life*, 100; Williams, *Becoming*, 330-351; Bolitho, *Albert 1-216*; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 123.

28 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208.

29 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

30 Ibid.

31 Marr, *Modern Britain*, 1-10.

32 Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Homans, *Remaking*, 19.

showed a slightly unhealthy dependence on the men around her: Sir John Conroy, Lord Melbourne, Albert of Saxe-Coburg and Gotha, and her later prime ministers.<sup>33</sup> The academic world needs a biography about Queen Victoria herself, not about the men who made her. A more feminist approach would venture that Victoria still remained in political control during her entire reign, despite the overwhelmingly dominant male influences she encountered politically, and that she deserves to be celebrated as such today.

Queen Victoria was born the heir to the English throne, a breath of fresh air compared to her debauched and mentally instable predecessors, “born with the breaking of the dawn.”<sup>34</sup> In efforts to change the habitual bad behavior of kings before her, her mother, the Duchess of Kent, and their steward, Sir John Conroy, implemented the Kensington system.<sup>35</sup> It restricted Victoria’s exposure to ‘worldly’ novels, and never allowed her to be out of the sight of an adult.<sup>36</sup> While it was established as a way of ensuring that England’s future queen would be less debauched, it could be argued that Sir John Conroy used the Duchess of Kent’s vulnerability to his advantage.<sup>37</sup> The motives of Conroy’s character are unclear, but he was most often villainized, while Victoria was victimized, which important for the study of her childhood.<sup>38</sup>

Most official historians, such as Williams, stated Victoria enjoyed a docile, tranquil childhood before blossoming gracefully into womanhood and queenhood simultaneously.<sup>39</sup> Still, other sources describe the princess as bellicose, obstinate, and hard to manage – which was it?<sup>40</sup> Victoria’s character and behavior as a child would make a great deal of difference if one were to study her relationships with Conroy, her mother, her uncle King Leopold of Belgium,

---

33 Ibid; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

34 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 8.

35 *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes pg. 5; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 63; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 23-25; Williams, *Becoming*, 171-288; Wilson, *A Life*, 43; Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 23-147; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 25-48.

36 Ibid, et al.

37 Ibid, et al.

38 *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes; Kinzler, *Visualising Victoria*; Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 1-288.

39 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 23-25; Williams, *Becoming*, 171-288; Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 23-147.

40 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 25-48; Wilson, *A Life*, 43; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 63.

and her governess, Baroness Lehzen. The men who wrote Victoria's history using psychoanalyst terms portrayed Victoria as a victim of powerful influence, especially from her governess Baroness Lehzen, because of their close relationship.<sup>41</sup> However, there is a major discrepancy in writing between one of her oldest psychobiographers, Lytton Strachey, and her most recent biographer, Dennison. Strachey stated that all of Victoria's influencers shaped her in such a way that they themselves were, in effect, ruling through her, since she was a weak woman, led by emotion rather than fact.<sup>42</sup> Recent biographers side with a more feminist view that Victoria was her own woman, with her own brain and will to rule effectively, were it not for Victorian social conventions.<sup>43</sup>

Historians agreed that Victoria longed to be rid of the chains of the Kensington system when she ascended to the throne at age eighteen.<sup>44</sup> The literature of her ascension rings of national rejoicing, a fresh start for the monarchy.<sup>45</sup> Portraiture during her reign depicted a glorious queen-turned-goddess.<sup>46</sup> Even modern filmmaker Julian Fellowes wished to imitate this portrait in his film *The Young Victoria*, as booming angelic choirs herald England's glory.<sup>47</sup> Her diaries were full of the word 'alone' after she ascended the throne; her rebellion against the Kensington system was now in effect.<sup>48</sup> Psychohistorians found ample source material for analysis of her unique childhood.

Victoria's coronation was also described with similar sentiment; her "goodness" in wanting to give her dog his bath was almost always mentioned because it showed her as a caring ruler.<sup>49</sup> Yet, during the ceremony, 19<sup>th</sup> century historians describe her as overwhelmed by the crowd: tearful, quiet and frail.<sup>50</sup>

41 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 59.; Bolitho, *Albert*, 1-216.

42 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

43 Williams, *Becoming*, 4, 367; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 90-95; Kinzler, *Visualising Victoria; The Young Victoria*, Fellowes.

44 Ibid; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 1-232.

45 Ibid.

46 Tanworth, *Receiving News*; Goodrich, *Peter Parley*.

47 *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes, 4.

48 Bolitho, *Albert*, 1-216; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465.

49 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 57-68; Goodrich, *Peter Parley*, 10-20.

50 Ibid, et al.

Victorian historians would portrayed Victoria as weak and womanly, especially those who wished for a republican government, yet psychohistorians seem to gloss over this literature, saying instead that the ceremony was a logistical disaster, or that her Prime Minister Lord Melbourne pressured her to perform perfectly.<sup>51</sup> In any case, the public-swore their loyalty to the “Lilliputian beauty” who now sat on the throne.<sup>52</sup>

Victoria’s ministers were always concerned about who was permitted to influence the queen with their ideas.<sup>53</sup> Victoria’s amiable correspondence with her uncle King Leopold of Belgium was under careful scrutiny, as was her governess Baroness Lehzen’s correspondence with Baron Stockmar.<sup>54</sup> Sir John Conroy miserably failed at using his influence to his advantage, which Victoria knew full well.<sup>55</sup> The Viscount Lord Melbourne, Victoria’s first Prime Minister and mentor, was given a tremendous amount of sway over Victoria, according to most male psychohistorians.<sup>56</sup> These authors blame the Kensington system for Victoria’s seeming need for male leadership in her life, yet they also praised how amiable of a relationship Victoria and Melbourne had compared to her later Prime Ministers.<sup>57</sup>

Psychohistorians almost always imply that Victoria’s relationship with Melbourne was more than just a professional one; they shared a level of emotional intimacy that can only come from a man’s sexual repression and a woman’s innocence.<sup>58</sup> Feminist authors would most likely beg to differ. They could argue that not every male relationship Victoria encountered up to this point would look any different; she was just naturally an affectionate woman. She may never have interacted with her father, but Sir John Conroy and King Leopold

---

51 Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 97.

52 Homans, *Remaking*, 24.

53 Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232; Woodham-Smith, *Birth to the Death*, 1-232; Ward, *Censoring*.

54 Ibid.

55 *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 37; Plowden, *The Young Victoria*, 1-288.

56 Ibid. Bolitho, *Albert*, 1-216; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656.

57 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 49; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; Guedalla, *Mr. Gladstone*, 1-192.

58 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208.

had tried similar tactics which failed, she gained full control of her ability to rule despite Melbourne's efforts to control her opinions.<sup>59</sup> *The Young Victoria* almost achieved this view when she grilled Melbourne to give her statistics on the rising industrial classes, much to his chagrin.<sup>60</sup> The public dislike Lord Melbourne's influence since he was a member of Parliament and a liberal.<sup>61</sup>

The most controversial influence of all was Albert of Saxe-Coburg and Gotha, Prince Consort to Queen Victoria. Psychohistorians consider Albert the man in charge while Victoria was in an almost constant state of pregnancy during their marriage.<sup>62</sup> In reality, feminist authors would not depict Victoria giving up her role without a fight. The public disliked Albert from the start for being German, and therefore "un-English."<sup>63</sup> Sources eventually disagreed over Albert's true role as a husband. Male psychohistorians always look for ways that King Leopold of Belgium tried to influence Albert, and that Albert was merely his agent for rule.<sup>64</sup> Instead of searching for influencers over Victoria, Victoria's ruling style herself was left aside.<sup>65</sup> Albert either ruled in Victoria's stead because he was power hungry, or because of duty to his wife. Ultimately, a feminist historian would stress the idea that Victoria and Albert's traditional gender roles were reversed: Victoria ruled in public, while Albert managed the private household.<sup>66</sup>

Motherhood was worshipped by the English Victorians; they admired Victoria and constantly labeled her as the "mother of Europe."<sup>67</sup> What most psychohistorians brush past, and what most feminist historians should spend more time with, was Victoria's reaction to having children. She was upset when she discovered she was pregnant, and she found children a hindrance from her

59 Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 1-288; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes.

60 *The Young Victoria*, Fellowes.

61 John Doyle, *The Balance of Power, Lithograph*. (London: Thomas McLean, 5 June 1839); John Doyle, *The Duenna*. (Lithograph. London: Thomas McLean, 1838).

62 Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

63 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 78.

64 *Ibid*.

65 *Ibid*.

66 Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208.

67 Homans, *Remaking*, 1.



work. At one point, she even expresses her desire to abort her pregnancy.<sup>68</sup> Yet for the sake of the nation, and Victoria's current family on the throne, she is typecast as a mother-figure. Feminist historians would be able to note the marginalization of this role and further extrapolate upon it— how women were always confined to their sexuality and how it affects their public role. Victoria's public role should (if she had her way) be queen, yet, because of her gender, she was labeled as the mother of England.

Victoria's marriage, however ambiguous, came to a sudden close when Albert died in 1861.<sup>69</sup> Psychohistorians noted this date as a major turning point in Victoria's life, one from which she would never fully recover. Certain authors stated that her mourning was justified, as any dutiful wife would have at that time, while others sided with England and said that it was far too drawn out.<sup>70</sup> In either case, psychohistorians question her sanity, as did many of the queen's ministers.<sup>71</sup> Mental illness ran in her family, which gave reason for a psychoanalytical approach, yet a gender power play was present when a woman was described to be mentally ill or hysterical, especially at a time when it would be expected of her to act as such.<sup>72</sup> Much research from a female gender historian is needed for Victoria's latter, post-Albert half of her reign— to discuss her role as a widow and queen, and to understand the uniquely marginalized lifestyle of a woman accused of mental instability. Psychohistorians disregard much of her adult life as a time of insomnia, when her ministers took over power and she was passively labeled as England's representative and "the grandmother of Europe."<sup>73</sup>

Even those writing specifically about her time of mourning describe it as a "cult of death."<sup>74</sup> In reality, what very few psychohistorians realized, was that

---

68 Williams, *Becoming*, 351.

69 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 93.

70 Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208; Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*; Wilson, *A Life*; Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465.

71 Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465.

72 Strachey, *Illustrated Biography*, 1-232.

73 *Ibid.*

74 *Ibid.*, Williams, *Becoming*, 1-465 and Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656.

Victoria did recover from Albert's death and ruled effectively through rather difficult prime ministers; she kept her monarchy afloat when some wished to be rid of it altogether and expanded England into the British Empire.<sup>75</sup> This woman was capable to do it all, much to the adoration of her subjects, and even worshipped as 'the Second Gloriana' like her predecessor Elizabeth I.<sup>76</sup> England would not be the same without her active and effective rule, despite what theoretical psychological history indicated she may have endured. What was more historically effective was the fact that she was a female ruler during a time of extreme sexual repression.<sup>77</sup> Only a truly feminist history could fully capture the effect of her image in her public role as a woman.

Instead, men wrote Victoria's history for her. Letters published upon the passing of her death serve as her first biography—screened by men, including her son King Edward VII, who had a famously tempestuous relationship with her. "Queen Victoria...is the product of her biographers."<sup>78</sup> Thus, not enough work has been done to uncover the 'true' Victoria.

While Queen Victoria's childhood under the "Kensington System" made separation with her husband Albert a psychological issue for the rest of her life, one that her political leaders exploited to perform their own visions of Empire and colonial expansion, she was genuinely a vivacious soul, eager to rule effectively and care for her subjects.<sup>79</sup> She moved on from her husband's death into a more mature role: fulfilling the part of a second "Gloriana" by those who sought a strong nationalist expansion under her rule, but with full consciousness and command.<sup>80</sup> During her reign, she maintained control of her person within the limitations of any Victorian woman at the time. It is time to stop seeing Victoria as a weakling, influenced by everyone else around her. A pro-female approach to Victoria is long overdue, especially one with details of gender politics.

---

75 Plowden, *Young Victoria*, 1-288; Marr, *Modern Britain*, pg. 1-10; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208.

76 Homans, *Remaking*, 20-48.

77 Marr, *Modern Britain*, pg. 1-10.

78 Ward, *Censoring*, 1.

79 Marr, *Modern Britain*, 1-10; Wilson, *A Life*, 1-656; Dennison, *Contradictions*, 1-208; Kinzler, *Visualizing Victoria*.

80 Ibid; Homans, *Remaking*.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Bolitho, Hector. *Albert, Prince Consort*. New York, Bobbs-Merrill, 1964.
- Bromley, James. *Queen Victoria*. London: National Public Gallery, 1834.
- Dennison, Matthew. *Queen Victoria: A Life of Contradictions*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 2013.
- Doyle, John. *The Balance of Power*. Lithograph. London: Thomas McLean, 1839.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Duenna*. Lithograph. London: Thomas McLean, 1838.
- Freud, Sigmund. *Civilization and Its Discontents*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 2010. Goodrich, Samuel G. *Peter Parley's Visit to London during the Coronation of Queen Victoria*. London: Charles Tilt, 1839.
- Green, Anna and Troup, Kathleen. *The Houses of History: A Critical Reader in Twentieth-Century and Theory*. New York: New York University Press, 1999.
- Guedalla, Philip. *The Queen and Mr. Gladstone*. New York: Doubleday, 1969.
- Homans, Margaret and Adrienne Munich, ed. *Remaking Queen Victoria*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Google Scholar. Web. Accessed October, 20 2015.
- Kinzler, Julia. "Visualising Victoria: Gender, Genre and History in The Young Victoria (2009)". *Neo-Victorian Studies* 4:2 (2011). Web. Accessed October 20, 2015. [http://www.neovictorianstudies.com/past\\_issues/4-2%202011/NVS%204-2-3%20J-Kinzler.pdf](http://www.neovictorianstudies.com/past_issues/4-2%202011/NVS%204-2-3%20J-Kinzler.pdf).
- Marr, Andrew. *The Making of Modern Britain: from Queen Victoria to VE Day*. London: Pan Books, 2010.
- Plowden, Alison. *The Young Victoria*. New York: Stein and Day, 1983.
- Raymond, John, ed. *Queen Victoria's Early Letters*. New York: Macmillan, 1963.
- Scott, Joan W. "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis." *American Historical Review*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988. [http://cola.calpoly.edu/~lcall/304/scott\\_gender\\_useful\\_category.pdf](http://cola.calpoly.edu/~lcall/304/scott_gender_useful_category.pdf).

- Strachey, Lytton. *An Eminent Illustrated Biography: Queen Victoria*. London: Harcourt Brace, 1921.
- Tanworth, Henry. *Queen Victoria Receiving News of Her Accession to the Throne*. National Public Gallery, 1880.
- Ward, Yvonne M. *Censoring Queen Victoria: How Two Gentlemen Edited a Queen and Created an Icon*. London: Oneworld, 2014.
- Williams, Kate. *Becoming Queen Victoria*. New York: Ballantine Books, 2008.
- Wilson, A.N. *Victoria: A Life*. New York: Penguin Press, 2014.
- Woodham-Smith, Cecil. *Queen Victoria: From her Birth to the Death of the Prince Consort*. New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 1972.
- The Young Victoria. Directed by Jean-Marc Vallée, Written by Julian Fellowes. London: GK, 2009. DVD. [http://www.pages.drexel.edu/~ina22/vsplaylib/Screenplay-Young\\_Victoria,%20The.pdf](http://www.pages.drexel.edu/~ina22/vsplaylib/Screenplay-Young_Victoria,%20The.pdf).





# *The Rise and Reign of the Loser: Emotionological Culture of the 1980S Red Sox*

By Allison Wilkinson

*“All men are mortal, and therefore all men are losers; our profoundest loyalty goes out to the fallible.”* - John Updike<sup>1</sup>

The Boston Red Sox and their fans had a long, complex relationship marked by fierce loyalty and repeated disappointments. Over the course of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the Red Sox brand cultivated a sense of destiny driven by losing; however, it did not start out this way. Following their inception in 1901, the Red Sox blazed on to the scene, winning five World Series in under twenty years. A hero in many baseball legends, George Herman “Babe” Ruth, carried the team on his shoulders. In 1920, under the guise of not wanting the team centered on a single individual, owner Henry Frazee sold Ruth to the team’s soon-to-be bitter rival, the New York Yankees.<sup>2</sup> This singular event was thought to have catalyzed a near century without a World Series title and set the Red Sox destiny. The deep-seeded betrayal fans carried as a result led to a wary balance between the organization and their fans for generations to come, despite their devotion. Subsequently, the Red Sox initially suffered, later endured, and finally embraced an existence as the epitomized and eternal losers.

By the 1980s, the team had a well-established and invested fan base. In that decade, the Red Sox organization had a paradoxical and unique task in selling a team to a fan base that did not want or need to be sold to. The fans proved their investment to the team by their constant attendance through the dismal

---

1 Glenn Rifkin, “How the Boston Red Sox Touch All the Branding Bases,” *strategy & business*, October 1, 1999, Accessed May 1, 2015.

2 “Injustice to Keep Ruth, Says Frazee” *The Sun*, January 5, 1920, accessed June 2, 2015, Library of Congress.

losing years and pushed back against marketing ploys. The issue at hand then was a matter of Peter and Carol Stearns' theory of emotionology. Emotionology is a term used to encapsulate "the attitudes and standards that a society, or a definable group within a society, maintains toward basic emotions and their expression; ways that institutions reflect and encourage these attitudes in human conduct."<sup>3</sup> In order to understand the gravity of the Stearns' theory, the Red Sox must be thought of as more than a mere sports team, but rather as a definable culture in itself. The team and the culture surrounding it offered a channel for all of the most profound emotions to be expressed. These emotions were allowed, encouraged, and expected. The Stearns' addressed sports as "providing outlets for emotions not readily tolerated in other spheres."<sup>4</sup> The combination of the expectations of the fan, seen through the team's popular histories and periodicals from the time, and the facilitation of these expectations by the team, by way of their seasonal records and marketing, allowed for the predominance of a society of fandom in Boston framed around a losing culture. I maintain that there was a distinct emotionological culture attached to the Red Sox institution, as seen through three representative manifestations: frustration when fans attempted to uphold their standards against what they saw as infringements upon the sanctity of their fandom, tragedy when the team faced their most monumental defeat, and optimism embodied by the achievements of individual players and the everlasting Fenway Park. The Red Sox organization directly and indirectly enabled their fans to develop these attitudes through their marketing tactics, performance, and venue.

Existing literature regarding the Boston Red Sox consists primarily of popular histories that acknowledged emotions of frustration and optimism without truly grasping the implications of their display. Works like that of Michael Borer in *Faithful to Fenway: Believing in Boston, Baseball, and America's Most Beloved Ballpark* or Derek Catsam's article "On Fenway, Faith, and Fandom:

---

3 Peter N. Stearns and Carol Z. Stearns "Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards," *The American Historical Review* Vol. 90, no. 4, (October 1985).

4 Stearns, Peter N. and Carol Z. Stearns, ed. *Emotion and Social Change: Toward a New Psychohistory* (New York, N.Y.: Holmes & Meier, 1988), 13.



A Red Sox Fan Reflects” discussed sociological and surface level displays of emotion.<sup>5</sup> They focused more on the emotions themselves, rather than the effects and attitudes they impart on the Red Sox institution. Their analyses were useful and necessary in establishing that an emotional culture did in fact exist, but they were reading into the nuances of these emotions that give the full breadth of Red Sox emotional history.

## Frustration – Seeing Red

From their research, Stearns and Stearns found that a society “encounters its most serious emotional issues in areas where standards are changing.”<sup>6</sup> In the case of the Red Sox, the standard of success, or lack thereof, certainly did not change; rather, how the team chose to communicate with ‘Red Sox Nation’ did.<sup>7</sup>

In March 1984, The Boston Red Sox enacted an audacious marketing move by launching their own cable network with little notice to the fans. New England Sports Network, or NESN for short, was a premium broadcast channel of which the Red Sox owned a significant holding. It monopolized the regional airwaves and broadcast a majority of the Red Sox regular season games. Their choice of debut was especially brazen, as it came in the spring immediately following the Red Sox’ most dismal finish in nearly two decades.<sup>8</sup> Fans saw the channel less as a new outlet towards watching games and more as a blockade to their relationship with the team. For years the fans had devoured the typical baseball fodder: t-shirts, caps, programs, yearbooks, and magazines. To them, a television network was different. It was not a manifestation of team pride or a tangible feeling of connection and possession of the team; in fact, it was very much the opposite.

---

5 Michael I. Borer, *Faithful to Fenway: Believing in Boston, Baseball, America’s Most Beloved Ballpark* (New York: New York University Press, 2008), accessed April 15, 2015, ProQuest ebrary; Derek Catsam “On Fenway, Faith, and Fandom: A Red Sox Fan Reflects” *Baseball and American Culture: Across the Diamond*, edited by Edward J. Rielly, (New York: Haworth Press, 2003).

6 Stearns, *Emotion and Social Change*, 17.

7 Nathan Cobb, “Baseball Border War, In Milford, Conn., Geography Brings Sox And Mets Fans; Cheek To Jowl,” *The Boston Globe*, October 20, 1986, accessed April 27, 2015, ProQuest Newsstand.

8 Major League Baseball, “Year by Year results,” Boston Red Sox, 2015, accessed April 15, 2015.

On the very day of its launch, *Boston Globe* columnist Leigh Montville made his frustration known in the piece, “Red Sox on pay TV? I don’t like it.”<sup>9</sup> In Boston, where the media was as much a fan as those in the seats, Montville’s vocal opposition emphasized the emotion-driven relationship the Red Sox had with their fan base. For a team that had historically performed poorly, it was the enduring fans that kept their franchise alive. As such, fans felt they deserved respect from the organization for coming back year after year. Fans took the notion of paying for games, that used to be free, as insult. Montville, a weekly sports columnist and Connecticut native, was a single representative and voice of this much larger community. A community that planned its days and nights around the baseball broadcast. The *Globe*, Boston’s major newspaper, catered directly to this demographic. In a humorously dramatic tone that carried throughout the piece, Montville described “it [was] as if there suddenly [were] a charge for air. Or sunshine. Or the time of day.”<sup>10</sup> While hyperbolic, he believed he conveyed the attitude of many fans; the Red Sox were central to life in New England and this charge was an affront of considerable measure. It tipped the scales in favor of the franchise over the fan. He sardonically painted the network as one destined to fail and saw the Red Sox network as a betrayal to the steadfast fans.

In a sense, this public and vehement opposition hinted at what the Red Sox sought in the introduction of the network. The overriding tone of Montville’s piece, other than frustration, was passion for the Red Sox. This dedication, in the author and others like him, was exactly what the Red Sox hoped to capitalize on in broadcasting from their own channel. The “marketing hoo ha,” as Montville called it, may very well have been the Sox trying to reinvigorate their market after their poor finish in 1983. The organization failed to remember that the fans motivations were not fueled by wins and losses, but by pure devotion to watching the team regardless of the outcome.

As reflected by Montville’s impassioned piece, the fans felt they had some

---

9 Leigh Montville, “Red Sox on pay TV? I don’t like it,” *The Boston Globe*, March 21, 1984, accessed April 27, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.

10 Montville, “Red Sox on pay TV?”

kind of clout with the Red Sox and were aggravated when it seemed they were being slighted. They maintained ownership of the team through their fandom. To buy a cap or a magazine was to possess a part of the culture and to identify as part of a larger entity; however, the network took away the basis of that fan fraternity, the team and its games, and turned it for profit. What had previously been available to all would be limited to those who could and would pay. To sell out and join the mass media circus was not, in the fans' eyes, the way of a team so enveloped in history. Serving those diehard fans that proselytized tradition and touted their emotionological principles proved to be a difficult task, especially in a decade where the shift towards mass media was imminent. The immense frustration exhibited by the fans in regards to NESN gave an interesting look into their place within the Red Sox institution. In any conventional sport setting, fans would typically garner frustration at their team continuously losing; however, as Red Sox fans had come to expect this, they channeled their frustration into pushing back against new media. Their reactions were quick and agitated without considering the benefits of such a network. The Red Sox organization, on the other hand, made it clear that this network was not going anywhere. NESN, despite initial fan pushback, continued and eventually thrived, highlighting the ability for the fans' emotionological culture to develop in the face of change. This attempt at reinvention marked one of the major tensions between the organization and fans during the decade. As the '80s progressed, NESN remained the only marketing shakeup that impacted Sox culture, but competitively the team itself made a leap that had the ability to fundamentally change the culture forever.

## **Tragedy - Sox Quest for Six**

The Sox journey towards their elusive sixth World Series title was a painful one and perfect exhibition of the team and fan's tragic sensibility. After World Series heartbreaks in 1946 and 1967, both of which ended in a crushing Game 7 defeat, two distinct themes could be seen: the Red Sox were not going to win, no matter how promising they were, and the fans would still be there,

no matter the magnitude of loss.<sup>11</sup> The team carried these commandments into the chaotic first half of the 1980s, where year after year the team found themselves amassing win-loss records including 83-77, 78-84, and 81-81.<sup>12</sup> The decade was rough, but had its glimmering diamond in the 1986 season. The team made a glorious run at baseball's biggest prize. They rebounded in the Championship series in dramatic fashion and brought that flair with them to the big stage.<sup>13</sup>

Once they reached the Series itself, the team had multiple chances to clinch, but failed to seize their opportunities, seemingly reaffirming the institutionalized expectation of a disastrous end. In a bitter irony, prior to Game Six, *Boston Globe* contributor David Margolick noted that the Red Sox, "embody something else: the epic, ennobling sense of tragedy. There is, after all, something far grander about hopes dashed than hopes satisfied."<sup>14</sup> Generations of fans were ingrained with this notion; many had been raised with it. For 68 years, the Red Sox had continually disappointed in the end, and while no fan was going to venture to say that they hoped the team lost, they would not be surprised if they did. In Boston baseball culture, it was not about the wins and the losses in the moment, it was the enigmatic, hopeful future that kept the fans coming back.

The fans expectation of loss was an interesting cultural phenomenon in the world of sports. As Yale President, eventual Baseball Commissioner, and Red Sox fan Bart Giamatti once proclaimed, "I almost think Boston fans don't want to win it all. They'd rather have winning out there as a shining ideal."<sup>15</sup> Though the promise of a shining ideal is one explanation, Giamatti's argument had an added assumption of fear. Red Sox fans of the '80s only knew

---

11 Ivor-Campbell, Frederick. "Boston Red Sox," *Encyclopedia of Major League Baseball Team Histories: American League*, Edited by Peter Bjarkman (Westport, CT: Meckler, 1991), 34-35.

12 Major League Baseball, "Year by Year results," Boston Red Sox, 2015, accessed April 15, 2015, [http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/history/year\\_by\\_year\\_results.jsp](http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/history/year_by_year_results.jsp).

13 Campbell, 40-41.

14 David Margolick, "What if the Red Sox Win?" *The New York Times*, October 25, 1986, accessed May 1, 2015, ProQuest Newsstand.

15 Ken Burns, *Ken Burns: Baseball*, Netflix, directed by Ken Burns (New York: PBS, 1994); Campbell, 42.

losing and the innumerable unknown variables that could be affected by a title would prove daunting to anyone who grew up with the team. Would star players move on to a richer team? Would a new stadium be proposed? This is where the overwhelming sense of emotionology comes into play. Stearns claimed that this theory was necessary, “to distinguish between professed values and emotional experience.”<sup>16</sup> In sporting culture, the end goal is to win. Yet, Red Sox fans did not abide by this rule and their emotions were exhibited elsewhere. The team’s history had allowed for the acceptance of and subconscious comfortability with losing.

The Red Sox would, yet again, confirm their tragic sensibility and inexplicably fail to come up with the win. They came excruciatingly close, bringing the Mets to their final strike, before Mookie Wilson’s seemingly fateful at bat. Wilson fouled off pitch after pitch, and taunted Red Sox fans from, what betrayed their typical outlooks, an inevitable victory. Wilson finally made contact, it headed down the first base line towards Bill Buckner, a career .998 fielding first baseman, and the ball rolled under his glove. The Mets went on to win the game and, the next night, become World Series champions.<sup>17</sup> This was the clearest instance of the Red Sox self-fulfilling prophecy, to come the closest any team had come to victory without actually achieving it.<sup>18</sup> In true Red Sox fashion, the city held a parade to honor the team following yet another Game 7 defeat in which 750,000 fans turned out.<sup>19</sup> To lose a World Series in which you were ahead was to be the biggest loser of them all in the pessimistic minds of many sports fans; to come so close, yet land so far. This loss was difficult, especially with how close the trophy came to residing in, “the sport’s capital of the world,”<sup>20</sup> but deep down, fans expected it and took it in stride. They knew that another season of hope was just around the corner.

---

16 Stearns, “Emotionology.”

17 Bill Buckner, *Catching Hell*, TV, directed by Alex Gibney (Los Angeles: ESPN, 2011).

18 Dan Shaughnessey, “One Strike Away: The standard for booting victory is set,” *The Boston Globe*, October 22, 2004. ProQuest Newsstand.

19 Matthew L. Wald “Boston Enfolds its Heroes, Waiving Deplorable Act,” *The New York Times*, October 30, 1986. ProQuest Newsstand.

20 Wald, “Boston Enfolds its Heroes.”

## Optimism – Motives and Monsters

Despite the irksome tactics of the marketing team and monumental loss in the 1986 World Series, the overarching attitude of Red Sox fans in the 1980s and throughout history was an unfathomable optimism. For an area so familiar in tasting successes that became near misses, fans were expected to be there, rooting on the team with facetious bitterness, when springtime rolled around again. This sanguine outlook was stimulated by individual player success and the continuous charisma of Fenway.

The standout characters of the 1980s helped sustain interest and encourage hope in an especially bleak era. Players such as Jim Rice and Wade Boggs found ways to succeed individually, with Rice having a third straight season with 100 runs batted in and Boggs winning the batting title (both in 1985).<sup>21</sup> A fresh-faced Texan named Roger Clemens had something to prove following two seasons of arm trouble. And prove himself he did, ringing up twenty strikeouts in a single game on April 29<sup>th</sup>, 1986 and breaking a nine inning game record that had held for 102 years.<sup>22</sup> These exceptional accomplishments defied the typical ideas associated with a losing team and became legends amongst the fans. The players became pop culture icons, with Boggs's peculiar superstitions and Clemens down-home, Southern charm making national headlines.<sup>23</sup> The players of note were highlighted and profiled in team programs and magazines.<sup>24</sup> When the Sox predictably came up as losers at the end of the season, the fans enjoyed watching it happen and rooted for those who provided the victories and awards the team would get. The players and their singular successes became flares of excitement for the future and incarnations of optimism against all history and reason; however, the continual beacon of hope for the Red Sox Nation was its home, Fenway Park.

---

21 Dick Bresciani ed., *Boston Red Sox 1986 1st Edition Official Scorebook Magazine* (Boston: Boston Red Sox Publishing, 1986), 9-11.

22 Campbell, 40.

23 Ira Berkow, "Night to Remember is No Night to Sleep," *The New York Times*, May 1, 1986, accessed May 1, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.

24 Bresciani, *Boston Red Sox 1986*, 9-11.

Part of the everlasting appeal of the Red Sox and a large contributing factor to their sustained fan base has been “Friendly Fenway.”<sup>25</sup> The park, strategically placed in the Fens neighborhood of Boston, opened on April 20<sup>th</sup> 1912.<sup>26</sup> The community, ideologically and physically, built up around Fenway Park. It led a typical existence until 1933 when, in an attempt to recapture fan interest, Yawkey, the new owner, painted Fenway a unique shade of green. Thus interminable icons such as the Green Monster, Fenway’s giant, unparalleled left field wall, were born.<sup>27</sup> Over the decades, these quirks became images that the fans could attach their sentiments to. The Monster became as much of a participant in the game as left fielders like Carl Yastrzemski, Ted Williams, and Jim Rice. The mere experience of setting foot in the hallowed grounds of Fenway Park was and is a rite of passage to all baseball fans. It is to Red Sox fans what the Vatican is to the Catholic religion: a place of passion, tears, and admiration from many, even those outside the faith.

The park’s multigenerational existence made it the perfect setting for the exhibition of the Red Sox emotionological culture. The familial bonds strengthened in the park added a further layer to the importance of the team and its venue. As one fan claimed, “my great-grandfather, grandfather, father, and myself have all seen games there, and have probably sat behind the same beam!”<sup>28</sup> Fenway embedded itself in the very being of Boston fans. As a result of its enduring presence, Fenway Park became the image of optimism. The field’s aura even prompted a marketing venture that had never been done before in baseball. The Sox decided to honor their most consistent member with a celebration of its 75<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 1987.<sup>29</sup> No other park in major league baseball had been around as long, nor had they become as iconic. The green walls and Citgo sign were there to watch over the fans and provided a level of

---

25 Rifkin.

26 Rifkin.

27 “At Age 75, Fenway Park Has Lost None of Its Charm,” *The Los Angeles Times*, May 3, 1987, accessed April 27, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.

28 Borer. *Faithful to Fenway*, 181.

29 Major League Baseball, “Timeline.” Fenway Park Living Museum Fund. 2015, accessed April 15, 2015, <http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/fenway-park-living-museum/timeline/>.

dependability in the midst of the team's unpredictable performance.

The Red Sox' consistent level of loss leaves those outside the fandom wondering why fans continue their ardent support of the team. Scholars of sports psychology have grappled with questions similar to this for decades and have varying interpretations. As Lloyd Reynolds Sloan cited in his chapter "The Motives of Sports Fans," fans are attracted to the game as it "teach[es] us of life by letting us witness life's values or our culture's numerous values being portrayed."<sup>30</sup> On top of values such as hard work, personal and collective achievement, and adaptability, the Red Sox fans had an added layer of constructs including loss and perseverance. Margolick, in his sentimental reflection on the team in 1986, said it best:

*Sure, the Red Sox are not the embodiment of success, but in their current character they represent many other more-enduring values. They embody perseverance, reminding us annually that even with the best of efforts we often come up short and simply must resolve to do better. They embody resiliency and optimism, the conviction that no matter how bad things can be one year, spring training is just around the corner. We love the Sox not because we're masochists but because, in all of their doomed rallies in all their ninth innings of all their seventh games, they mirror our own struggles and disappointments and dreams.<sup>31</sup>*

To witness the outstanding athletes on the field celebrating the small successes in day-to-day wins and facing the enormous losses in the Fall Classic was a reminder that they were human, just like any fan.<sup>32</sup> Sloan's subsequent arguments revolve around the idea that "idolatry of victory in sports is an undeniable fact" and that fans could fulfill achievement needs by indulging in their team's successes.<sup>33</sup> The Red Sox serve as a true counterargument to this asser-

---

30 Lloyd Reynolds Sloan, "The Motives of Sports Fans." Sports, Games, and Play: Social and Psychological Viewpoints. Jeffrey H. Goldstein, ed. (London: Psychology Press, 1979), 191.

31 Margolick, "What if the Red Sox Win?"

32 Another name for the World Series.

33 Sloan "The Motives of Sports Fans,"192-193.



tion. The team lost and fans turned out in droves. Even in their most dismal season of 1984, the team drew attendance of 1,782,285, almost 70,000 fans above the American League average. The season after the tantalizingly close World Series title, attendance spiked to 2,147,641, a whopping 349,589 over the average.<sup>34</sup> The numbers serve as further proof that the fans would come, win or lose. For Red Sox fans, it was more the idolatry of the almost-victory. The underlying anticipation of loss allowed for fans to simply enjoy the game with measured hope and without any particularly grand expectations.

## That's The Game

The difficulties the Red Sox faced in the 1980s were perceptually different from any conventional ideas regarding sports teams. Success for the Red Sox was not marked by the standard win-loss record, but rather by the continued support of their fan base. Without going so far as to analyze the emotional implications, Catsam realized and reflected upon the matchless nature of Red Sox fandom, "They are more than a favorite sports team. They are more like a cultural institution."<sup>35</sup> The awareness of Red Sox fans of their belonging to something greater than simple sports fanaticism indicates the power of the culture they developed. The fans built their emotional constructs and dedicated their "profoundest loyalties" around a team that was infallible in their fallibility. From these constructs came the foundations for the rise and reverence of the Red Sox losing legacy. This culture encapsulated a wide and varied range of sentiments. The spectrum of emotions ranged from frustrations, tragic sensibility, and fervently held optimism. Team performance, even with the expectation of loss, was met with a 'we'll get them next year' attitude, best summarized by Frederick Ivor-Campbell when he wrote "losing is winning as it leads to hope."<sup>36</sup>

In 2004, after 86 years, Red Sox fans no longer had to wonder what lie after the mystical World Series title as they clinched the Commissioner's Tro-

---

34 Baseball Almanac, "Boston Red Sox Attendance Data," *Baseball Almanac Attendance Data*.

35 Catsam, "On Fenway, Faith, and Fandom," 25.

36 Campbell, 42.

phy.<sup>37</sup> in a four game sweep of the St. Louis Cardinals. They then went on to become one of the most successful teams of the early 21<sup>st</sup> century, becoming the first to win three World Series titles in a decade.<sup>38</sup> This success prompted a curious emotionological dissonance for the modern Red Sox nation, and an interesting study for emotional historians, as they are now composed of generations raised in the era marked by massive defeat and those raised in the era marked by glorious victory.

---

37 The Commissioner's Trophy is the trophy given out each year by the Commissioner of Major League Baseball to the team that wins the World Series.

38 Soumya Karlamangla, "Boston celebrates Red Sox win, remembers marathon bombings," *The Los Angeles Times*, November 2, 2013, accessed June 2, 2015, <http://articles.latimes.com/2013/nov/02/nation/la-na-nn-boston-red-sox-marathon-20131102>.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- “At Age 75, Fenway Park Has Lost None of Its Charm.” *The Los Angeles Times*, May 3, 1987. Accessed April 27, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.
- Baseball Almanac. “Boston Red Sox Attendance Data.” *Baseball Almanac Attendance Data*.
- Berkow, Ira. “Night to Remember is No Night to Sleep,” *The New York Times*, May 1, 1986. Accessed May 1, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.
- Borer, Michael I. *Faithful to Fenway: Believing in Boston, Baseball, America’s Most Beloved Ballpark*. New York: New York University Press, 2008. Accessed April 15, 2015. ProQuest ebrary.
- Buckner, Bill. *Catching Hell*. TV. Directed by Alex Gibney. Los Angeles: ESPN, 2011.
- Burns, Ken. *Ken Burns: Baseball*. Netflix. Directed by Ken Burns. New York: PBS, 1994.
- Bresciani, Dick, ed. *Boston Red Sox 1986 1<sup>st</sup> Edition Official Scorebook Magazine*. Boston: Boston Red Sox Publishing, 1986.
- Catsam, Derek. *Baseball and American Culture: Across the Diamond*. Edited by Edward J. Rielly. New York: Haworth Press, 2003.
- Cobb, Nathan. “Baseball Border War; In Milford, Conn., Geography Brings Sox And Mets Fans; Cheek To Jowl,” *The Boston Globe*, Oct 20, 1986. Accessed April 27, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.
- Goldstein, Jeffrey H., ed. “The Motives of Sports Fans.” *Sports, Games, and Play: Social and Psychological Viewpoints*. London: Psychology Press, 1979.
- Ivor-Campbell, Frederick. “Boston Red Sox,” *Encyclopedia of Major League Baseball Team Histories: American League*. Edited by Peter Bjarkman. Westport, CT: Meckler, 1991, 16-42.
- Karlamangla, Soumya. “Boston celebrates Red Sox win, remembers marathon bombings.” *The Los Angeles Times*, Nov 2, 2013. Accessed June 2, 2015. <http://arti>

cles.latimes.com/2013/nov/02/nation/la-na-nn-boston-red-sox-marathon-20131102.

Major League Baseball. "Timeline." *Fenway Park Living Museum Fund*. Last modified 2015. Accessed April 15, 2015. <http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/fenway-park-living-museum/timeline/>.

Major League Baseball. "Year by Year results." *Boston Red Sox*. Last modified 2015. Accessed April 15, 2015. [http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/history/year\\_by\\_year\\_results.jsp](http://mlb.mlb.com/bos/history/year_by_year_results.jsp).

Margolick, David. "What if the Red Sox Win?." *The New York Times*, October 25, 1986. Accessed May 1, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.

Montville, Leigh. "Red Sox on pay TV? I don't like it," *The Boston Globe*, March 21, 1984. Accessed April 27, 2015. ProQuest Newsstand.

Rifkin, Glenn. "How the Boston Red Sox Touch All the Branding Bases.," *strategy & business*, October 1, 1999. Accessed May 1, 2015. <http://www.strategy-business.com/article/13714?gko=7e910>.

Shaughnessey, Dan. "One Strike Away: The standard for booting victory is set," *The Boston Globe*, October 22, 2004. ProQuest Newsstand.

Stearns, Peter N. and Carol Z. Stearns. "Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards," *The American Historical Review* 90, no. 4 (October 1985). JSTOR.

\_\_\_\_\_. *Emotion and Social Change: Toward a New Psychohistory*. New York: Holmes & Meier, 1988.

Wald, Matthew L. "Boston Enfolds its Heroes, Waiving Deplorable Act," *The New York Times*, October 30, 1986. ProQuest Newsstand.

"Injustice to Keep Ruth, Says Frazee." *The Sun*, January 5, 1920. Accessed June 2, 2015. Library of Congress.





## *Cal Poly's Response to the AIDS Crisis of the 1980s*

By Tessa St. Clair

"It would probably bother me because it's such a social disease."<sup>1</sup> So responded a student of California Polytechnic State University San Luis Obispo when asked if she would be bothered if a classmate had AIDS for a 1986 article in *The Mustang Daily*. Referring to AIDS as a "social disease," as opposed to a sexually transmitted disease, reflected the common misconception at the time that AIDS could be contracted by casual contact with someone who had it. Many misconceptions arose after the first cases of AIDS, otherwise known as Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome and later known as HIV in its first stages, were reported in June of 1981.<sup>2</sup> Little did the world know that in the following years to come, the number of lives taken by the mysterious disease would total an estimated 34 million as of 2014.<sup>3</sup> Those affected by the virus were of all ethnicities, genders, and even ages: college students and elderly alike.

College campuses were infamously known as institutions full of young and sexually active individuals. Sexually transmitted diseases were considered commonplace at such institutions; however, the outbreak of AIDS and the subsequent years in which research brought new information to light was unlike anything campuses had seen before, and it was for this purpose a closer look at the reactions of Cal Poly students and administration was important. How did Cal Poly respond to the crisis? Did they take extra measures to educate students about AIDS? How did the students themselves feel about the

---

1 Holly Johnson, "Would it Bother you if a Classmate had AIDS?" *The Mustang Daily*, October 1, 1986, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/Gv7Vez>, 2.

2 United States Department of Health and Human Services: AIDS, "A Timeline of HIV/AIDS" 2015, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://www.aids.gov/hiv-aids-basics/hiv-aids-101/aids-timeline/>.

3 United States Department of Health and Human Services: AIDS, "Global Statistics" 2015, accessed February 28, 2016, <https://www.aids.gov/hiv-aids-basics/hiv-aids-101/global-statistics/>.

growing epidemic? Did they subscribe to common misconceptions, such as accusations towards the homosexual community?

To answer these questions, this paper will examine several articles from Cal Poly's newspaper *The Mustang Daily* published in the 1980s. The '80s were the formative years in which the world became increasingly aware of how exactly HIV/AIDS affected the body, how it was transmitted, and what people could do to prevent its spreading. I will use sources that gauge public opinion to examine Cal Poly student responses to the outbreak of AIDS. In addition, this paper will use secondary sources to contrast and compare the responses of other universities to that of Cal Poly. This paper will provide insight into how Cal Poly, a traditionally conservative campus, dealt with the crisis from both the perspective of the administration and student body. While Cal Poly welcomed open discussion about AIDS and made it a priority to inform students of risks, it struggled to provide resources and avoid taboos.

## Historiography

Scholars and health officials alike have extensively researched the AIDS crisis and popular reactions to it; however, student opinions and AIDS prevention on college campuses were less explored. Many sources on this topic are from the first century, after AIDS was first discovered, and signify the increased need to enforce prevention on campus. In an article titled "The AIDS Crisis: Intervention and Prevention," Dr. Vivian B. Brown proclaimed that "the most important goals for colleges and institutions are increasing awareness and providing education" to combat the spread of AIDS.<sup>4</sup> Awareness and education to Cal Poly meant holding as many informational events as possible. Yet, the university held back from direct action such as providing condom dispensers. One study focusing on historically black colleges and universities proposed that the "most salient barriers to safe sex practices were negative views of con-

---

4 Vivian B. Brown, "The AIDS Crisis: Intervention and Prevention," *New Directions for Student Services* 1990.49, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ss.37119904908>, 67.



doms, trust issues and spontaneity.”<sup>5</sup> This idea proved to be true at Cal Poly; students’ opinions on safe sex impacted their choices. Students longed to push past the perception of sex as secretive and make condoms readily available.

Years passed before Cal Poly stopped talking about AIDS and acted. The university mirrored the chaos and struggle of the entire country in the 1980s. In Randy Shilts’ investigative novel, *And the Band Played On*, he expressed extreme disappointment in the handling of the AIDS crisis. He contended that “nearly five years passed before all these institutions—medicine, public health, the federal and private scientific research establishments, the mass media, and the gay community’s leadership—mobilized the way they should in a time of threat.”<sup>6</sup> Shilts’ condemnation of the country’s disorganization suggests that although Cal Poly should have done better, they at least educated students in a world where President Reagan did not even acknowledge AIDS until five years passed.<sup>7</sup> Instances where students, as well as administrators, spoke candidly about AIDS awareness revealed how Cal Poly sought to make changes in the wake of a serious outbreak, which in turn gave insight into the worldwide panic prevalent in the decades following the discovery of AIDS.

## The Students

Looking at student opinion during the AIDS crisis was vital to understanding Cal Poly’s reactions. *The Mustang Daily* was a student-run newspaper, which made what they chose to print about AIDS a reflection of student attitudes towards it. Several articles published during the crisis gauged the opinions of students toward the issues surrounding AIDS. In fact, one passionate student wrote to the editors thanking the paper for “having the courage to print a

---

5 Maurice Y. Mongkuo *et al.*, “Perception of HIV/AIDS and Socio-Cognitive Determinants of Safe Sex Practices Among College Students Attending a Historically Black College and University in the United States of America,” *Journal of AIDS and HIV Research* 2 no. 3 (2010): 34, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://googl/0Lwcn1>.

6 Randy Shilts, *And The Band Played On: Politics, People, and the AIDS Epidemic* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1987), 44.

7 *Ibid.*

featured article on AIDS.<sup>8</sup> The article that the student referred to was an informative article published a few days prior that explained what AIDS was and dispelled several myths about the disease. It included a chart detailing the symptoms and precautions students could take to avoid contracting AIDS.<sup>9</sup> The student's statement showed that it took courage to talk so openly about AIDS, even after three years had passed since its initial outbreak. Cal Poly remained outspoken through the student newspaper by publishing prevention methods and informing students of risks and precautions.

Cal Poly literature revealed major discrepancies when it came to various reports on the level of seriousness with which students perceived AIDS. On one hand, there were several instances when faculty and students themselves maintained an unconcerned attitude towards the virus. A representative for the AIDS foundation in San Francisco, in *The Mustang Daily*, stated that "the biggest problem with college students is they do not see AIDS as a 'young persons disease'."<sup>10</sup> In many cases, the same seems to be true for Cal Poly students. In a 1985 article, only two out of six students responded "yes" to the question "are you concerned about the disease AIDS or are you afraid of catching it?"<sup>11</sup> Yet other publications seemed to tell the opposite story, in some cases within the same article. In an article that interviewed the president of the Cal Poly Gay and Lesbian Student Union (GLSU), he stated that AIDS has strongly impacted his friend group, who consequently decided to cut back on risky behavior since AIDS' spread. Yet the advisor of the GLSU said sentences later that "gay male [Cal Poly] students tend to ignore the issue of AIDS."<sup>12</sup>

---

8 Scott Miller, "Story About AIDS Commended by Reader," *The Mustang Daily*, October 29, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/QNTqny>, 2.

9 Renee Shupe, "A 'Terrifying' Disease: AIDS and its Many Victims," *The Mustang Daily*, October 24, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>, 5.

10 Renee Shupe, "AIDS: Deadly Disease Threatens More Than Homosexuals," *The Mustang Daily*, October 24, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>, 1.

11 Kevin Cannon and Renee Shupe, "Are you Concerned About the Disease AIDS or are you Afraid of Catching It?" *The Mustang Daily*, October 24, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>, 2.

12 Dawn Yoshitake, "AIDS: A Disease Carrying Common Misconceptions," *The Mustang Daily*, April 12, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/SNGsSU>, 6.

The same contradiction arose in a piece focusing on STDs at Cal Poly, when the Director of the Cal Poly Health Center, Dr. James Nash, voiced concerns that students on campus tend to have an “it would never happen to me” mentality and should be more concerned with the rise and spread of AIDS; however, a fellow health professor followed his statement by saying that she found Cal Poly students seemed very concerned as she got several students worried about AIDS coming into the health center each week.<sup>13</sup> One possible explanation for the conflicting reports of student concern was that students believed the cure was just on the horizon. As one student explained in a letter to the editor in 1984, “the cure for AIDS is almost here.”<sup>14</sup> Cal Poly faculty, like Dr. Nash over-exaggerating students’ lack of concern, was another equally valid possibility. Although the question cannot be sufficiently answered, it was clear that students’ concern, or lack thereof, was not due to a lack of knowledge of the virus.

By far one of the biggest misconceptions perpetuated during the years following the AIDS outbreak was that the disease was caused by or exclusively transmitted through homosexual men. This misconception led to many negative reactions and general mistrust or hostility towards homosexual men. Articles and editorials featured in *The Mustang Daily* did not shy away from conversations on this topic, and further analysis revealed that gay youth on Cal Poly’s campus were adversely affected by the AIDS crisis. Miller, the same student who thanked the paper for their candid pieces on AIDS, recalled a woman telling him that gay people “got what they deserve.”<sup>15</sup> This woman was alluding to a theory circulating at the time that AIDS was God’s way of punishing and removing homosexual men from the Earth. Although Miller did not directly implicate Cal Poly, the student did express that he felt strong negativity directed towards homosexual men on campus. Other students,

---

13 Catherine Hernandez, “The Fear of Getting Close,” *The Mustang Daily*, March 4, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/tXfSEQ>, 5.

14 ‘A concerned student’, “People Urged to Recognize Alternative, Gay Lifestyles,” *The Mustang Daily*, November 7, 1984, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/C7W1D4>, 2.

15 Miller, “Story About AIDS Commended by Reader,” 2.

however, were more explicit in pointing a finger at Cal Poly. One such student writing to the editor expressed that they had read and heard “derisive comments about gays at Cal Poly,” in part due to the stigma surrounding AIDS and the belief that it would “cure the world of gays.”<sup>16</sup> These instances were not the only ones indicating that Cal Poly was affected by social stigma surrounding AIDS. Gene Calgari, the president of the GLSU, shared similar insight in an article focused on the growing anti-gay attitude at Cal Poly. Calgari stated that he had observed anti-gay sentiment on campus and that he believed that such sentiment was preventing closeted students from coming out.<sup>17</sup> A fellow member of the GLSU stated on another occasion that she highly doubted any gay students who suspected they could be infected would go to the campus health center due to the stigma surrounding AIDS.<sup>18</sup> As given in these testimonies, many students acknowledged that they felt marginalized or discriminated against because of the opprobrium of their fellow students; however, the fact that the paper chose to include the testimonies at all and allowed students to openly discuss the issue demonstrates the willingness of Cal Poly to address AIDS and peoples’ thoughts on the virus.

## The Administration

The student’s opinions gave insight into how the student body dealt with the stigma and common misconceptions associated with the topic of AIDS. To further understand the reaction of Cal Poly as a whole, an analysis of the administration’s responses to AIDS is also necessary. It was, after all, campus administration’s responsibility to decide how to deal with the growing epidemic. When it came to education and awareness of AIDS, administration prevailed in creating open discussions. *The Mustang Daily* published several stories on AIDS, which signified that Cal Poly’s administration allowed such discussion to be presented to students.

---

16 ‘A concerned student’, “People Urged to Recognize Alternative, Gay Lifestyles,” 2.

17 Jerry McKay, “Anti-gay Attitude Increasing,” *The Mustang Daily*, January 22, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/OyCgb9>, 4.

18 Yoshitake, “AIDS,” 4.

The administration went beyond simply allowing the paper freedom of press; they also invited guest speakers to speak about AIDS, held conferences aimed at educating the student body, and teamed up with local organizations to keep students well-informed. For example, Richard Siegel, a genetics professor at UCLA, came to Cal Poly in 1987 and gave an informative talk about AIDS.<sup>19</sup> In similar fashion, Richard Keeling of the American College Health Association, visited Cal Poly during a two-day awareness event. Keeling warned that AIDS' spread to college campuses was imminent and that statistically "about 45 to 50 Cal Poly students [should] have the virus."<sup>20</sup> Keeling's warning cry of an increase in AIDS cases at Cal Poly was not unique, but rather echoed others who made the same prediction. In an informational meeting similar to several events held at Cal Poly in the 1980s, administration worked in coordination with the AIDS project coordinator for the tri-counties. The event sought to "provoke community discussion" about AIDS.<sup>21</sup> Additional effort was made by Cal Poly's health center; it teamed up with the San Luis Obispo County AIDS task force to provide assistance in the form of an AIDS support group created to help both AIDS patients and those who had lost loved ones to the disease.<sup>22</sup> Cal Poly showed students not only their willingness to provide counseling services to loved ones, but also support for local efforts to educate the community. While administration provided many events and informational talks, these events were optional. More permanent methods of education included a huge push by Cal Poly professors to more adequately educate students on AIDS and prevention techniques in 1987. They vowed to begin lecturing on AIDS extensively in health courses and include textbooks that provided AIDS information.<sup>23</sup> The addition of AIDS to the curriculum

---

19 Carol J. Vance, "AIDS: The Modern Plague," *The Mustang Daily*, May 8, 1984, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/yU9I50>, 1.

20 Mark Ahlemeyer, "Universities Must Face Reality of AIDS Crisis, Says Expert," *The Mustang Daily*, April 6, 1989, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/T6bYI6>, 1.

21 "AIDS Conference Slated for June as SV Hospital," *The Mustang Daily*, May 18, 1985, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/zORo1L>, 2.

22 Yoshitake, "AIDS: A Disease Carrying Common Misconceptions," 6.

23 Carol J. Vance, "AIDS to be Part of Books, Classes," *The Mustang Daily*, April 9, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/sYHPYj>, 3.

affirmed that the campus was making a legitimate effort to keep their students informed.

Cal Poly was very successful at informing students about AIDS by providing all of the necessary tools to learn more. However, when it came to going beyond words and taking action, Cal Poly lacked in taking stronger measures. For example, although Cal Poly repetitively encouraged the use of protection, the ongoing debate over providing contraceptives failed due to administrations inability to look past taboos rooted in ignorance. In 1987, the Student Senate made an effort to place condom dispensers in campus restrooms.<sup>24</sup> The resolution passed, only to be vetoed by ASI president Kevin Swanson, who illogically insisted that readily available condoms would promote promiscuity and abortion rates and that “education is the only real solution for the epidemic.”<sup>25</sup> Therefore, the taboo of sex as strictly private and protection as promiscuous trumped proactive action to help prevent AIDS.

Furthermore, a second motion included in the Student Senate’s proposal that brought increased AIDS and STD awareness passed; this showed that administration backed AIDS awareness, but would not take one step beyond this symbolic stance by adding condom dispensers.<sup>26</sup> The movement to add condoms to the restrooms provoked numerous responses from students in the subsequent editorials. One student, Debbie Johnson, fully supported the veto of the Student Senate’s proposal, remarking that “condoms are available at health centers and drug stores and it should stay that way.”<sup>27</sup> Her remarks sparked two passionate responses from students, Elise Stewart and Laura Robinson, who both wrote in to the editor the following week.<sup>28</sup> They both argued against Johnson’s ideas; Stewart added that “[condoms] are a means

---

24 Kim Holweger, “Student Senate OKs Condoms in Poly Restrooms,” *The Mustang Daily*, May 22, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/pT3PJ5>, 1.

25 Kim Holweger, “S. Senate Can’t Override Condom Dispenser Veto,” *The Mustang Daily*, May 29, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/P1bDte>, 1.

26 *Ibid.*, 1.

27 Debbie Johnson, “Wall Mounting not the Answer,” *The Mustang Daily*, October 29, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/wCvoCx>, 2.

28 Laura Robinson, “Condoms cont.,” *The Mustang Daily*, November 3, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/9mCimw>, 2.

to save your life...until the cure for AIDS is found.”<sup>29</sup> The student’s mixed responses showed that although many students demonstrated more progressive attitudes towards prevention, some stood by Cal Poly’s conservatism. The fear of promoting promiscuity, or of being seen as doing so, became one of the major setbacks that persuaded administration away from taking firm action.

## A Comparison with San Francisco State University

AIDS was a commonly explored subject because of its massive effect on the world. The disease came unexpectedly and was shrouded in mystery during the first years of its discovery; it went from a nameless illness, to a widely known and feared plague. Due to its sudden nature, Cal Poly, along with all college campuses, had no existing plan for the occurrence of a global outbreak. In 1985, three years after AIDS was given a name and its symptoms became known, Cal Poly still had no plan in place specifying any regulations in relations to AIDS. At this time, the school was merely following the instructions of the CDC.<sup>30</sup> In a 1985 article, Dr. Nash argued that any Cal Poly student that might become infected should be allowed to remain on campus.<sup>31</sup> That same year, San Francisco State University, a fellow CSU, already created an AIDS task force aimed at educating students of the virus; it also established a non-discrimination policy meant to protect HIV positive students. The task force was the “first committee to address HIV/AIDS on campuses in the nation [and] the first non-discrimination policy in the nation [for AIDS patients].”<sup>32</sup> When it came to AIDS prevention and acting quickly, San Francisco State was much more progressive in their reaction than Cal Poly was.

Some may argue that SFSU’s haste in acquiring AIDS programs can be explained by the fact that AIDS was more prevalent there; however, San Francisco had a much denser population than San Luis Obispo and it is incorrect

---

29 Elise Stewart, “The Restroom is for Condoms,” *The Mustang Daily*, November 3, 1987, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/9mCimw>, 2.

30 Shupe, “AIDS: Deadly Disease Threatens More Than Homosexuals,” 1.

31 *Ibid.*, 1.

32 Avery Peterson, “Timeline: The History of SF’s Fight Against AIDS,” *Golden Gate Express*, April 14, 2015, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goldengatexpress.org/2015/04/14/aids-awareness-day-1985/>.

to assume that San Luis Obispo was untouched by AIDS. In 1986 there was twelve known cases of AIDS in San Luis Obispo county.<sup>33</sup> By 1989, that number had nearly tripled to 34 known cases.<sup>34</sup> These figures only include reported cases, which disregards the number of cases where individuals either did not wish to publicize their status, or were not even aware that they were infected. Cal Poly did not establish a non-discrimination policy, as Dr. Nash had fought for, until the following year in 1986. The policy was not put into place by Cal Poly itself, rather by a campus-wide mandate for all California State Universities.<sup>35</sup>

## Overview of Cal Poly

The articles produced by *The Mustang Daily* opened up several discussions about AIDS and revealed how students' opinions of the crisis affected them. The administration's words and actions also gave insight into the management during an epidemic. Cal Poly did fall victim to certain taboos encompassing the AIDS virus. Homosexual men at Cal were deeply affected by taboos; as a group, they especially felt the strain of judgment transferred from the epidemic to their select group of people. At this time, sex was seen as taboo, and the promotion of condoms was seen as promoting promiscuity (mainly by the fault of administration). In spite of seemingly unavoidable taboos for Cal Poly, it made a superior effort to always keep students well-educated about the disease through the various different events, both local and campus based, which students were invited to. The mixed consensus of students, either terrified of AIDS or unaffected by any paranoia, showed that students were indeed thinking critically about the crisis during its development. What distinguished Cal Poly from other universities like San Francisco State was their hesitation to put into play actual policies or provide more mobilized support to help students.

---

33 Shupe, "AIDS: Deadly Disease Threatens More Than Homosexuals," 1.

34 San Luis Obispo County Public Health Department AIDS Program, "Epidemiological Profile HIV/AIDS in San Luis Obispo County, CA," June 2007, accessed February 28, 2016, <http://goo.gl/G6XHkU>.

35 Peterson, "Timeline."



A look at Cal Poly at the present revealed that the university changed dramatically. During Cal Poly's "Week of Welcome," new students attend talks that include information on safe sex practices. Students are made aware of the resources, like the health center, which sell condoms and Plan B contraceptives at a low cost.<sup>36</sup> PULSE, a peer health education team on campus, has a branch called EROS. EROS is entirely dedicated to "best guide you with birth control choices and relevant safe-sex practices, inform you about sexually transmitted infections (STIs), and direct [students] to make healthy decisions about sex."<sup>37</sup> Condoms are also sold at on-campus stores such as Campus Market. Cal Poly's Pride Center acts as a safe space for the LGBTQ community and provides counseling services.<sup>38</sup> In addition to these options, the health center has a link on their website directing students to where they can get more information on AIDS/HIV, including where they can be anonymously tested, or for those already diagnosed, where they can seek counseling.<sup>39</sup> Availability and education have increased, in large part due to the conversation the AIDS crisis started on safe sex and the role of the campus in prevention.

---

36 California Polytechnic University San Luis Obispo, "Plan B- Emergency Contraception," *Campus Health and Wellbeing*, accessed March 13, 2016, <http://www.hcs.calpoly.edu/content/health/planb>.

37 California Polytechnic University San Luis Obispo, "Educational Resources on Sexuality," *Campus Health and Wellbeing*, accessed March 13, 2016, <http://hcs.calpoly.edu/pulse/students/teams/EROS>.

38 California Polytechnic University San Luis Obispo, "Pride Center," *Dean of Students*, accessed March 13, 2016, <http://www.deanofstudents.calpoly.edu/content/pride/index>.

39 California Polytechnic University San Luis Obispo, "AIDS/HIV Information," *Campus Health and Wellbeing*, accessed March 13, 2016, <http://hcs.calpoly.edu/content/health/aidshiv>.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- 'A concerned student'. "People Urged to Recognize Alternative, Gay Lifestyles." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. November 7, 1984. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/C7W1D4>.
- Ahlemeyer, Mark. "Universities Must Face Reality of AIDS Crisis, Says Expert." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. April 6, 1989. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/T6bY16>.
- "AIDS Conference Slated for June as SV Hospital." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. May 18, 1984. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/zORo1L>.
- Brown, Vivian B. "The AIDS Crisis: Intervention and Prevention." *New Directions for Student Services* 1990.49 (Spring 1990): 67-74. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ss.37119904908>.
- California Polytechnic University San Luis Obispo. "AIDS/HIV Information." *Campus Health and Wellbeing*. Accessed March 13, 2016. <http://hcs.calpoly.edu/content/health/aidshiv>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Educational Resources on Sexuality." *Campus Health and Wellbeing*. Accessed March 13, 2016. <http://hcs.calpoly.edu/pulse/students/teams/EROS>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Plan B- Emergency Contraception." *Campus Health and Wellbeing*. Accessed March 13, 2016. <http://www.hcs.calpoly.edu/content/health/planb>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Pride Center." *Dean of Students*. Accessed March 13, 2016. <http://www.deanofstudents.calpoly.edu/content/pride/index>.
- Cannon, Kevin and Shupe, Renee. "Are you Concerned About the Disease AIDS or are you Afraid of Catching It?" *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 24, 1985. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>.
- Hernandez, Catherine. "The Fear of Getting Close." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. March 4, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/tXfSEQ>.

- Holweger, Kim. "S. Senate Can't Override Condom Dispenser Veto." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. May 29, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/P1bDte>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Student Senate OKs Condoms in Poly Restrooms." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. May 22, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/pT3PJ5>.
- Johnson, Debbie. "Wall Mounting not the Answer." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 29, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/wCvoCx>.
- Johnson, Holly. "Would it Bother you if a Classmate had AIDS?" *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 1, 1986. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/Gv7Vez>.
- McKay, Jerry. "Anti-gay Attitude Increasing." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. January 22, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/OyCgb9>.
- Miller, Scott. "Story About AIDS Commended by Reader." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 29, 1985. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/QNTqny>.
- Mongkuo, Maurice Y., Mushi, Richard J., and Thomas, Rollinda. "Perception of HIV/AIDS and Socio-Cognitive Determinants of Safe Sex Practices Among College Students Attending a Historically Black College and University in the United States of America." *Journal of AIDS and HIV Research* 2.3 (2010): 34. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/OLwcn1>.
- Peterson, Avery. "Timeline: The history of SF State's fight against AIDS." *Golden Gate Express*. April 14, 2015. Accessed March 10, 2016. <http://goldengatexpress.org/2015/04/14/aids-awareness-day-1985/>.

Ramsum, Darlene L., Stephen A. Marion, and Richard G. Mathias. "Changes in University Students' Aids-related Knowledge, Attitudes and Behaviours, 1988 and 1992." *Canadian Journal of Public Health* 84.4 (July/August 1993): 275–78. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41991035>.

Robinson, Laura. "Condoms cont." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. November 3, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/9mCimw>.

San Luis Obispo County Public Health Department AIDS Program. "Epidemiological Profile HIV/AIDS in San Luis Obispo County, CA." June 2007. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/G6XHkU>.

Shilts, Randy. *And the Band Played On*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1987.

Shupe, Renee. "AIDS: Deadly Disease Threatens More Than Homosexuals." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 24, 1985. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>.

\_\_\_\_\_. "A 'Terrifying' Disease: AIDS And its Many Victims." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. October 24, 1985. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/jgZdZM>.

Stewart, Elise. "The Restroom is for Condoms." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. November 3, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/9mCimw>.

United States Department of Health and Human Services: AIDS. "A Timeline of HIV/AIDS." 2015. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://www.aids.gov/hiv-aids-basics/hiv-aids-101/aids-timeline/>.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Global Statistics." 2015. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://www.aids.gov/hiv-aids-basics/hiv-aids-101/aids-timeline/>.

Vance, Carol J. "AIDS: The Modern Plague." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. May 8, 1984. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/yU9150>.

\_\_\_\_\_. "AIDS to be Part of Books, Classes." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. April 9, 1987. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/sYHPYj>.

Yoshitake, Dawn. "AIDS: A Disease Carrying Common Misconceptions." *The Mustang Daily*. California Polytechnic State University. April 12, 1985. Accessed February 28, 2016. <http://goo.gl/SNGsSU>.



## *Disparity or Equality: How Were Female Students Treated from 1917-1920*

*By Charlie Williams*

For years, a girl's place was in the home. Days and nights were spent cooking, cleaning, and waiting on the hand and foot of their families. There was very little, if any, room to advance and make a career while trapped inside the body of a woman. This view on female sexuality and gender roles started to improve during the Progressive Era between the 1890s and 1920s. At this juncture in time, women gained the right to vote and even started to leave the house. Many women also took a leap of faith and started the journey of earning a college degree on campuses across the United States. California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo was one of those schools where women found a place to study. During World War I, female involvement in academics may have been seen as groundbreaking due to the fact that women were relatively new to higher education; however, women on campus were treated as substandard. Their ability to grow as intellectuals and innovate new technologies and ideas was halted by the patriarchal, male dominated, nature of the college institution at the time. By looking at the course catalogs and yearbooks released by Cal Poly between the years 1917 and 1920 one can easily come to the conclusion that male students were the top priority of the institution.

The Progressive Era was a time full of change. Social reform was popular during the 1910s and 1920s, and more liberal times allowed women an opportunity to rise up. It seemed that this groundbreaking culture would continue to be a catalyst, granting more and more reform to continue and allow women to enter fields never before seen as fitting or possible; however, males were afraid that their sacred institutions, such as higher education and the work force, were going to be ruined due to female influence. Because of this, panic spread throughout society. This point is best exemplified by an article from

## Good Housekeeping in 1917:

*"In the lifetime of girls even twenty years old, the tradition of what girls should be and do in the world has changed as much as herefore in a century. It used to be that girls looked forward with confidence to domestic life as their destiny. That is still the destiny of most of them, but it is a destiny that in this generation seems to be modified for all, and avoided by very many..."*<sup>1</sup>

The article suggests that women were fleeing domestic life in droves in search of a way to help them join the work force; however, there was no real epidemic and the amount of females actually attending college was rather small.

Linda Rosenzweig, author of "The Anchor of My Life: Middle-Class American Mothers and Their College Daughters," suggested that those in charge of higher education during the Progressive Era offered a degree in the Household Arts in order to keep the idea of domesticity a top priority while also allowing women to grow and branch out from the household.<sup>2</sup> Rosenzweig stated that "new women," or women who resisted tradition, wanted to broaden their horizons and apply for clerical or sales jobs; at Cal Poly during WWI, these women would be searching for a job as a nurse or homemaker.<sup>3</sup> In order to attain these jobs, secondary school offered what was considered an educational experience and a variety of women's organizations.<sup>4</sup> Rosenzweig may have been generalizing college campuses when making this assertion, because in contrast, Cal Poly only had one club specifically for women according to Cal Poly's yearbook, the *Polytechnic Annual*. As "Anchor of My Life" extends, the "scope, scale, and speed of change" characterized the Progressive Era, specifically in the areas of industrialization and technology.<sup>5</sup> College campuses were, and are today, a center of this innovation. Yet, despite their ability to create productive change, college campuses and society as a whole hindered a woman's ability to conduct research and innovate by confining them to the

---

1 Linda Rosenzweig, "The Anchor of My Life: Middle-Class American Mothers and College Educated Daughters, 1880-1920," *Journal of Social History* 25, no. 1 (1991): 5.

2 Rosenzweig,.

3 Rosenzweig, 5.

4 Rosenzweig, 5.

5 Rosenzweig, 6.



majors of Household Arts and Academics. These degrees could do no more than prepare a nurse at the highest level and left women without the ability to create change in the fields of science and mathematics.

The course catalogs from Cal Poly's Special Collections and Archives exemplifies the point that only supporting a woman's effort in gaining Household Arts and Academic degrees stifled innovation. First, under the section titled "Purpose", the Cal Poly catalog from 1916-1917 specifically stated that "It [the campus] offers a strong course in Engineering-Mechanics which trains young men for life in the shops, power plants and the various branches of the electrical industry" and "to the young woman it offers practical training in housekeeping and homemaking; in fact in all phases of Household Arts."<sup>6</sup> The catalog from this year continued to use gender specific pronouns when referring to certain programs, as does the course catalog from 1918-1920. Besides using restrictive language, the curriculum suggested for Household Arts majors was far less rigorous than that of an engineering degree and thus, did not challenge women to be ambitious and achieve. For example, in the 1916-1917 catalog a woman in the Household Arts program would study Mathematics 1 during her sophomore year. Her male counterpart on the other hand, who studied science or agriculture, would start off with Mathematics 3 his freshman year.<sup>7</sup> This trend was very similar in the 1918-1920 catalog; however, World War I was reflected more during these later years because Hygiene and First Aid was taught for the specific purpose of leading women to a career in nursing.<sup>8</sup> It is clear that women were not seen as having academic potential, and were generally ignored on campus as illustrated by the *Polytechnic Annual*.

The *Polytechnic Annual* undoubtedly illustrated the under appreciation of female involvement on campus. In order to even know how many female students attended the university at this time, one must precisely count how many

---

6 "Bulletin on Information," 1916-1917, Course Catalogs, University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA, 5.

7 "Bulletin of Information," 1916-1917, 35-41.

8 "Bulletin on Information," 1918-1920, Course Catalogs, University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA, 4-32.

women there were in the actual yearbook. This proved that females were not important enough to note in any other format, whether in course catalogs or in the student newspaper. In addition, there was no major growth in female graduation rates. In fact, the number of female graduates actually decreased from the years 1917-1920. For example, in 1917, out of 24 graduates only eight were female and in 1919 out of eleven graduates only two were women.<sup>9</sup> The fact that there was such a drastic decrease shows that the university did not focus on helping women through graduation. It appears that if female students fell behind, then they were left to fail and not encouraged to pick themselves up and try again. Post graduation, the places where female graduates chose to continue on varied. A few women continued their education in the hopes of becoming a nurse. In this sense, Cal Poly did prepare female students enough to allow them to continue their education. During the World War I, helping women become nurses was very important; however, Cal Poly failed to encourage the continued success of other female students who were not joining the nursing field. It can also be implied that society did not encourage this success as well, considering the time period. As stated in the yearbooks from 1917-1920, women that did not become nurses would often return home to become homemakers.<sup>10</sup> Even though universities were educating women, their degrees could not launch them into intellectual jobs and kept them with in the home.

Cal Poly treated the women on campus as second-class students in comparison to men. The course catalogs illustrated that the rigor of coursework for women did not allow ambitious students to excel. In addition, the gender pronouns used in these catalogs strongly associated science degrees to men and household degrees to women. Continued disparity was illustrated by the fact

---

9 "Polytechnic Annual 1917," June 1917, California Polytechnic State University Annuals, University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA, 6-14. "Polytechnic Annual 1919," June 1919, California Polytechnic State University Annuals, University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA, 5-7.

10 "Polytechnic Annual 1917," 71-72. "Polytechnic Annual 1920," June 1920, California Polytechnic State University Annuals, University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA, 46-47.

that the only documentation to the amount of women on campus was shown by the pictures of female students in the yearbook. Institutions, such as Cal Poly, did not overtly encourage women to continue their education as shown by the small amount of alumni who decided to continue studying at other universities. It is disappointing to think that women were not given the opportunity to fulfill their true potential, especially with the momentum gained from the Progressive Era. While Cal Poly did succeed in generating qualified nurses for the war effort, it would have been much more encouraging if the institution encouraged female students from the very beginning.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- “Bulletin of Information.” 1916-1917. Course Catalogs. University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA.
- “Bulletin of Information.” 1918-1920. Course Catalogs. University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA.
- “Polytechnic Annual 1917.” June 1917. California Polytechnic State University Annals. University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA.
- “Polytechnic Annual 1919.” June 1919. California Polytechnic State University Annals. University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA.
- “Polytechnic Annual 1920.” June 1920. California Polytechnic State University Annals. University Archives, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo, CA.
- Rosenzweig, Linda W. “The Anchor of My Life: Middle-Class American Mothers and College-Educated Daughters, 1880-1920.” *Journal of Social History* 25, no. 1 (1991): 5-6.





## *Paving Paradise: The Royal Hawaiian and The Rise of Waikiki Tourism, 1901-1929*

*By Alika Bourgette*

My memory of the Royal? I recall ordering a scratch mai tai and watching a bead of condensation roll down the side of its glass. The aptly named Mai Tai Bar at the Royal Hawaiian Hotel remains one of my favorite places to enjoy a tropical cocktail. Steps removed from Waikiki Beach, the outdoor bar proves one of the best places to people-watch. Eager tourists line up at kiosks to rent surfboards, schedule catamaran tours, or buy sunscreen. Countless heads bob on the placid water protected from surging swells by a seawall. A sandcastle enthusiast duo excavates the white sand by the wheelbarrow-load to erect a 1:100 scale model of the lost city of Tenochtitlan. Even for locals, Waikiki provides an escape from the mundane.

From sacred ritual grounds to world-class resort destination to package-deal paradise, Waikiki has reinvented itself throughout its history. Unique amongst Hawaiian resort experiences, most of which offer privacy and tranquility against breath-taking beaches, Waikiki has an urban soul. Tied to the growth of Honolulu, Waikiki transitioned into a vibrant and modern cityscape in the early twentieth century. While hostelrys have sat in the Waikiki sand since 1901 with the opening of the Moana, the 1920s represented the birth of Waikiki as a premier resort locale. The completions of the Ala Wai Canal in 1924 and the Royal Hawaiian Hotel in 1927 sowed the seeds for future growth of the district. This paper will chart the development of Waikiki through study of the two projects, uncovering important figures and events from broader Hawaiian history. It will also analyze popular perception and understanding of Hawaii through the early twentieth century by reviewing advertisements, newspaper and magazine articles, and literary works that revealed often patronizing and romanticized views. The Royal Hawaiian Ho-

tel represented Hawaii's first modern, world-class resort, paving the way for Waikiki to become a successful tourist destination.

### **Antiquity to Ala Wai: Laying the Infrastructure**

The popular, present-day image of Waikiki Beach: waving palms against a white, sandy shore looking out toward the lush, green peak of Diamond Head in the distance, would appear unrecognizable to onlookers from a century ago. Waikiki's name, which translates as "place of spouting water," harkens back to the artesian springs and flowing streams that used to feed the fertile lands.<sup>1</sup> Prior to the 1920s and the construction of the Ala Wai Canal, the lowlands of Waikiki served as important agricultural grounds, where fishponds and taro fields provided sustenance to the inhabitants of a burgeoning Honolulu. Upon their final approach to shore, new arrivals to Honolulu Harbor passed by the quaint farming lands of Waikiki and saw a fleeting reminder of the island's past.<sup>2</sup> By the turn of the twentieth century, the city that surrounded Waikiki developed into a modern metropolis where streetcars clanged and crowds formed and dissipated with the traffic of daily life. Waikiki, however, carried on as it always had. The broad-leafed taro rustled in the wind, surrounding the country homes where the ruling *ali'i* had once vacationed. In the days before modern tourism, Waikiki had already become recognized as a place for relaxation and enjoyment.

At Helumoa, the present-day site of the Royal Hawaiian Hotel, sat the Royal Palm Garden, a collection of over 10,000 coconut palms that found its origins in the antiquity period of Hawaiian History. The grove had religious importance to early Native Hawaiians, who had constructed *heiaus* (temples) on the land, and made the land accessible only to the high-ranking chiefs of Oahu. Upon his unification of the Hawaiian Islands in 1810, King Kame-

---

1 Masakazu Ejiri, "Development of Waikiki, 1900-1949: The Formative Period in American Resort Paradise" (PhD. diss., University of Hawaii, 1996), 20.

2 Robert L. Wiegel, "Waikiki Beach, Oahu, Hawaii: History of Its Transformation From a Natural to an Urban Shore," *Shore and Beach* 76 (Spring 2008), 3.



hameha I selected Helumoa as his administrative center on the island.<sup>3</sup> After Kamehameha I's reign, Helumoa fell out of religious use, but remained a royal residence for his descendants. Access to fresh water and a secluded beach, along with the shade and privacy afforded by the Royal Palm Garden made Helumoa a favorite retreat for Hawaii's rulers, who had relocated official residence into Honolulu proper.<sup>4</sup> King Kamehameha V (1863-1872) developed the parcel that would become the Royal Hawaiian Hotel for his personal use. The land today remains held in trust by the estate of Princess Bernice Pauahi Bishop, one of the largest and wealthiest land-holding trusts in Hawaii<sup>5</sup>.

Before Waikiki could begin its transformation from underdeveloped, private retreat for royalty to premium resort locale for the merely wealthy, the land had to be reshaped to this purpose. The 'spouting waters' of Waikiki rendered its soils saturated and prone to flooding. The streams that fed the Waikiki with fresh water also carried silt and alluvium from the nearby mountains into the wetlands and out to the sea. The first decades of the twentieth century brought increased development to the area, which interrupted the natural processes of erosion and water flow. The construction of Kalakaua Avenue and the first Waikiki resorts, including the Moana and the Seaside between 1901 and 1906, resulted in the disruption of natural drainage of freshwater to the ocean.<sup>6</sup> As a result, the streams that fed Waikiki became stagnant and filled with silt. The muck that filled the wetlands surrounding the first Waikiki resorts fomented unsanitary conditions. In 1913, the seepage of fetid water reached the shores of the Moana Hotel, sparking tourists' disgust and protest. According to an account in the *Pacific Commercial Advertiser*, one resort patron demanded, "something be done to prevent a future display of river sweepings in what has been advertised as one of the most romantic and perfect tempered

---

3 Andrea Feeser and Gaye Chan, *Waikiki: A History of Forgetting and Remembering* (University of Hawaii Press, 2007), 65.

4 Ejiri, 75.

5 Feeser and Chan, 66.

6 Wiegel, 6.

bathing places in the world.”<sup>7</sup> That something came in the form of the dredging of the Ala Wai Canal in 1921.

The construction of the Ala Wai Canal allowed for the reclamation of Waikiki, paving the way for the area to become a successful resort destination. Two men helped shape the creation of the canal, Lucius Eugene Pinkham, Governor of the Territory of Hawaii from 1913-1918, and Walter Francis Dillingham, owner of the Hawaiian Dredging Company. On February 21, 1906, Pinkham, President of the Board of Health, announced his plan, stating that the wetlands were “incapable of drainage” and “in an unsanitary and dangerous condition.”<sup>8</sup> However, from plan’s onset, Waikiki residents understood the true nature of the dredging project. The creation of the canal would dry the taro farms and fishponds along the coast and imperil their livelihood. Furthermore, Pinkham’s plan included the introduction of a grid pattern to Waikiki that could incorporate building sites for real property. Of the redevelopment, Pinkham stated, “In making my plan, I merely suggested to [the City Surveyor] that we put in streets, connecting up the roads, and this was done, but without the idea that the plan as drawn was an arbitrary one. I believe the land could be sold, perhaps to newcomers. Anyway, it is going to be a go.”<sup>9</sup> With that, Pinkham revealed his true intention for Waikiki to shed its provincial status as a reminder of Oahu’s agrarian past. The inception of the Ala Wai Canal allowed for the incorporation of Waikiki into the modern city of Honolulu as its premier resort district.

Once planned, initiating the groundwork for the Ala Wai Canal proved challenging. Appointed Territory Governor of Hawaii by President Woodrow Wilson in 1913, Pinkham finally gained the political authority necessary to enact his plan. Having worked longtime for the Oahu Railway and Land Company and Pacific Hardware, both Dillingham-owned firms, it followed

---

7 “Sluiced Lagoon Water into Waikiki Water and Drove Fair Bathers Away,” *The Pacific Commercial Advertiser*. February 16, 1913, 9, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. Lib. of Congress.

8 “Pinkham Plans the Reclamation of All Waikiki,” *Evening Bulletin*. February 21, 1906, 1, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. Lib. of Congress.

9 “Pinkham Plan to Reclaim Waikiki to be Tried,” *The Pacific Commercial Advertiser*. March 16, 1906, 5, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. Lib. of Congress.

that Pinkham awarded the Ala Wai Canal contract to his friend Walter Francis Dillingham's Hawaiian Dredging Company.<sup>10</sup> The canal would run a two-mile stretch roughly parallel with the coast, capturing the drainage of Waikiki's streams, carrying the water to the ocean at Ala Wai Harbor. Pinkham secured the land necessary to begin dredging through eminent domain. When dredging began in 1921, the families displaced by the project refused to vacate their land, with some remaining until dredging crews arrived at their door.<sup>11</sup> The soils dredged from the canal served as filling material for the wetlands on either side. In this way, Dillingham's Hawaiian Dredging Company converted 687 acres of wet agricultural land into a space suitable for real estate.<sup>12</sup>

Dillingham enacted Pinkham's vision of creating a canal that would form a focal point for tourism in Hawaii. While the reclamation of Waikiki did allow for future development of the land, the Ala Wai Canal failed to live up to expectations of because of shortcomings in its design. Pinkham envisioned the canal itself as an attraction, regarding it as the "Venice of the Pacific." However, upon the project's completion in 1924, Dillingham had led it over its \$100,000 budget. To reduce costs, he scraped a planned second outlet to the ocean that would have ran through Kapiolani Park on the canal's end nearer to Diamond Head.<sup>13</sup> With its only outlet at the Ala Wai Harbor, the canal became a basin for sediment and run-off that used to flow out to sea along the natural streams of Waikiki. Accumulating 8,000 to 10,000 cubic yards of siltation a year and requiring periodic re-dredging, the Ala Wai Canal today remains a source of pollutants dangerous to human health and damaging to the environment surrounding Waikiki.<sup>14</sup> Instead of solving the health risk posed by the stagnant waters that collected in Waikiki, Pinkham's canal moved the issue further inland and contained it within the banks of the Ala Wai. Nonetheless, with Waikiki cleared of farmland and open to real estate

---

10 Ejiri, 242.

11 Feeser and Chan, 27.

12 Ejiri, 239.

13 Ejiri, 250-251.

14 Wiegel, 12.

development, the Ala Wai Canal irreversibly changed Waikiki's place within the cityscape. Pinkham's dream of a resort paradise within Honolulu would soon become reality.

## Conceptions of Hawaii: Ads, Articles, and Literature

Mainlanders' conception of Hawaii at the turn of the twentieth century shaped the way Waikiki tourism developed. Early literary accounts of Hawaii, steeped in patronizing and romanticized imagery, captured the imaginations of tourist advertisers, travel writers, and ultimately the broader public-at-large. In the decades bookending the year 1900, notable American literary figures, including Mark Twain, Robert Louis Stevenson, and Jack London, harbored a fascination for Hawaii and produce titles describing their experiences with positive enthusiasm. As the most contemporaneous of the three, Jack London's tales crystallized the stereotypical image of Hawaii in the minds of the article writers and advertisers in the first half of the twentieth century. Jack London visited Hawaii twice. First in 1907 aboard his voyaging yacht, the *Snark*, as part of a broader tour of the South Pacific, and then again in late 1915, making at that time a more extended stay.<sup>15</sup> During his initial visit, he rented a tent cabin on the premises of the Seaside Hotel in Waikiki. He spent time their gathering inspiration for his collection of South Seas stories, and needed to look no further than beyond his front door, where he observed a group of locals surfing, which he called, "a royal sport for the natural kings of earth."<sup>16</sup> London at first contented himself to observe the surfers at play, awed by their mastery of the sport. Catching their attention, the group offered to teach him how to surf, and he accepted. Though he did not succeed in catching a wave, the experience resonated with him. In his story "A Royal Sport," he remarked:

*Where but the moment before was only wide desolation and invincible roar, is now a man erect, full-stature, not struggling frantically in that wild movement, not buried and crush and buffeted by those mighty monsters, but*

---

15 James L. Haley, *Wolf: The Lives of Jack London* (New York: Basic Books, 2010), 247, 300.

16 Jack London, "A Royal Sport" in *The Cruise of the Snark: Jack London's South Sea Adventure* (Santa Barbara: Narrative Press, 2001), 50.

*standing above them all...flying forward, flying fast as teh surge on which he stands. he is a Mercury — a brown Mercury.*<sup>17</sup>

Jack London's depiction of Native Hawaiians as friendly and civilized, yet primitive became an established caricature for nonwhite peoples of Hawaii. London's observations, similar to other accounts from the time, revealed a romanticized notion of *Orientalism* popular in the late Victorian period into the early twentieth century.<sup>18</sup> As Hawaii started to grow into a tourist destination, idealized perceptions of the islands dominated advertisements and travel articles of the period.

Early tourist literature crafted a romanticized vision of Hawaii, promoting its exoticism through idealized observations. Following Jack London's lead, travel writers sought out "authentic" experiences of their own when visiting Hawaii; however, the experiences they shared revealed their paternal fascination with "native" culture. Viewing a society they saw as vastly different from their own, visiting writers believed that the experiences they captured harkened back to a primitive past.<sup>19</sup> Hawaiian water sports, in particular, found popularity in tourist narratives. Of outrigger canoeing, a *Los Angeles Times* journalist wrote:

*There is a native in the prow to paddle and another in the stern to steer and when they get the canoe about half-way over to San Francisco, suddenly they decide to turn around and let the sportive billows play tag with helpless you. From long years of experience these natives know just when and where to make this turn, and best of all, they know how to do it.*<sup>20</sup>

As also seen in Jack London's accounts of surfing, water sports provided an opportunity for visitors to imagine an idyllic island culture removed from modern complications. The unique cultural experiences they encountered allowed tourists to romanticize Hawaii as a timeless land immune to the ravages of modernity. A travel writer for *Vogue* captured this sentiment, stating of

---

17 "Truth About Waikiki Beach," *Los Angeles Times*, June 6, 1920, III, 32, ProQuest Historical Newspapers.

18 Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979).

19 Jane Desmond, "Picturing Hawaii: The "Ideal" Native and the Origins of Tourism, 1880-1915," in *Positions: East Asia Culture Critique* 7 (Duke University Press, 1999), 462.

20 "Truth About Waikiki Beach," *Los Angeles Times*, June 6, 1920, III, 32, ProQuest Historical Newspapers.

Honolulu, "It is the most Oriental of Occidental cities, the most Occidental of Oriental; and, since it is so distant from the customary center of human habitation, the eyes of weary men turn towards it wistfully as a haven of escape from the habitual."<sup>21</sup> The writer's remarks showcased the belief that Hawaii, with its Eastern exoticism, provided the antidote to the pressures of modern, urban Western society. In Hawaii, tourist writers found an Edenic paradise peopled with a genteel, multiethnic population that lived in relative harmony. In idealized Hawaii, "natives" engaged themselves in traditional sport, and lived as they had for centuries. Partaking in experiences such as surfing and outrigger paddling promoted a positive connection with the locals the tourists encountered.<sup>22</sup> Tourist advertisements captured and distilled such experiences, further shaping Hawaii's growth as a vacation destination.

Beginning in earnest in the early 1920s, tourist advertisements helped introduce Hawaii to mainland audiences. As sea travel at the turn of twentieth century had proven prohibitive to most, save for the very rich, 1920s consumers turned to pictures and written accounts for their knowledge of Hawaii. Advertisements, therefore, often provided potential tourists with most, if not all, of their information of the islands.<sup>23</sup> Focusing their attention on its moderate climate and outdoor features, early advertisements sold Hawaii as having "Spring eleven months of the year," and "great hiking."<sup>24</sup> As the decade progressed, advertisements began to adopt a more personal tone, appealing more directly to the reader's sensibilities.<sup>25</sup> Advertising Hawaii tourism, too, followed this trend, with one ad beginning:

*Who hasn't dreamed since childhood of riding the surf in outrigger canoes at Waikiki; of standing on the brink of the crater of Kilauea, the greatest active volcano in the world; of the cocoanut [sic.] fringed shores and brilliant*

---

21 Clayton Hamilton, "Honolulu Holds the Magic Mirror for Mankind," *Vogue*, January 1, 1924, 56.

22 Desmond, 464.

23 Desmond, 465.

24 Collected from advertisements in *Los Angeles Times* from August 5, 1923 and November 12, 1925.

25 Roland Marchand, "Apostles of Modernity" in *Advertising the American Dream* (University of California Press, 1985), 9.

*tropical flowing trees. Don't dream about Hawaii any longer, come now.*<sup>26</sup>

This ad from the Bank of Hawaii soliciting mail and banking services for travelers reached out to the reader in an interactive way, allowing him to envision the activities he might do on a Hawaiian vacation. New advertising schemes helped familiarize consumers with Hawaii by providing specific details and establishing an emotional connection. 1920s advertisers also compared Hawaii to more familiar destination as a strategy used to impart a favorable image. A two-page ad by the Los Angeles Steamship Company entitled, “Enchanted Islands,” discussed the accommodations of the newly opened Royal Hawaiian and surrounding amenities alongside available excursions to Catalina Island, a well-trodden destination for Southern Californians. Written in the style of an informational article, the piece contrasted the newness and quality of the Royal Hawaiian and related Waialae Country Club with the amenities available on Catalina Island “that continue to be crowded.”<sup>27</sup> Improved advertisement strategies promoted awareness of Hawaii as a resort destination and helped build Waikiki as a brand. The modernization of attempts at advertising Hawaii mirrored the developments Waikiki made itself as it progressed into a playground for the elite.

## **The Royal Hawaiian, Matson Navigation, and Sailing into Modernity**

From the moment new arrivals disembarked from their motorcars and mounted the steps of the Royal Hawaiian Hotel, they found themselves transported to a world of luxury. Pink pillars lined long lanais furnished with sturdy maple chairs looking out upon a green courtyard shaded by waving palms. The open-air interior provided guests with further space to gather or stroll through the premises past drawing lobbies, tearooms, and outdoor dining rooms.<sup>28</sup> Upon its opening on February 1, 1927, the Royal offered guests a hospitality experience never before offered in Waikiki. The Royal Hawaiian

---

26 Advertisement: The Bank of Hawaii. *Los Angeles Times*, January 1, 1925. E29.

27 Advertisement: “Enchanted Islands,” *Los Angeles Times*, January 3, 1928. F12.

28 Agnes Mavo James, “Exotic Honolulu,” *Vogue*, January 1, 1928, 56, 114.

set the bar for future development. Waikiki had its first world-class resort.

Central to the Royal Hawaiian's inception sat Edward Tenney, president of Castle & Cooke and Matson Navigation, two of Hawaii's largest corporations.<sup>29</sup> Both companies had come to prominence in Hawaii's business and political spheres over the course of the nineteenth century during late monarchy and republican periods. Tenney's companies, alongside the other corporations that comprised Hawaii's "Big Five," had come to control 96 percent of the sugar industry, most of the pineapple industry, and virtually all of the islands' shipping by the 1930s.<sup>30</sup> Family members of the Big Five had controlled the governments both of Honolulu and the Hawaiian Islands as a whole since the signing of the 1887 "Bayonet" Constitution by King David Kalākaua.<sup>31</sup> In 1925, Matson Navigation, already involved freight and passenger liners, endeavored to enter the luxury steamship market with the construction of the *S.S. Malolo* (flying fish). A luxury route to Hawaii would open Waikiki to a new market of tourist, a well-travelled and worldly class with the highest expectations in amenities. The Moana and the Seaside, Waikiki's two largest resorts, suffered in the past from customer complaints. Tenney, after approving the *Malolo*, understood that in order to attract the most affluent passengers to visit Hawaii, a new hotel would have to be built to satisfy future demands.<sup>32</sup> Exercising his considerable influence, Tenney orchestrated the purchase of Territorial Hotel Company Ltd. under Matson Navigation. Castle & Cooke underwrote the transaction, bringing all three entities under Tenney's control.<sup>33</sup> With his corporate interests aligned, Tenney set forth the projects that would become the *S.S. Malolo* and the Royal Hawaiian.

Designed to accommodate world-class travelers, the *S.S. Malolo* and the

---

29 Don J. Hibbard, *Designing Paradise: The Allure of the Hawaiian Resort* (Princeton: Princeton Architectural Press, 2006), 43.

30 John S. Whitehead, "Western Progressives, Old South Planters, or Colonial Oppressors: The Enigma of Hawaii's "Big Five" 1898-1940." in *Western Historical Quarterly* 30 (Oxford University Press, 1999). 296.

31 "New Hawaiian Constitution Adopted July 7, 1887," *The Daily Bulletin*, July 7, 1887, Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers. Lib. of Congress; Whitehead, 298.

32 Ejiri, 253.

33 Stan Cohen, *The Pink Palace* (Missoula: Pictorial Histories Publishing, 1986), 17-18.



Royal Hawaiian Hotel expressed trends in high culture and the interests of the affluent in the 1920s. Finished ahead of the Royal Hawaiian's opening, the *Malolo* incorporated all the modern conveniences expected of a luxury passenger liner. According to a Matson advertisement, the ship featured, "accommodations for 600 first class passengers, seven decks for passengers' use, elevators serve all decks, motion picture theatre, ballroom, completely equipped gymnasium, children's playroom and huge Pompeian swimming pool."<sup>34</sup> Providing all of the traditional amenities while including popular trends in entertainment, such as motion pictures, the *Malolo's* design embraced modernity without sacrificing elegance. Advertised that the "swiftest passenger vessel ever built in the United States," the *Malolo* made the transit between San Francisco and Honolulu in four days, a day faster than comparable ships.<sup>35</sup> The swift, elegant *Malolo* met passengers' desires in providing a quality seafaring experience. The design of the Royal Hawaiian Hotel followed the same standard.

Designed by New York architecture firm, Warren & Wetmore, the Royal Hawaiian shared a pedigree with some of the East Coast's finest buildings, including the Ritz-Carlton, Biltmore, and Ambassador Hotels in New York, and Grand Central Terminal.<sup>36</sup> The architects chose to build the Royal in the Spanish Colonial Revival style, finding the motif complementary to Hawaii's moderate climate, and also following the renewed interest in the colonial style in the 1920s. The Spanish Colonial style reemerged in the American West at the turn of the century as tourists began to look at the edificial vestiges of the Spanish period through a romantic lens. In the same era that Californians began to restore the broken arches of their Spanish missions, the Royal Hawaiian gained a 150-foot mission-style bell tower.<sup>37</sup> The building followed an 'H' pattern to capture Hawaii's famed trade winds. One of the two long

---

34 Advertisement: "Matson Line," *Forum* (1886-1930). April 1, 1928. 69. ProQuest American Periodicals.

35 Advertisement: "Christmas in Honolulu," *Los Angeles Times*, December 17, 1927, 6.

36 Hibbard, 41.

37 Phoebe S. Kropp, "The Road: El Camino Real and Mission Nostalgia" in *California Vieja: Culture and Memory in a Modern American Place* (University of California Press, 2006), 75; Hibbard, 41.

wings faced the beach, affording views of the beach and Diamond Head. The rest of the hotel enjoyed seclusion, being surrounded by lush tropical garden scenery. Of the Royal's well-landscaped grounds, a *Vogue* feature article remarked, "a world-traveled group recently indicated the Royal Hawaiian as the smartest and most luxurious hotel visited on their entire voyage."<sup>38</sup> While the grounds themselves gave the resort a grandiose air, the finer details, the activities and amenities that the Royal purveyed, established its preeminence amongst Waikiki hostelrys.

The Royal Hawaiian provided its guests with superior amenities that satisfied the interests of modern travelers. Promoters for the Royal Hawaiian lauded most the associated Waialae Golf Club, built for the exclusive use of hotel patrons. "Designed to test the golfer's ability with the greatest possible variety of shots,"<sup>39</sup> Waialae Golf Club was built by renowned course designer, Seth Raynor, who reproduced at Waialae several holes from internationally famed course, including Saint Andrews and North Berwick in Scotland, and Biarritz in France.<sup>40</sup> Off of the links, the Royal Hawaiian offered opportunities for game fishing along the windward coast, polo and trail riding at the Diamond Head stables, motor touring up Tantalus and the Nu'uanu Pali, and, of course, surfing and outrigger canoe paddling on Waikiki Beach.<sup>41</sup> In short, the Royal Hawaiian Hotel appealed to the modern tastes of their affluent clientele. Controlling the means by which their guests arrived to the islands, the Royal Hawaiian provided the services necessary to ensure travelers enjoyed their stay to the fullest. Passengers aboard the *Malolo* could arrive at the dock in Los Angeles and San Francisco in their automobiles and make the four-day crossing to Honolulu with their vehicles in comfort and ease. Once ashore, the Royal Hawaiian provided capacious, well-appointed confines and offered activities that made boredom impossible. One needs not wonder why visitors to Waikiki often planned to stay for three weeks or more. The Royal represented

---

38 James, 114.

39 James, 114.

40 Hibbard, 43.

41 Advertisement: Royal Hawaiian Hotel, *Vogue*, October 1, 1927, 40; James, 115.

a veritable paradise for the affluent elite. The rise world-class resort options and luxury steam line service to Waikiki made the destination popular with luminaries of the entertainment industry.

The amenities at the Royal Hawaiian proved irresistible for Hollywood's stars. Such notables as Charlie Chaplin, Shirley Temple, Clarke Gable, Groucho Marx, Bing Crosby, Mary Pickford and Douglas Fairbanks made the Royal a destination for respite between film productions.<sup>42</sup> Mary Pickford and Douglas Fairbanks, then King and Queen of the motion picture screen, made frequent visits to the Royal between the festivities of the hotel's opening night, of which they partook, and the collapse of their marriage in 1928.<sup>43</sup> Another on-screen romantic duo of the silent era, Norma Talmadge and Gilbert Roland made headlines in the *Los Angeles Times* when they held up the production of their 1929 release *New York Nights* in order to take a spontaneous vacation to Waikiki, choosing to stay at the Royal Hawaiian. Of the decision, Talmadge stated, "Neither of us has seen Hawaii and hearing such a lot about its romantic charm we both wanted to go. You see, we can keep in touch with the story of the picture way, since we intend to resume work immediately upon our return."<sup>44</sup> For movie stars, the hop to Hawaii came with relative ease. Before an isolated outpost apart from the center of civilization, Waikiki transitioned into a haunt for America's socialites. As Waikiki became more familiar to rich celebrities, the district's nightlife grew to match their tastes.

As notable figures from the entertainment industry flocked to Waikiki, they brought with them the nightlife trends of the Jazz Age. Floating on swung rhythms and a pulsing backbeat, Jazz music fueled a cultural phenomenon throughout America in the "roaring twenties." Played everywhere from concert halls to dance halls to living room "petting parties," Jazz became the standard and expectation when it came to nighttime entertainment. 1920s Waikiki provided no exception. Don Blanding, described as "Hawaii's Poet

---

42 Hibbard, 45.

43 Cohen, 44.

44 "Film Players off to Hawaii: Picture Held Up for Their Vacation," *Los Angeles Times*, June 3, 1928, C1, ProQuest Historical Newspapers.

Laureate” during his time, captured an image of Waikiki nightlife in his prose poem, “Waikiki,” stating:

*The area surrounding the two big hotels, the Moana and the Royal Hawaiian, is known as Flappers’ Acre. . . . The jazz bands from the two beach hotels fling dance tunes over Flappers’ Acre. Automobiles swish in and out of the narrow streets, filled with pretty girls and their escorts.*<sup>45</sup>

Referencing the iconic women’s subculture movement of the Jazz Age, Blanding’s accounts identified a specific district, centered on the Royal Hawaiian, as the epicenter of Jazz nightlife in Waikiki. In fact, local musician Johnny Noble, originally the conductor of the Moana Hotel Orchestra, led Jazz ensembles at both hotels throughout the decade.<sup>46</sup> After taking in a night of Jazz at the Royal Hawaiian, a travel writer noted, “a Hawaiian orchestra play[ed] the latest “jazz,” interspersed with an occasional native air.”<sup>47</sup> By the time the Royal Hawaiian had first opened its doors, local bandleaders had not only incorporated elements of Jazz into their repertoire, they had made it their own. Accounts of Waikiki’s nightlife attested to its vibrancy. On a nighttime stroll down Kalakaua Avenue along Blanding’s “Flappers’ Acre,” an observer might have encountered young couples in automobiles listening to the faint din of Hawaiian Jazz compositions, such as Johnny Noble’s “Hula Blues,” escaping from hotel fronts. In the course of a decade, Waikiki had transformed from a provincial holdover from a bygone time to a modern, urban retreat for society’s upper crust. In the form of Jazz music, Waikiki had even adopted the sounds of modernity.

## Conclusion

Perhaps prophetically, Jack London wrote in a correspondence during his 1915-1916 visit to Waikiki: “I’m glad we’re here now. . . . For someday Waikiki Beach is going to be the scene of one long Hotel.”<sup>48</sup> Waikiki today, with its high-rise

---

45 Don Blanding, “Waikiki,” in *Hula Moons* (New York: Dodd, Mead & Company, 1930), 209.

46 Ejiri, 197.

47 Rosemary Bevan Karelle, “Honolulu: This Hawaiian Paradise Bewitches the Visitor with Its Sea, Its Hills, and Its Magical Moon in a Tropical Night,” *Vogue*, October 15, 1927, 136.

48 Ejiri, 136.

hotels and apartments, constant traffic, and crowded beach, owes much to the 1920s developments of the Ala Wai Canal and Royal Hawaiian Hotel. The canal, while flawed, diverted stream waters away from taro farms, fishponds, and noble Hemuloa, the former country residence of royalty. Once dried, Waikiki gained its current grid pattern as part of Pinkham's dream of creating an urban resort paradise. Literary notables, such as Jack London, helped conceive the image of Hawaii that advertisers and article writers would emulate throughout the 1920s. London's Waikiki of gentle native busy in their preoccupations of surf and sea formed an iconic image of idyllic Waikiki reprised in fashion magazines and newspapers. Advertising efforts by Hawaiian businesses primed affluent consumers' interests in a Hawaiian luxury resort experience. Edward Tenney, through his vast corporate empire, set the plans in motion for a combined vacation and travel experience aboard the *S.S. Malolo* with lodgings at the Royal Hawaiian Hotel. The Royal's accommodations attracted the wealthiest patrons, including the Hollywood elite. High-powered names made the Royal their quick getaway stop away from the grueling demands of film production. At night the Royal Hawaiian transformed into Don Blanding's "Flappers' Acre," where Jazz music, hybridized with the sounds of Hawaii, filled the orchid-scented air. Further shore improvements between the 1930s to present would give Waikiki Beach its current configuration. Combating beach erosion remains a constant effort for Honolulu's engineers. Man-made seawalls protect the shore from the full force of Waikiki's surf. As recently as 2012, 27,000 cubic feet of sand had to be pumped in from off shore to restore the beachfront. According to the Hawaii Tourism Authority, a record 8.3 million visitors came to Hawaii in 2014, collectively spending \$14.7 billion dollars whilst there.<sup>49</sup> Waikiki serves today as the gateway to that industry as the most popular Hawaiian destination for first-time visitors. The Royal Hawaiian remains today a popular luxury resort. In 2008, the hotel underwent a seven-month, \$110 million renovation to better provide guests an experience worthy of its name.<sup>50</sup> Though artificial in every sense, Waikiki remains an icon of Hawaii tourism.

---

49 "December 2014 Visitors Stat Press Release," Hawaii Tourism Authority, January 29, 2015.

50 Gene Park, "Royal Hawaiian Closing for 7 Months," *Honolulu Star Bulletin*, June 1, 2008.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Blanding, Don, "Waikiki," in *Hula Moons*. New York: Dodd, Mead & Company, 1930.
- "Christmas in Honolulu," Advertisement. *Los Angeles Times*. December 17, 1927.
- Cocke, Sophie, "Waikiki Beach is Totally Man-Made (and Disappearing). Can Hawaii Save It?" *Huffington Post*. March 9, 2015. [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/03/09/saving-waikiki-beach-erosion\\_n\\_6835424.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/03/09/saving-waikiki-beach-erosion_n_6835424.html).
- Cohen, Stan. *The Pink Palace*. Missoula: Pictorial Histories Publishing, 1986.
- "December 2014 Visitors Stat Press Release," *Hawaii Tourism Authority*. January 29, 2015.
- Desmond, Jane. "Picturing Hawaii: The "Ideal" Native and the Origins of Tourism, 1880-1915." *Positions: East Asia Culture Critique* 7. Duke University Press, 1999.
- Ejiri, Masakazu. "Development of Waikiki, 1900-1949: The Formative Period in American Resort Paradise." PhD. dissertation, University of Hawaii, 1996.
- "Enchanted Islands." Advertisement. *Los Angeles Times*. January 3, 1928.
- Feeser, Andrea and Chan, Gaye. *Waikiki: A History of Forgetting and Remembering*. University of Hawaii Press, 2007.
- "Film Players off to Hawaii: Picture Held Up for Their Vacation." *Los Angeles Times*. June 3, 1928. ProQuest Historical Newspapers.
- Haley, James L. *Wolf: The Lives of Jack London*. New York: Basic Books, 2010.
- Hamilton, Clayton. "Honolulu Holds the Magic Mirror for Mankind." *Vogue*. January 1, 1924.
- Hibbard, Don J. *Designing Paradise: The Allure of the Hawaiian Resort*. Princeton: Princeton Architectural Press, 2006.
- James, Agnes Mayo. "Exotic Honolulu." *Vogue*. January 1, 1928.
- Karelle, Rosemary Bevan. "Honolulu: This Hawaiian Paradise Bewitches the Visitor

- with Its Sea, Its Hills, and Its Magical Moon in a Tropical Night.” *Vogue*. October 15, 1927.
- Kropp, Phoebe S. “The Road: El Camino Real and Mission Nostalgia.” *California Vieja: Culture and Memory in a Modern American Place*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.
- London, Jack. “A Royal Sport” in *The Cruise of the Snark: Jack London’s South Sea Adventure*. Santa Barbara: Narrative Press, 2001.
- Marchand, Roland. “Apostles of Modernity.” *Advertising the American Dream*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985.
- “Matson Line.” Advertisement. *Forum (1886-1930)*. April 1, 1928. 69. ProQuest American Periodicals.
- “New Hawaiian Constitution Adopted July 7, 1887.” *The Daily Bulletin*. July 7, 1887. Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers. Lib. of Congress.
- Park, Gene. “Royal Hawaiian Closing for 7 Months.” *Honolulu Star Bulletin*. June 1, 2008.
- “Pinkham Plan to Reclaim Waikiki to be Tried.” *The Pacific Commercial Advertiser*. March 16, 1906. Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers. Lib. of Congress.
- “Pinkham Plans the Reclamation of All Waikiki.” *Evening Bulletin*. February 21, 1906. Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers. Lib. of Congress.
- “Royal Hawaiian Hotel.” Advertisement. *Vogue*. October 1, 1927.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books, 1979.
- “Sluiced Lagoon Water into Waikiki Water and Drove Fair Bathers Away.” *The Pacific Commercial Advertiser*. February 16, 1913. Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers. Lib. of Congress.
- “The Bank of Hawaii.” Advertisement. *Los Angeles Times*. January 1, 1925.

“Truth About Waikiki Beach.” *Los Angeles Times*. June 6, 1920. ProQuest Historical Newspapers.

Whitehead, John S. “Western Progressives, Old South Planters, or Colonial Oppressors: The Enigma of Hawaii’s “Big Five” 1898-1940.” *Western Historical Quarterly* 30. Oxford University Press, 1999.

Wiegel, Robert L. “Waikiki Beach, Oahu, Hawaii: History of Its Transformation From a Natural to an Urban Shore.” *Shore and Beach* 76 (Spring 2008), 3.





## EXECUTIVE EDITORS

### *Jennifer Freilach*

Jenny graduated with a Bachelor of Arts in History and a minor in English. She is President of Phi Alpha Theta and is fascinated with the counterculture of the 1960s and '70s. As a recent graduate she spends her time working, reading, and solving the Rubik's cube.

### *Madeleine Aitchison*

Madeleine graduated with a Bachelor of Arts in History and minors in Asian Studies and Women's and Gender Studies. She particularly enjoys studying the history of Southeast Asia. Madeleine will be starting a Masters program at the University of Hawaii in the fall.

## AUTHORS

### *Allison Wilkinson*

Allison is a third year History major. Her research interests include emotional history, baseball history, and history of college orientation. Outside of class she is a member of Phi Alpha Theta, a marketing intern for Cal Poly Athletics and an Orientation Team member for New Student & Transition Programs.

### *Cooper Peltz*

Cooper is a third-year history major. Cooper would like to thank Dr. Firpo for teaching him how to write, Caleb Gotthardt and Emily Hock for checking books out of the library for him, and Keegan Koberl for being the Sam Gamgee to Cooper's Frodo during the writing of this article.

### *Blake Burgess*

Blake is a History major who transferred from Cuesta College and will be graduating with honors in June 2016. His favorite subjects to research are labor history, radicalism, and terrorism. Blake plans to earn his teaching credential in History-Social Science and teach at the Middle or High School level.

### *Tessa St. Clair*

Tessa transferred from Porterville College to Cal Poly San Luis Obispo in Fall of 2015. She adores all areas of history, but is focusing her studies on 19th and 20th century American and European history. Her goal while at Cal Poly is to study abroad in London for a summer and complete a curating internship at a museum. She is currently working towards her bachelor's degree in history.

### *Alika Bourgette*

As a first-year History M.A. student, Alika has found a new interest the Pacific Basin as a field of study. He hopes that his studies will deepen his ties to Hawaii and the American West, both places he calls home,

### *Charlie Williams*

Charlie is a first year history major at Cal Poly. She is passionate about all aspects of history, but hopes to study the era of the Cold War more thoroughly because she finds the contrast between political views fascinating. Besides history, Charlie enjoys reading and exploring San Luis Obispo.

### *Rebecca Willis*

Rebecca is pursuing a Bachelor of Arts in History with potential minors in English and Music. She enjoys studying European history and film. Campus interests include peer advising, tutoring, and student leadership. She is graduating June 2017 with plans to pursue a career in education at the graduate level.

### *Solange Kiehlbauch*

Solange is completing a Bachelor of Arts in History with a minor in English. She will be continuing her education in Cal Poly's History M.A. program. Solange is particularly interested in medieval history, as well as the history of medicine and equestrian culture. Outside of the classroom, she enjoys horseback riding, reading, and writing fiction and poetry.

