

Meredith Alice McCutcheon. *Guitar and Vihuela: an Annotated Bibliography*. RILM Retrospectives No. 3 (New York: Pendragon Press, 1985). xlv, 353pp.

THE RECENT PROLIFERATION OF RESEARCH concerning the guitar and vihuela has made it difficult for the serious performer and scholar to keep abreast of all the contributions and publications that have appeared across the globe. Meredith Alice McCutcheon's *Guitar and Vihuela: an Annotated Bibliography* addresses this need by providing a bibliography that is well conceived and admirably realized. She indicates that the purpose of her book is to "fill the need for an annotated reference tool for the study of the guitar and vihuela. It contains literature on composers, performers, theorists, music and analysis, iconography, and design and construction in both an historical context and in a technical one. In addition to literature on the six-string classic guitar, literature on the Renaissance four-course guitar, the Renaissance and Baroque five-course guitar, the chitarra battente, the terz guitar, the seven-string Russian guitar, and the modern eight-string, ten-string, and microtonal guitars is included. Texts in Catalan, Danish, English, French, German, Italian, Latin, Polish, Portuguese, Russian, Spanish, Swedish, and Ukrainian languages are listed (p. xxvi)."

She divides her introduction into three parts. The first provides a brief historical background of the vihuela and guitar and justifies placing them together in the same bibliography. The second section gives concise and extremely useful advice about locating and identifying vihuela and guitar music. This discussion is particularly commendable for it makes the bibliography accessible and useful to any serious guitarist, not just to those already immersed in musicological research. The third section explicates the purpose, content, and organization of the bibliography. Eight chapters follow entitled: General Histories and Dictionaries, National Histories, Histories of the Renaissance Period, Histories of the Baroque Era, Histories of the Early Six-String Guitar, From Tárrega to the Present, Iconography, and Design and Construction. The chapters are logically subdivided into detailed subcategories. This thorough organization greatly facilitates the location of material in general, but the reader should be forewarned (and McCutcheon herself advises) that one must check in several locations to obtain all pertinent citations.

Two appendices follow: 1) "Periodicals Devoted to the Guitar and Other Fretted Instruments" and 2) "Music for Guitar and Vihuela Printed Before 1800 and Modern Editions." For each periodical cited in Appendix I, McCutcheon indicates several libraries in the United States that have that source in their holdings. This courteous touch increases the power and utility of the appendix. A comprehensive index of authors, subjects, and titles concludes the volume.

Overall, McCutcheon's decisions on what should and should not be included are sound and prudent. She treats the "guitar" in an amplified sense

without excluding such variants as the chitarra battente and terz guitar. This approach is a wise one, for the guitar has undergone so many transformations (both stylistically and physically) that too narrow a definition of just what constitutes a "real guitar" could eliminate much valuable information. Logically, she also regards the vihuela and guitar as part of the same extended family instead of classifying them as fundamentally unrelated instruments. Unlike many bibliographies, she includes book reviews and lists masters theses as well as doctoral dissertations, courteously providing the reader with the UMI numbers to facilitate ordering them from University Microfilms.

Several laudable aspects of McCutcheon's bibliography should be noted. She does not limit her scope exclusively to the "standard" musicological and scholarly journals. As a result, many significant resources surface in her bibliography that are absent in other traditional research tools. McCutcheon has made a real effort to locate pertinent foreign publications. She presents well over a thousand sources, many of which have been unknown or neglected by most American guitarists and scholars. I have nothing but praise for her articulate and accurate annotations that accompany this gargantuan body of material. Her annotations provide brief but lucid abstracts for each cited work. She informs the reader if there are musical examples, a bibliography, or transcriptions, and she often supplies cross-references to other citations.

In spite of the generally high quality of this bibliography, a handful of problems, limitations, or omissions do occur that should be noted. The three major problems of the volume concern: 1) the editorial decision to exclude introductions to editions; 2) cursory and incomplete citations in Appendix II; and, 3) an occasional omission of very recent research.

If there is an Achilles' heel to McCutcheon's volume, it results from her decision to exclude introductions to editions of music and to method books. Some of the most informative and accurate information available to scholars and guitarists appears as critical commentary to musical editions. McCutcheon's exclusion of this invaluable resource seems somewhat arbitrary and unfortunately weakens the value of her book. The problem is exacerbated by her editorial procedures in "Appendix II: Music for Guitar and Vihuela Printed Before 1800 and Modern Editions," for she lists modern editions but does not indicate whether or not an edition contains introductory material or critical commentary. The unfortunate result is that some of the best scholarly research by such authors as Emilio Pujol, Luis García Abrines, Monica Hall, Charles Jacobs, James Tyler, Brian Jeffery, and others is not listed anywhere in the bibliography.

Further problems arise in Appendix II due to overly brief or incomplete citations. They do not meet the same care and rigor that McCutcheon has set for herself in the previous sections of her bibliography. Not only does she fail to mention whether an edition has commentary or an introduction, but she does not consistently cite such basics, such as place and date of publication, whether the

edition is in facsimile, or whether the edition contains a transcription into staff notation. These omissions generate all sorts of thorny problems. For example, she states that the 1674 and 1697 editions of Sanz's *Instrucción de música sobre la guitarra española* are identical. Not true. Even a cursory perusal of the source reveals that Sanz published "Books 1 & 2" of the *Instrucción* in 1674 and added "Book 3" in 1697. There are other differences between the 1674 and 1697 editions as well; García Abrines discusses them in the preface to his facsimile edition (Zaragoza: Institución "Fernando el Católico" and the Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1952) as does Rodrigo de Zayas in his edition of Sanz's *Instrucción* (Madrid: Opera Omnia & Alpuerto, n.d. [early 1980s]) which contains exhaustive commentary, a facsimile of the original, and a complete transcription. The reader would have had access to this information and been able to catch this oversight quite readily if McCutcheon had guided the reader to these authors. In another citation concerning Sanz, McCutcheon includes a citation for a Schott edition of Sanz's *Instrucción* but gives no publication date or place of publication. Although this edition has been promised as "forthcoming" for years, it still has not been completed and released according to the information given to me in the spring of 1986 at Schott's London office. This example produces serious implications: whenever McCutcheon fails to include date of publication, the reader is left guessing as to whether an edition is merely "promised" or whether it actually exists.

Other "ghost" editions surface in Appendix II. For instance, McCutcheon cites modern Bärenreiter editions for the following works: Juan Carlos Amat, *Guitarra española y vandola c.1761*, (1980); Nicola Matteis, *The False Consonances of Musick*, 1682 (1980); Ludovico Roncalli, *Capricci armonici*, 1692 (1979); Giovanni Battista Granata, *Soavi concerti*, 1659 (1979); and Santiago de Murcia, *Resumen de acompañar la parte con la guitarra*, 1714 (1980). In trying to locate these editions I discovered that they are not published by Bärenreiter at all but merely *distributed* by them in Germany: the publisher is actually Chanterelle. The confusion is compounded when McCutcheon lists a Chanterelle edition and a Bärenreiter edition of Roncalli's *Capricci armonici* as separate entities when they are one and the same. A similar duplication of citations arises with Emilio Pujol's edition of Narváez's *Los seys libros del Delphin* which first appeared in 1945 and was later reissued in 1971. If McCutcheon had habitually entered complete citations she would have instantly recognized that the 1945 and 1971 editions were identical for they both are "Volume 3" of the series "Monumentos de la Música Española." In fact, the verso side of the 1971 title page explicitly clarifies that it is an "offset reproduction of the first edition of 1945."

Some problems also arise with respect to listings of very recent contributions. I have found few omissions of important material published before 1980, but a few minute "cracks" appear in the years 1980-85. Below I list three source

areas that should be checked independently to supplement McCutcheon's bibliography for that time period: 1) *The Revista de Musicología*, published in Madrid under the auspices of the newly formed Sociedad Española de Musicología, published seven articles between 1979-1984 containing some of the most exciting research to come out for decades concerning the vihuela and guitar; 2) Most theses and dissertations completed after late 1981 do not appear in her bibliography. The scholar should consult the standard sources to fill in any small gaps; 3) Also, no citation of any article from the *Journal of the Lute Society of America* after 1979 (vol. 14) is included, even though extremely important articles by Emil Vogl, Kevin Mason, John Ward, and Monica Hall appeared in volumes 15-17 (1980-82). In McCutcheon's defense, it must be noted that volumes of the *JLSA* appeared two years late during that time period, so she is only "out-of-step" by a year or two--not by four or five as the *printed* dates on the journals would indicate.

A few minor problems also cause McCutcheon to conceal or misfile a few citations. Juan José Rey, for instance, follows the Spanish custom of signing his articles with both his paternal and maternal surnames (Rey Marcos). McCutcheon misfiles this author's work under "Marcos" (the mother's maiden name). The same holds true for Francisco José Leon who is mistakenly catalogued under "Tello" (for he signs his books and articles "Francisco José Leon Tello). Some Spanish authors from the past, too, have their names undergo odd transformations. *Antonio* de Cabezón is "Frenchified" into *Antoine* for no apparent reason. *Tomás* de Sancta María is transformed into an English *Thomas*. She fails to cross-reference "Antoine Carré" and the "Sieur de la Grange" as being one and the same person. It is also unfortunate that *rasgueado* (a basic guitar technique) is misspelled throughout as *rasgado*.

In spite of the few problems that arise in McCutcheon's bibliography, they are dwarfed by the thoroughness, quality, and utility of the rest of the volume. She has tackled an enormous project full of treacherous problems, resolved them successfully, and produced a research tool worthy of praise. Unquestionably, this book will be a constant companion to scholars and guitar enthusiasts for years to come and should be considered an indispensable resource for any reputable music or research library.

CRAIG H. RUSSELL
CALIFORNIA POLYTECHNIC STATE UNIVERSITY