Shelter Women and Development

First and Third World Perspectives

Editor
Hemalata C. Dandekar
Shelter
Women
and
Development

First and Third World Perspectives

Proceedings of
an International Conference

College of Architecture
and Urban Planning

The University of Michigan
May 7–9, 1992

Hemalata C. Dandekar Editor

George Wahr Publishing Co.
Ann Arbor
Theme 1
Shelter Policy: Implications for Women's Development

1. A Policy Overview 14
   Vinitha Aliyar and Sujata Shetty

2. Global Policies Regarding Shelter for Women: Experiences of the UN Centre for Human Settlements 23
   Irene Tinker

3. Women’s Role in Shelter Planning 33
   K. K. Bhatnagar

4. Synopsis of Talk by Salma Khan: Housing Policy and Development in Bangladesh 38
   Vinitha Aliyar

5. Women and Housing Policy in South Africa: A Discussion of Durban Case Studies 41
   Alison Todes and Norah Walker

6. The Contribution of Community-Based Housing Organizations to Women’s Shelter and Development: Evidence from Zimbabwe 54
   Anna C. Vakil

7. Housing and Gender: Beyond the Public/Private Dichotomy 62
   Patricia Gardiner

8. Boundary Violations: Sexual Harassment within Tenancy Relations 68
   Sylvia Novac
Theme 2
The Structure of Legal Interventions

9. Federally Assisted Housing: A Housing Crisis for Poor Women 76
   Catherine M. Bishop

10. The Fair Housing Amendments Act of 1988: Creating New Housing Opportunities for Women 81
    Surabhi Dabir

    Pamela L. Sayne

12. The Importance of Housing in the Lives of Women: The Case of Botswana 106
    Anita Larsson

13. The Invisible Contribution of Married Women in Housing Finance and Its Legal Implications: A Case Study from Port Harcourt, Nigeria 116
    Yomi Oruwari

Theme 3
Shelter and Women in Crisis

14. Women and Crisis: An Overview of Homelessness in the First and Third World 126
    Margrit Bergholz

15. Shelter Homes: A Need to Develop a New Approach for Women in Familial Distress 134
    Neela Dabir

16. Housing for Women with AIDS 141
    Theresa Cameron and Yul Lee

17. Synopsis of Talk by Sara Snyder, Grateful Home 148
    Margrit Bergholz

18. Synopsis of Talk by Robert Gillett, Legal Services of Southeastern Michigan 150
    Margrit Bergholz

19. Housing Homeless Women in Toronto 152
    Joyce Brown and Diana Capponi

20. Wings, Ka Fanm, Re-Vision House: Case Studies of Transitional Housing for Women 157
    Lynn Peterson

Theme 4
Women’s Participation in the Production of Shelter

21. Women and the Production of Housing: An Overview 168
    Victoria Basolo and Michelle Morlan

22. Responding to Diversity: Housing Developed by and for Women 178
    Gerda R. Wekerle

23. Beating a Path: Towards Defining Women’s Participation 187
    Meera Bapat and Sheela Patel

24. Women’s Participation in the Production of Shelter 199
    Aliye Pekin Celik

25. Community Planning in Developing Nations: Land Use Planning, User Participation, and Appropriate Technologies 208
    Ann H. May and David K. May

Theme 5
Shelter and Income Opportunities

26. The Role of Shelter in Generating Income Opportunities for Poor Women in the Third World 218
    Abdi M. Kusow

27. Shelter as Sustenance: Exclusionary Mechanisms Limiting Women’s Access to Housing 225
    Faranak Miraftab

    Norazit Selat

29. Shelter and Income Opportunities for Women in India 244
    Sulakshana Mahajan
Theme 6
Women and Shelter-Related Services and Infrastructure

30. Women’s Views of Shelter-Related Services and Infrastructure in Charkop Bombay, and Mogappair, Madras 256
   Hemalata C. Dandekar

31. Shelter-Related Infrastructural Needs of Women in Low-Income Settlements of Bombay 266
   Neera Adarkar

32. Women and Shelter-Related Services and Infrastructure: The Case of a Vulnerable Group 277
   Madiha El Safty

33. The Politics of Space Appropriation: A Case Study of Women’s Struggles for Homeplace in Chicago Public Housing: An Abstract 282
   Roberta M. Feldman and Susan J. Stall

Theme 7
Non-traditional Living Arrangements: Beyond the Nuclear Family

34. Non-traditional Living Arrangements: Beyond the Nuclear Family 286
   Kameshwari Pothukuchi

35. Access to Housing in Urban and Rural Zimbabwe: Historical Observations on the Nuclear Family 295
   Tim Scarnecchia

36. Gender, Household Structure, and Accommodation for Young Adults in Urban Mexico 304
   Ann Varley

37. The Care Facility in Central Europe as a Form of Shelter: Implications for Women 320
   Carolyn Thompson

38. Young Mothers and Affordable Housing: Information and Organization for Change 324
   Valerie L. du Plessis

Theme 8
Design and the Creation of Shelter for Women

39. Design and the Creation of Shelter for Women: An Overview 334
   Vassiliki Mangana

40. Segregation of Women in Islamic Cultures and Its Reflection in Housing: A Study of Spaces for Women in a Bangladesh Village 338
   Tasneem Chowdhury

41. The Socio-Economic Impact of Open Spaces on Women in a Spontaneous Settlement 347
   Neema Bhatt

42. Lifeboats, More than Housing 352
   Joan Forrester Sprague

43. Language, Sacred Places, and Transitional Housing 358
   Mary J. Follenweider

44. Shelter: A Place of the Telling a chimerical cookbook 366
   Tami Silverman and Chris Taylor

Theme 9
Shelter Options for Elderly Women

45. Shelter Options for Elderly Women: An Overview 374
   Maria M. Yen and Sharon M. Keigher

   Sharon M. Keigher

47. Housing Needs for Elderly Women: The Washtenaw County Experience 396
   Carolyn Hastings and Maria M. Yen

48. The Meaning of Home and Ecogenic Housing: A New Concept for Elderly Women 402
   Leon A. Pastalan and Benyamin Schwarz
49. Crossing Oceans: A Cross-Cultural Look at Elderly Immigrant Women in the United States and Elderly Women in India 408
Rama Sethi

50. Housing and the Creation of Security in Old Age by Rural Women of Ghana: A Development Perspective 414
Barbara R. Stucki

Epilogue 419

Conference Program 421

List of Conference Participants 439

List of Books Exhibited 445
This collection of papers is an outcome of a conference, entitled Shelter, Women, and Development: First and Third World Perspectives, held at the University of Michigan’s College of Architecture and Urban Planning, May 5–7, 1992. The organizers (faculty colleagues, graduate students, and I) wanted to underscore the importance of shelter for women’s development in a cross-national, multicultural context. We believed that comparisons and contrasts between First and Third World women’s realities and their needs for housing, or shelter, as it is referred to in the Third World, might provide new insights into an issue that had received too little attention from policy makers around the world.

Our original plan for this conference was quite modest: to bring together a handful of established researchers who would present their current thoughts on the relationship between housing and women’s development. In discussions with students in the architecture and planning programs at the University of Michigan, the idea of putting out a call for papers and soliciting new and ongoing work on this topic began to appear more exciting. It was clear that the literature on the specific topic of shelter and women’s development was not extensive and work encompassing First and Third World situations was virtually nonexistent. We issued a call for papers to ascertain the level of interest in the subject. The call was designed to get the attention not just of academics but also of professional practitioners in architecture and urban planning, activists, and those involved in delivery of services to unsheltered women. In addition to papers, visual and project-related contributions were solicited to highlight the shelter-related products of practitioners and artists. This emphasis on the visual and tangible seemed appropriate for a conference on housing to be hosted by a professional school of architecture and planning and convened in a building shared with a school of art.

The seventy or so abstracts and the numerous expressions of interest in the exhibit that we received confirmed that many people are working in various aspects of this topic. They also illustrated (as reflected by the contributions to this volume) the variety and diversity of approaches being taken. In all, over fifty-five presentations were made at the conference. The exhibit included display boards on built projects and organizations, photography, paintings, sculptures, videos, and poetry. These formal presentations and the numerous informal discussions that took place, some into the early hours of the morning, particularly in the campus housing where many participants were lodged, indicated that the conference was an unequivocal success in establishing...
a dialogue between those working on this topic in the First and Third Worlds. Observing the more than two hundred people involved with the event was gratifying to the organizers. Immediately following the conference several participants reported that they had experienced the gathering as “empowering.” They used words such as “inspiring,” “exciting,” and “important” to describe their involvement. Recent graduates of our program have written to me to say that their work on the conference was the most formative and challenging experience in their years here. From a pedagogic and consciousness-raising perspective, it seems clear that this conference was a significant undertaking. We hope that others like it will follow.

The quantity of presentations and the range and diversity of the case evidence made visible a critical mass of individuals working on this topic. The discussions brought to focus the idea that a gendered approach to the provision of shelter can help to bring about development for women. Besides enhancing our understanding of the substantive and conceptual terrain, they revealed strategies effective in furthering women’s development through the provision of appropriate shelter. These proceedings reflect one of the major virtues of this particular conference, the many different perspectives. To acknowledge, indeed to celebrate, the diversity of views expressed at this gathering, this volume presents as many of the contributions as possible, reflecting our continuing commitment to maintain the inclusive nature of the conference. Contrasting and diverse ways of looking and thinking about the topic were given a forum for expression. As a result, the papers included here vary greatly in length, style, and intent. The authors range from entry-level graduate students to distinguished policy makers, professionals, and academics with many years of experience in related work. The consequence is some unevenness in substantive content and the academic apparatus provided in the various papers. Given the scarce resources (financial, time, and person power) available to bring this work to the point of publication, I had little recourse but to publish the papers more or less as the authors had submitted them. Despite the lack of total consistency in format or completeness of the citations, my hope is that this is a stimulating and useful contribution to this subject.

Editing has also been kept to a minimum to maintain the different voices of contributors. Two contributions, both from Africa, have been included, even though the authors were not at the conference. One (Scarnecchia) was unable to attend and the other (Oruwari) was denied a visa to enter the U.S.A. Some significant verbal presentations, for which written papers were not submitted, were summarized from video recordings by the theme moderators. They have been presented as such under the theme moderators’ authorship (Khan by Aliyar, Gillette and Snyder by Bergholz). All the sessions were videotaped to document the event, but there are no plans at present to edit these recordings.

In the interest of sharing information and facilitating networking, the conference program, a list of registered conference participants, and a list of books submitted by publishers and displayed in a book stall in the exhibit have been included in Appendices A, B, and C, respectively. The organizers of this conference believe that the discussion deserves to be continued. We therefore invite an other institution to take up this initiative and host a follow-up conference. The information and experience we obtained from our efforts in hosting this conference at the University of Michigan are available to help facilitate such an effort.

Hemalata C. Dandekar
Conference Chair
Ann Arbor, Michigan, May 1993

Note

1 The resulting exhibit took on a life of its own under the able guidance of two members of the architecture faculty, Professors Melissa Harris and Elizabeth Williams. By featuring projects and buildings, the exhibit complemented the conference and provided a unique view of the action and practice component of effort in this arena. The exhibit has been documented and received recognition elsewhere, including prestigious awards from Interiors (January, 1993) and the Association of the Collegiate Schools of Architecture. A list of contributors and the titles of their exhibits can be found in the conference program in Appendix A. A monograph documenting the exhibit and making the work accessible to policy makers, practitioners, academics, and designers is currently in progress.
Acknowledgements

The University of Michigan co-sponsored this conference with two bodies of the United Nations: the United Nations Center for Human Settlements [UNCHS (Habitat)], and the United Nations Fund for Women and Development (UNIFEM). Further, UNCHS (Habitat) extended financial support toward the publication of this book. At the University of Michigan, an initial grant from the University Council on International Academic Affairs was followed by commitments from Dean Robert Beckley of the College of Architecture and Urban Planning, which hosted the conference and provided facilities and staff support; the Horace H. Rackham School of Graduate Studies; the Office of the Vice President for Research; the Women's Studies Program; and the Office of the Vice Provost for Minority Affairs.

Ms. Sujata Shetty, a doctoral student in Urban and Regional Planning, was my right hand from the beginning, fundraising, proposal-writing, stage to the closing hours of the conference. Her efforts at making the event work, and her ability to handle stress cheerfully and constructively, were invaluable. The organization of the conference and accompanying exhibit were a collaborative effort that entailed the active involvement of many students and faculty. Too numerous to list here, some are identified under the heading “conference and exhibit organization” in the conference program in Appendix A. The substantive underpinnings of this conference would not have been as robust without these graduate students and faculty who shaped the thematic boundaries and organized the papers that were submitted. This made for cohesion within each theme. One of the blessings of serving as a faculty member for the last fourteen years at the College of Architecture and Urban Planning at the University of Michigan has been the privilege of working with talented and dedicated graduate students who have been drawn here from all over the world. On a research trip to Bombay last November, six months after the conference, I met some of the women who had participated. In various ways they asked, “Where do you get those students? We don't see them here even if they are Indian!” It is these students, their energy and enthusiasm, that made this conference a success. Involvement in this effort is yielding them significant professional and personal benefits, a great source of satisfaction to me.

The monumental tasks of editing, synthesizing, coordinating, standardizing for consistency, retyping, and cajoling, culminating in the publication of this volume, have also been shared. Two friends, Dr. Rudolf B. Schmerl, Director of Research Relations, the University
of Hawaii, and Ms. Janet Lineer, Associate Editor in the College of Engineering at the University of Michigan, promised and provided unconditional help in bringing this manuscript to press. I am very grateful to Dr. Schmerl for his untiring devotion to detailed and careful editorial help and amusing, sometimes caustic, but appropriate commentary on each manuscript. Janet Lineer has worked long and hard at the tedious task of typing or retyping, formatting, standardizing, and making this volume as consistent as possible. Dixie Farquharson, academic secretary in the College, helped in this task at critical junctures. William C. Manspeaker, computer consultant in the College, cheerfully and tirelessly transformed the manuscripts received on computer discs from all over the world, of all sizes and formats, using unknown or unspecified software, so that they were accessible on our machines.

Lynne Buchman, a graduate in Graphic Design from the School of Art at the University of Michigan, designed the cover and layout of this book, bringing style and elegance to the final product. Elizabeth Davenport of George Wahr Publishing Co. believed in this work, understood it, and gave it final shape and coherence. The help of these individuals has made these proceedings possible. My daughter Apurva, who is almost three years old now, has lived gracefully for most of her young life with a mother who has at times been distracted by this "Women and Shelter" undertaking. I am grateful to her for her tolerance. I hope that our collective efforts in this conference and with these proceedings will help to facilitate women's access to shelter, and thus to make life for women of Apurva's generation easier and better.

Hemalata C. Dandekar
Ann Arbor, Michigan, May 1993